inter-text

[an undergraduate journal for social sciences & humanities]

Volume 3, Spring 2020

Cover Design by Kristin Rawlings ’19
Typesetting by Belinda Beaver ’22
Sarah Coffman ’21
Emily Murrah ’21

Inter-Text: An Undergraduate Journal for Social Sciences & Humanities, Volume 3
Copyright © 2020, Lake Forest College

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, or stored in a retrieval system, without prior written consent from the publisher.

inter-text@lakeforest.edu

Lake Forest College
555 N. Sheridan Road
Lake Forest, IL 60045

ISBN: 978-1-941423-07-3

Printed by Gasch Printing.

Contents

i-iii **Letter from the Editors**

Student Essays

Music as a Coping Mechanism

1 **1963 or Today, Masters of Destruction Permeate Our Lives:**
A Critique of Bob Dylan's "Masters of War"
[Belinda Beaver]

14 **Eat, Drink, and Play Music**
[Grace Drake]

Responses to Systemic Injustice

23 **The Destruction of Slavery in the Civil War**
[Kent Beckman]

30 **Expanding Our Understandings of Knowledge(s):**
Plurality Beyond Coloniality
[Sofia Lyazkowska]

41 **"Carve a Tunnel of Hope":**
Exploring Dr. Martin Luther King Jr.'s Nonviolent Philosophy
[Isaac Winter]

Female Empowerment and Sexuality

47 **You Do You, Boo:**
The Unsexy Truth about Sexual and Reproductive Justice
[Krista Grund-Wickramasekera]

65 **Hussite Women:**
Fighting More Than the Crusaders
[Anna Hevrdejs]

71 **Hatshepsut:**
The Powerful Female Pharaoh
[Alicia Maynard]

Critiques of Popular Culture

81 **Making and Breaking a Heroine:**
Cultural Disparity in *Mulan*
[Tam Nguyen]

91 ***Machinal* and *Society of the Spectacle*:**
Treadwell's Reply to Society's Spectacularizing of Human Tragedy
[Nina Dominique Codell]

101 **"Oh, Stuff and Fluff!":**
Amplifying the Cute Aesthetic of Winnie the Pooh
[Emily Dietrich]

Features

109 **"Say It Loud": The Song That Backed the Civil Rights Movement**
Song Review
[Sarah Coffman]

113 **A Musical Analysis of *Milk***
Movie Review
[Alexis Heredia]

116 **What I Know Now As a Senior in College**
A Reflection
[Leah Farfan]

118 **Ancient Governmental Concepts of China:**
Confucianism Versus Legalism
[Aaron O'Neill]

121 **Portrait of a Place:**
The Apostle Islands
[Kayla Goelz]

Contributors

127 **The Authors**

130 **The Editors**

133 **Acknowledgements**

Dear Reader,

Thank you for picking up a copy of *Inter-Text: An Undergraduate Journal for Social Sciences and Humanities* Volume 3. For the third consecutive year, *Inter-Text* has succeeded in its important mission of collecting, editing, and publishing impressive and innovative student work to enable diverse scholarly dialogue among Lake Forest College's humanities and social science students. We hope that the Journal will contribute to the College's academic culture for several years to come; without you, the interested reader, our vision would be incomplete.

The past year has been a turbulent one, both on and off campus. As a community, we have endured opposition to the fundamental value of diversity, and we have witnessed students responding to these challenges through protest and activism. We now face a global pandemic and the consequences of social isolation. Thus, it is more important than ever that Lake Forest College students have an outlet for their voices and valuable perspectives. We have worked harder than ever to produce a print journal during these difficult and somewhat dark times, and we hope that our Journal provides a beacon of light.

We are thrilled to share that our third volume received the highest number of submissions to date. Out of fifty-nine articles, we selected the best eleven through our rigorous peer review process. This was no easy task to complete, but it was altogether necessary, as our goal has remained to bring forth a collection of strong literature for the campus community.We faced a large undertaking in narrowing down the submissions because of the sheer number, astounding quality, and variety of topics of the papers submitted. Each submission went through a meticulous blind peer review process in which it was evaluated by at least three editors. While reviewing, we looked for strength in four aspects that are central to any paper, regardless of the subject: clarity of argument, use of evidence, structure, and language and grammar. This process resulted in a collaborative and in-depth discussion of every submission at a decision meeting before we chose the final articles. After initial acceptance, we worked alongside the authors in the editorial process. This consisted of three stages of editing: substantive editing, copyediting, and proofreading. In each of these stages, every accepted paper was reviewed by at least two editors. The pages that follow are the final product of this comprehensive process.

It is through this process, tedious as it may be, that we are able to present you with works of outstanding scholarship that cover a wide range of topics in the social sciences and humanities. We hope the dialogue between the articles in these pages fosters evolving thought, vision, and conversation. With that being said, we highly encourage everyone to submit their own work next year so we can continue the mission of the

Journal. It is to the exceptional work of our authors that we can attribute this year's success.

This year, we divided the eleven articles in our Journal into four distinct topical categories: Music As a Coping Mechanism, Responses to Systemic Injustice, Female Empowerment and Sexuality, and Critiques of Popular Culture. Although we divided the articles by topics, a unifying theme across the papers still emerged: social responses to institutional power. As you read through these articles, we invite you to contemplate the ways each of these authors engages with this topic from a unique perspective.

The Journal begins with a piece titled "1963 or Today, Masters of Destruction Permeate Our Lives: A Critique of Bob Dylan's 'Masters of War,'" in which Belinda Beaver analyzes how Bob Dylan's popular song "Masters of War" illuminates the harsh realities of war and its destructive nature both on and off the battlefield when Dylan composed the song and today. In line with a multi-disciplinary examination of music, Grace Drake explores the role of music during the Black Death in fourteenth-century Europe. She argues that music was a method of distraction from the plague's destruction in her article "Eat, Drink, and Play Music."

Moving away from musical analysis, the next section of the Journal explores activism and responses to injustice brought upon by government. Kent Beckman describes several key events that led to the end of slavery through his essay, "The Destruction of Slavery in the American Civil War." In offering insight to the secession of the Confederacy, Kent discusses the importance of slaves as political figures during the Civil War, which ultimately influenced Abraham Lincoln to pass his emancipatory policies. Remaining in the American context, Isaac Winter examines Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr.'s nonviolent philosophy during the Civil Rights movement, specifically highlighting the importance of patience, compassion, and community during the Montgomery Bus Boycott. Evaluating systemic hierarchy in African education, Sofia Lyazkowska calls for a radical change in the way knowledge is constructed in African countries today after she evaluates how colonialism contributed to the uneven dissemination of African versus European knowledge in schools.

Our next three authors view injustice specifically through the lens of gender studies and discuss empowerment in response to social inhibitors and gendered norms. Krista Grund-Wickramasekera looks at the sexual and reproductive justice movement through portraying the treatment of sex work, fertility, abortion, and transgender rights by the United States government. Anna Hevrdejs further explores women's roles in her paper "Hussite Women: Fighting More Than the Crusaders." She examines how the Hussite Revolution gave women the chance to step out of their traditional boundaries and experience a degree of equality with

men and a larger involvement with social and religious movements. Taking female empowerment even further back in time, Alicia Maynard explores how Hatsheput, the female pharaoh of the Eighteenth Dynasty, legitimized her role by modifying the traditional practices of male pharaohs and incorporating her own traditions, such as substantiating her role through art and depictions of herself as ruler.

The final section of our Journal contains critical assessment of various forms of popular culture. Tam Nguyen compares the Disney film Mulan with the original Ballad of Mulan in her essay "Making and Breaking a Heroine: Cultural Disparity in *Mulan*," arguing the importance of cross-dressing in Chinese culture and Disney's distortion of Chinese history in the popular film. Similar to Nguyen's analysis of emphasized aspects of culture, Nina Codell considers Sophie Treadwell's play Machinal alongside Situationist International theory to emphasize the possible negative consequences of the society of the spectacle. In the final piece, Emily Dietrich compares Disney's 1977 film *The Many Adventures of Winnie the Pooh* and A. A. Milne's *Winnie the Pooh* series and discusses Disney's amplification of Pooh's cuteness, while relating this exaggeration to the consumerist culture of Disney. After the works of our authors, you will have the chance to read five feature articles contributed by our editors, in which they review songs, musical scores, the college experience, government theory, and environmental wonders.

Before you dive into the pages ahead, we want to thank you one more time for participating in our vision. A journal is nothing without an audience to evaluate and savor the scholarship of our authors. So, please ponder, question, engage, and reflect. We hope you enjoy *Inter-Text* Volume 3.

Sincerely,

The Editors

[student essays]

[music as a coping mechanism]

1963 or Today, Masters of Destruction Permeate Our Lives:

A Critique of Bob Dylan's "Masters of War"

[Belinda Beaver]

War. A word that everyone is familiar with, unfortunately from a rather young age. Wars have been around as long as there have been people to fight them. Beyond the devasting destruction and loss of life, effects of war permeate nearly every aspect of life, even music. In fact, music and other forms of art are often representative of the emotions and cultural time in which they are produced. For me, music has been able to capture what I am feeling in a way that I never could. This is why I became interested in Bob Dylan's song "Masters of War." I first heard Ed Sheeran's cover of the song in a high school English class during our poetry unit. Already enamored by his voice, the message of the song itself struck something inside me. Here was a song that talked about war in a way that not much else did, as something that was real, destructive, and beyond the battlefield. I found the song to be relevant when I heard it in 2016—when it was already fifty-three years old. Even today the message of the song holds value. Through the power of music, Bob Dylan transforms from a singer-songwriter to a rhetorician in his song "Masters of War." Though this song was originally produced in 1963, the narrative style, the poetic nature of the lyrics, and the anonymity of the content illuminate the true nature of any war, thus keeping the message relevant well beyond the song's release and even into the present day. After describing the song and presenting the necessary historical information, I will introduce what others have to say about the genre, the singer, and the song. Then I will outline my methodology and use those methods to evaluate the song and highlight the continual relevance of its message.

"Masters of War" by Bob Dylan ultimately serves as a criticism of American officials during a time of war. The song is not merely antiwar; it is aimed at the people with power behind the war. Dylan makes clear his frustrations with leaders in his direct address approach and use of name calling, evident right from the start of the song: "Come you masters of war

/ You that build the big guns / You that build all the bombs."[1] While he is directing his anger at those he deems "masters of war," their specific identity, as well as that of the overall persona of the song, remains anonymous. A clear distinction is drawn, though, between the powerbrokers of war and civilians and soldiers, as seen in the lines "You play with my world / Like it's your little toy."[2] The authoritative figures are seen as controlling the soldier, who has no sense of agency over his life due to the war; the soldier becomes a victim to the master. As a result of this, an accusatory and bitter tone underlies the song. This is accompanied by the use of grim imagery, such as "You hide in your mansions / While the young people's blood / Flows out of their bodies / And is buried in the mud."[3] Lines such as these shed light on the harsh realities of war as a result of those who allow and even encourage it. Dylan contrasts the idle actions of those in power with the macabre scene of life on the battlefield, driving home his anti-establishment mentality. These experiences that Dylan includes are generalized, like the persona, yet specific enough to make a clear expression of anger and frustration at the truth of the devastation of war. In four minutes and thirty-three seconds, Bob Dylan crafts a message that captures many of the feelings circulating in the song's time of creation.

1963, when "Masters of War" was written and produced, was a time of great political turmoil and unrest. The immediate reality of 1963 was the United States' involvement in two wars: The Cold War and the Vietnam War. These wars were similar in their fight against the spread of communism but differed in their approach. Following World War II, tensions were high between the USSR and the United States with fear of Soviet expansion. In order to combat this, the government utilized the containment strategy—the foreign policy implemented to prevent the spread of communism through the use of outside force. However, this set precedents for the buildup to the arms race. In 1950, President Truman recommended increased military force to prevent communist expansion, while other American officials "encouraged the development of atomic weapons."[4] This resulted in the production of increasingly powerful nuclear weapons, leading to high stakes with the possibility of mass destruction. Fear among citizens ran high. Adding to this was the growing conflict across the ocean. While the Cold War lacked physical combat, the Vietnam War was a long and brutal fight. The active involvement of the United States began in 1954 due to conflicts between the communist North Vietnam and

1 Bob Dylan, "Masters of War," *The Freewheelin' Bob Dylan*, Sony Music Entertainment Inc., 1963, track 3.

2 Ibid.

3 Ibid.

4 "Cold War History," History.com, last modified October 27, 2009. www.history.com/topics/cold-war/cold-war-history.

anticommunist South Vietnam.[5] From the beginning, President Eisenhower backed South Vietnam with American military support. In 1961, President Kennedy increased military aid and presence in South Vietnam for fear of the domino theory—if one country fell to communism, others would follow.[6] The continual fighting in Vietnam, only intensified by the ongoing Cold War and threat of nuclear war, caused a plummeting of morale in both soldiers and civilians of the United States. Additionally, the Vietnam War sparked large-scale antiwar movements as citizens and soldiers alike lacked trust in the government's continual insistence that the war was just, and that the US was winning.[7] The United States was being pulled in multiple directions in 1963, fighting across the sea while simultaneously facing threats at home. Needless to say, the year was a tumultuous time, with high tensions and high frustrations. Due to such commotion, it is no accident folk music saw a revival in the United States in the 1960s. Before delving into "Masters of War" itself, I will introduce what others have to say about folk music, Bob Dylan, and various reviews of the song.

The cultural climate of the 1960s helped to bring about a second wave of folk music, now with heightened political undertones and a sense of urgency. The first reemergence of traditional folk music was twenty years prior in the 1930s. In both of these instances, scholars have not failed to realize that folk music arose around times of great change and political tensions. Folk music often "involved a form of politicization, forging left-wing ideologies onto populist roots."[8] The traditional music was reinvented with political force, creating an alternative to mainstream cultural expression and forming cultural politics. Woody Guthrie, a folk legend and important figure in both revivals, described the inherently political content of folk music as being "about what's wrong and how to fix it."[9] For many singers, folk music served as an outlet to voice the real issues of society and bring them to the attention of the government and important leaders. Folk was able to do this because it "constitute[ed] a form of cultural expression alternative to that found in published mass media," as stated by husband and wife Richard and JoAnne Reuss in their novel on folk music and left-wing politics.[10] Their comprehensive study focuses on the use of folk music as propaganda during the Communist movement. While this is a different

5 "Vietnam War," History.com, last modified October 29, 2009, www.history.com/topics/vietnam-war/vietnam-war-history.

6 Ibid.

7 Ibid.

8 Ron Eyerman and Scott Barretta, "From the 30s to the 60s: The Folk Music Revival in the United States," *Theory and Society* 25, no. 4 (1996): 501, www.jstor.org/stable/657909.

9 Ibid., 502.

10 Richard A. Reuss and JoAnne C. Reuss, *American Folk Music and Left-Wing Politics*, *1927-1957* (Lanham: Scarecrow Press, 2000), 5.

era and cultural climate than that of Dylan's "Masters of War" the notions behind the political power of folk music still ring true.

In the 1960s, Bob Dylan was introduced to the folk scene by none other than Woody Guthrie, who sparked his extensive career as a musician. In fact, Eyerman and Barretta claim that Dylan viewed himself as "an incarnation of Woody Guthrie" when he arrived in New York in 1961 and began singing traditional folk music and writing his own songs based on current events.[11] Dylan's first album was mostly traditional folk covers, but his second album was all original songs. Many scholars attribute Dylan's success to this second album, *The Freewheelin' Bob Dylan*, which helped to define him as a protest singer. "Masters of War" was one such song on this album. Greil Marcus notes that his early protest songs were the ones "that brought Bob Dylan into the common imagination of the nation, and those were the songs that fixed him there."[12] Bob Dylan's roots in folk music helped him to use his music as an outlet to speak about real issues and make calls for action; this genre allowed him to adopt an almost story-telling structure in his lyrics that address concerns relevant to the time in which he was writing. Clinton Heylin notes that Dylan favored "finger-pointin' songs" between 1962–1963 which he used as "genuine expressions of frustration and anger at the neophobes who sought to subvert the inextricable process of change."[13] Much of Dylan's music is a response to the events happening in the world around him. He says of his song-writing process: "I don't think when I write. I just react and put it down on paper. I'm serious about everything I write...What comes out in my music is a call to action."[14] This approach results in songs about relevant issues that stand the test of time. "Masters of War" is one these songs, and although written as a response to a current event, it still remains relevant well beyond that specific event.

From its release in 1963 and even into the present day, "Masters of War" has received critical attention. Beginning in 1963, "Masters of War" was a well-known protest song. On the surface, the song is about the destructive consequences of war as a result of the actions of arms merchants. Dylan himself has referred to it as a "pacifistic song against war" and as picking up on the spirit in the air as President Dwight D. Eisenhower was leaving office in 1961.[15] While exiting the presidency, Eisenhower

11 Eyerman and Barretta, "From the 30s to the 60s," 528.

12 Greil Marcus, "Stories of a Bad Song," *The Threepenny Review,* no. 104 (2006): 6, www.jstor.org/stable/4385480.

13 Clinton Heylin, *Bob Dylan: Behind the Shades Revisited*, 1st U.S. ed. (New York: William Morrow, 2001), 113.

14 Ibid., 127.

15 Edna Gundersen, "Dylan is Positively on Top of His Game," *USA Today*, September 10, 2001, http://usatoday30.usatoday.com/life/music/2001-09-10-bob-dylan.htm#more.

warned the country of the dangers of a military-industrial complex. In the next couple of years, as Eisenhower had warned, the arms industry was making a fortune and "spreading money all over Washington, D.C."[16] as the world came closer to nuclear war. Dylan captured the anger and frustration of the nation in the 1960s in "Masters of War."[17] The popularity of the song, though, continued through the decades.

The initial positive response to Dylan's song was not limited to its time of release, evidenced by the song's popularity and multitude of performances throughout Dylan's career. In 2005, Mojo magazine ranked it as "number one on a chart of 'The 100 Greatest Protest Songs.'"[18] This song, like many of Dylan's, was able to move through time "[taking] on elements of those times as they moved through them."[19] The song itself had such a powerful message that could be applied to a multitude of scenarios, as evidenced by the sheer number of times it was performed and the context of each performance. Between 1963 and 2016, "Masters of War" was performed 884 times, making it Dylan's fourteenth most played song out of over 500 songs.[20] Whether it was performed with "a wistful, almost elegiac manner" the night Barack Obama was elected in 2008 or with fury the night John Kerry was defeated in 2004, the song has held its shape.[21] As Marcus puts it, the song will live on because "the world has not run out of wars."[22] Dylan continued to perform "Masters of War" because the overarching message could ring true for any war. One such example of this is his performance of it at the 1991 Grammy Awards, which happened to be in the midst of the Iraqi-American war. When asked why he chose that particular song, Dylan responded simply—there was a war going on.[23] The underlying message of the song adapted well to various scenarios, keeping it in the public's attention.

Another indication of the continued relevance of this song is the various covers that other artists have created. One example of this is Ed Sheeran's cover in 2013—the one that initially introduced me to the song. ONE Campaign, an organization combatting poverty and disease,

16 Andy Greene, "Readers' Poll: The Top 10 Best Protest Songs of All Time," *Rolling Stone*, December 3, 2014, https://www.rollingstone.com/music/music-lists/readers-poll-the-10-best-protest-songs-of-all-time-141706/bob-dylan-masters-of-war-172547/.

17 Ibid.

18 Marcus, "Stories of a Bad Song," 6.

19 Greil Marcus, "Bob Dylan, Master of Change," *The New York Times*, October 13, 2016, www.nytimes.com/2016/10/14/opinion/bob-dylan-master-of-change.html.

20 "Songs: The Official Bob Dylan Site," The Official Bob Dylan Site, http://www.bobdylan.com/songs/.

21 Marcus, "Bob Dylan, Master of Change."

22 Ibid.

23 Marcus, "Stories of a Bad Song," 6.

gathered many singers to "record classic protest songs as a call to action against extreme poverty around the world."[24] Music was a great outlet for this because, as Sheeran puts it, music is a "powerful tool in galvanizing people around an issue."[25] In this context, "Masters of War" is not so much about a physical war, but rather a larger social issue that needs to be addressed. Once again, protest music is an outlet to call for necessary changes and "Masters of War" is at the heart of it. Dylan's powerful words and narrative of the song echo throughout history, keeping the message relevant in nearly any context.

Another aspect commonly analyzed in regard to Bob Dylan is the poetic nature of his lyrics. A collection of essays edited by Charlotte Pence focuses on how songs can be treated as literature by giving them "a level of artistic and critical appreciation" that is typically reserved for other art forms.[26] Many people recognize that Dylan's lyrics are poetic, especially since he was awarded a Nobel Prize in Literature. Gordon Ball's essay argues that Dylan, though a songwriter, deserved this prize usually reserved for literature because of his lyrics' "artful idealism [that] has contributed to major social change, altering and enriching the lives of millions culturally, politically, and aesthetically."[27] At their core, Dylan's lyrics oftentimes advance calls to action and speak out against current events yet maintain a timelessness about them. The themes that he writes about and how he constructs his songs lead many to call him a true poet. Another essay focuses on Dylan's longer songs that often lack traditional qualities of a song and instead have "lyric constructions that accomplish a narrative impression, or an emotional one."[28] These songs are still memorable, despite not containing ordinary musical elements. Again, songs like this are compared to poems that utilize many of the same techniques. It is hardly a question for anyone as to whether Dylan's lyrics are powerful, whether they believe he is a poet or not.

Bringing these conversations together, I will focus on how certain substantive elements of "Masters of War" keep the message of the song relevant. To do this, I am drawing on multiple theoretical approaches. First, Fisher's narrative paradigm and Burke's dramatism will be utilized

24 Miriam Coleman, "Ed Sheeran Covers 'Masters of War' for Agit8," *Rolling Stone*, June 15, 2013, www.rollingstone.com/music/music-news/ed-sheeran-covers-masters-of-war-for-agit8-243227/.

25 Ibid.

26 Charlotte Pence, introduction to *Poetics of American Song Lyrics*, ed. Chalotte Pence (Jackson: University Press of Mississippi, 2012), 12.

27 Gordon Ball, "A Nobel for Dylan?" in *Poetics of American Song Lyrics*, ed. Charlotte Pence (Jackson: University Press of Mississippi, 2012), 183.

28 Claudia Emerson, "Lyric Impression, Musical Memory, Emily, and the Jack of Hearts," in *Poetics of American Song Lyrics*, ed. Charlotte Pence (Jackson: University Press of Mississippi, 2012), 189.

in looking at the structure of the lyrics and their emphasis on scene and agent. The narrative paradigm "insists that human communication should be viewed as historical as well as situational," while also challenging the belief that communication must be argumentative.[29] Thus, rational, moral stories are also valid forms of human communication.[30] Dramatism is Burke's method of understanding human relationships and motivations, based on five key terms—act (what was done), scene (the situation in which the act occurred), agent (the person or kind of person who performed the act), agency (the means or purpose used to perform the act), and purpose (the underlying reason for the act).[31] I will then highlight Dylan's deliberate use of language with Lakoff and Johnson's understanding of metaphors as "understanding and experiencing one kind of thing in terms of another" and Burke's master trope of metonymy, or the substitution of a related attribute for the intended concept or term.[32] Finally, I will examine Black's theory of persona regarding the anonymity of the content and relatable nature of the materials. Following this analysis, I will evaluate the overall message of the song with aspects from both the truth and artistic criterions, from Campbell's and Burkholder's *Critiques of Contemporary Rhetoric*. By the end, I will have made my claim that Bob Dylan is worthy of the title of rhetor and that his song "Masters of War" has a powerful message that resonates throughout time.

While "Masters of War" is a song, it lacks the traditional structural qualities of a song and more closely aligns with that of a narrative. The form is similar to Campbell's and Burkholder's narrative-dramatic structure, or one that reflects a certain view of reality and emphasizes that shared experiences are necessary to understand a situation.[33] Additionally, Walter Fisher argues the importance of narration in communication on the premise that "humans are essentially storytellers."[34] His emphasis on the persuasive power of narrative stems from the fact that "symbols are created and communicated ultimately as stories meant to give order to human experience and to induce others to dwell in them to establish ways of living in common."[35] This story-telling style of rhetoric is also similar to the progression of thought in traditional folk songs. "Masters of War" aligns with this as it presents war as a harsh reality that is a shared experience

29 Walter R. Fisher, "Narration as a Human Communication Paradigm: The Case of Public Moral Argument," *Communication Monographs* 51 (1984): 2.

30 Ibid.

31 Kenneth Burke, *A Grammar of Motives* (1945; repr., Berkeley: University of California Press, 1969), xv.

32 George Lakoff and Mark Johnson, *Metaphors We Live By* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1980): 5.

33 Karlyn Kohrs Campbell and Thomas R. Burkholder, *Critiques of Contemporary Rhetoric*, 2nd ed. (Belmont: Wadsworth Publishing, 1996), 24.

34 Fisher, "Narration as a Human Communication Paradigm," 7.

35 Ibid., 6.

for all. By presenting the message of the song as a narrative, it also allows for identification with the message in any context beyond the immediate release of the song.

Bob Dylan uses “Masters of War” as a way to present social reality that rises above any context. The song begins by calling out the figures of authority, then moves to a series of verses that provide examples of their deceit and corruption. It then transitions back to a direct address and ends in rage as a result of the actions of the powerbrokers of war. Beginning with a direct address to the immediate audience, Bob Dylan creates both division and identification from the start. The opening lines, “Come you masters of war / You that build the big guns,” separates these masters from everyone else, opening the opportunity for a shared reality.[36] The following examples further present this reality of shared life experiences. With an emphasis on the harsh and destructive nature of war, Dylan voices human experience in a way that nearly anyone can relate to, and at any time. Underlying many of the examples, though, is an accusation, such as “You put a gun in my hand / And you hide from my eyes” and “You fasten all the triggers / For the others to fire.”[37] These list-like examples read more like someone telling their own experiences in war rather than a traditional song with a repeated chorus.

The very nature of the song itself as being inherently political and social also correlates with Fisher’s claim that any form of ethic involves narrative.[38] Furthermore, the examples have both narrative probability and narrative fidelity, meaning they are coherent and probable. Dylan demonstrates the effects of war as permeating all aspects of life, both on the battlefield with “While the young people’s blood / Flows out of their bodies / And is buried in the mud” and at home with “Fear to bring children / Into the world.”[39] Dylan chose to tell these stories in order to illuminate war in its true light. As he lays out these descriptive accounts, the rationality of his anger is revealed; it is not an undirected rage, rather it is very clearly aimed at the people who allow such atrocious acts to occur. Dylan ends the song with his harshest confrontation yet: “And I hope that you die / And your death will come soon.”[40] This anger brings the argument full circle, as the “masters” have caused the deaths of so many people that they too deserve to die. Dylan’s dramatic conclusion to his story leaves the listener with a sense of finality, as expected in narratives. Throughout the song, the narrative emphasizes the distinction between officials and soldiers.

In looking at “Masters of War” with Burke’s pentad of terms in

36 Dylan, “Masters of War.”
37 Ibid.
38 Fisher, “Narration as a Human Communication Paradigm,” 3.
39 Dylan, “Masters of War.”
40 Ibid.

dramatism, I notice an emphasis on the scene and agent; however, these each have dual meanings that are pitted against each other, furthering the distinction between leaders and soldiers. The theory of dramatism from Kenneth Burke picks five key terms—scene, act, agent, agency, and purpose—and examines their relationships to investigate human motivations; this theory is often applied to various forms of rhetoric and literature to highlight the purpose of the text.[41] Dylan's song places a strong emphasis on scene, where the act was done, and agent, who did the act. It is interesting to note the dual nature of each of these ideas in the song. Dylan creates the scene and role of the officials from the beginning with "You that hide behind walls / You that hide behind desks."[42] They are safely inside, out of harm's way, yet there is an element of cowardice with the term "hide." In fact, the "masters" are seen as hiding again, this time in their "mansions" later in the song.[43] These are the people who are in charge of orchestrating the war, yet they hand off the dirty work to those beneath them, as is common practice in times of war throughout history and even today. This practice is clear in the scene of the soldiers being in the thick of battle, where their blood is "buried in the mud."[44] Furthermore, the roles and actions of each kind of agent, the officials or the soldiers, are contrasted. Dylan notes that the officials hand off their work when he says, "You put a gun in my hand / And you hide from my eyes."[45] As noted in the opening lines, these "masters" created the weapons, but they literally give them to someone else to protect themselves from possible dangers. This passive and safe position is contrasted with that of the soldiers who are out in the field where "the fast bullets fly" and the "death count gets higher."[46] In the heart of the battle, soldiers are constantly at risk, the stark opposite of the cowards who caused it in the first place. Both of these scenes and agents can be found any time there is a war. In placing these scene and agent correlations against each other, Dylan is emphasizing the gruesome reality of war, which aligns well with his purpose: to condemn the powerbrokers of war in their destructive tendencies that only cause devastation.

Throughout "Masters of War," Dylan is very deliberate in his choice of language and language strategies to aid in the song's persuasive power. Two strategies that are predominantly used are metaphors and metonymy. Lakoff and Johnson point out that "our ordinary conceptual system, in terms of which we both think and act, is fundamentally metaphorical in nature."[47] Metaphors not only serve to represent one thing in terms of another; they also

41 Burke, *A Grammar of Motives*, xv.
42 Dylan, "Masters of War."
43 Ibid.
44 Ibid.
45 Ibid.
46 Ibid.
47 Lakoff and Johnson, "Metaphors We Live By," 2.

structure our language, thoughts, and behavior. Oftentimes, we encounter metaphors in our day to day lives without even realizing it because we take metaphors for granted. “Masters of War” utilizes ontological metaphors, metaphors which give concrete substance to ideas and emotions, serving to “deal rationally with our experiences.”[48] Symbolic language such as this is effective in its ability to ground intangible concepts and abstractions. Dylan does this when he writes “You’ve thrown the worst fear / That can ever be hurled.”[49] Fear is such an abstract concept, making it extremely difficult to conceptualize. By giving fear a material form or substance as something that is able to be thrown, the notion is brought down to earth and made easier to understand. The connection that Dylan gives it to the “masters of war” as something they are throwing again emphasizes their tendency to hand over the true dangers and consequences of war to others. His purpose in condemning them is further illustrated in another ontological metaphor. The lines, “You play with my world / Like it’s your little toy” emphasizes just how widespread the effects of war can be felt.[50] The connotation of a “master” playing with a toy is not lost in highlighting the childish nature of officials who often rush to engage in wars in an attempt to solve the world’s problems. Using the “world” of the soldier as the object in play Dylan illuminates that every aspect of the soldier’s life is affected by the war in some way. Both of these examples of ontological metaphors are general enough to be relatable to any audience and in any context beyond that of 1963 with the Cold War and the Vietnam War. Dylan uses specific elements such as these to emphasize the true nature of war and those orchestrating it from their offices; this holds true for any war.

Another poetic strategy Dylan uses is metonymy, or reduction, to emphasize the humanity of the officials while also reducing their power. Metonymy is one of Burke’s four master tropes, which are figurative uses of words and phrases. Language, especially metonymy, works by “borrowing words from the realm of the corporeal, visible, tangible, and applying them by analogy to the realm of the incorporeal, invisible, intangible.”[51] Metonymy is more specific in that it typically deals with some intangible state made tangible. Dylan does this repeatedly when referring to the “masters of war.” The first instance of this is when Dylan says, “But I see through your eyes / And I see through your brain.”[52] Here, “eyes” and “brain” are biological components used to refer to more abstract concepts, such as goals and thoughts. By saying this Dylan is not only reducing the officials to simple

48 Ibid., 26.
49 Dylan, “Masters of War.”
50 Ibid.
51 Kenneth Burke “Four Master Tropes,” *The Kenyan Review* 3, no. 4 (1941): 425, www.jstor.org/stable/4332286.
52 Dylan, “Masters of War.”

biological identifiers, thus emphasizing their human nature, he is also claiming to know their plan and their purpose. In this way it is interpreted that the "masters of war" realize the destructive nature of war yet still proceed with it anyway. Additionally, speaking of the brain or the eyes is easier to comprehend than grasping at thoughts and emotions. The humanity of the officials is further emphasized in the next use of metonymy: "You ain't worth the blood / That runs in your veins."[53] Now Dylan represents the life of the officials as blood. He is again reducing them to biological aspects that every person has, thus illuminating that they are human, just like the soldiers who actually fight in the war. In emphasizing their humanity, the notion that the officials should face human consequences is revealed, as evidenced by the harsh ending of the song in wishing for their death. The overall use of metonymy is effective in its ability to reduce the power of the officials behind war by representing their thoughts, goals, and overall life as human characteristics that are inherently the same in everyone.

The final aspect contributing to the lasting message of "Masters of War" is the anonymity of the persona and the generality of the supporting materials. Together, these components can continually recreate an audience depending on the time period the song is examined in. For this claim I am drawing on Edwin Black's definition of persona—the author implied by the discourse. This persona is both a performance and an artificial construction.[54] The persona that Dylan exudes throughout the song is that of a young, anonymous soldier. As I have noted previously, the persona is built through division from the "masters of war" with Dylan's contrasting pronouns—you versus me. The soldier is continually seen as a victim of the officials, such as in the lines "You play with my world / Like it's your little toy."[55] This persona is abstracted from a particular individual, instead standing for the collective group of soldiers as a whole. It is a regular person taken out of their personal life to fight in a war, as many could have been at that time. Dylan further builds the persona later with "You might say that I'm young / You might say I'm unlearned."[56] This role of soldier can be given to anyone, despite age or skill level. Keeping the persona of the song anonymous allows for a greater identification, and thus impact, within "Masters of War."

Bob Dylan's "Masters of War" has gathered a large audience over time, due to its continually relevant message. Black refers to the audience as the second persona, or "implied auditor."[57] This audience is the one that

53 Ibid.

54 Edwin Black, "The Second Persona," *Quarterly Journal of Speech* 56, no. 2 (1970): 88.

55 Dylan, "Masters of War."

56 Ibid.

57 Black, "The Second Persona," 89.

is implied by the discourse itself, based on ideology. Bob Dylan's initial audience seems to be the officials due to the direct address technique: "Come you masters of war."[58] However, digging deeper, Dylan appears to be appealing to anyone who may agree with his claims, evidenced by the generality of his examples that are widely relatable. In 1963, teenagers and young adults were drawn to Dylan's music because it was able to "draw on their own unshaped anger and rage, terror and fear, and make it all real, even make it poetry."[59] Dylan does this through his insistence on depicting the truth of war in his supporting materials. He does not mask any of the brutalities of war when he says, "While the young people's blood / Flows out of their bodies / And is buried in the mud."[60] Illustrating just how devasting war can be, Dylan appeals to anyone who is affected by it, which is everyone because war is not limited to the battlefield. War affects those at home, even mothers with a "Fear to bring children / Into the world."[61] This experience, and others like it provided by Dylan, presents the shared belief that war is often more destructive than productive. The effects are widespread and felt by everyone. While Dylan is speaking about the wars at the time the song was produced, these same experiences are true of any war, therefore his audience is not limited to the historical context of 1963. Identifying with the ideology of the persona and the depictions of war as I have highlighted in "Masters of War" allows for an audience to connect with the song any time the world is facing some form of turmoil, whether it be war or extreme poverty.

Though "Masters of War" came about as a response to a particular event, its commitment to the truth and its artistic elements keep the song relevant beyond this singular occurrence. One effective method in evaluating a text is its adherence to the truth, for good rhetoric is "rhetoric that upholds the truth."[62] As I have noted, Dylan adheres strongly to illustrating war in all of its harsh reality. His examples of lived experiences of soldiers, though anonymous and relatively general, portray an accurate representation of war; these are consistent with any war, whether it is 1963's wars or any other war in the last fifty years. Dylan presents a symbolic reality in "Masters of War," one that is shared between him and his audience since the song's release. Additionally, the manner in which Dylan presents this reality serves as a means of judging the text. The artistry of a particular discourse, especially vivid description and depiction, "awaken the senses or emotions of viewers and listeners."[63] As I have explained, Dylan relies

58 Dylan, "Masters of War."
59 Marcus, "Stories of a Bad Song," 6.
60 Dylan, "Masters of War."
61 Ibid.
62 Campbell and Burkholder, *Critiques of Contemporary Rhetoric*, 114.
63 Ibid., 122.

heavily on imagery, interweaving it throughout the song to depict war in its true nature and the true nature of those that oversee war. This is highly effective for him because he is able to reach a wide audience by appealing to their emotions. His powerfully poetic lyrics draw people in and keep them enamored throughout the entirety of the song. Other effective artistic strategies are a powerful narrative development, the creation of a persona, and a skillful use of language.[64] Dylan is seen doing all of these in "Masters of War." Together these elements are effective because they allow for an identification within the narrative of the song that is not restricted to one particular type of person or one particular timeframe. Evident in its adherence to the truth and the power of its poetics, "Masters of War" conveys a continually important message. The reality of war transcends the historical context around the song's release because the world has not run out of wars to fight, thus "Masters of War" continues to have something important to say.

In the fifty-six years since Bob Dylan's "Masters of War" was produced and released, the message of the song has remained relevant due to the lyrics' narrative structure, poetic elements, and the anonymous content. Dylan held nothing back in depicting the true nature of war and calling out those responsible for it in such a way that makes it appropriate to deem him a rhetorician. The song came about as a response to the cultural climate of 1963—one of great political turmoil and civic unrest because of the multiple directions the United States was being pulled in as a result of the Cold War and the Vietnam War. Dylan captured the emotions of many people in "Masters of War." He used folk music in his own way to sing about then-current events but managed to do so in such a way that transcends the immediate context. The song even extends beyond a response to war; Dylan, and other artists, have performed the song in other times of change and turmoil as a call to action. The story-telling style of "Masters of War" and its relatable persona helped contribute to this widespread and continually growing audience because of the easy identification within the song. Harsh depictions of war and severe condemnations of officials can be applied to any time period. What came about as a reaction to the world around Dylan was a powerfully poetic message that persists. Bob Dylan captured the true nature of war while not-so-subtlety calling out those who allow it to happen. His song forces us to confront the truth that engaging in war is a choice—one that has consequences that extend far beyond the battlefield. As long as humans continually make this decision, this song will be relevant. The world has not run out of wars, and unfortunately, it does not seem likely it ever will.

64 Ibid., 123–4.

Eat, Drink, and Play Music

[Grace Drake]

The first pandemic episode of plague which devastated Europe in 1348 left the few remaining citizens terrified and confused after a two-year long outbreak. Although many artistic Europeans perished, those who lived through the Black Death continued to create, and their secular works accompanied the shift away from unquestioning faith. One collective worldview morphed into a split view which accounted for different interpretations of the mass death of Europeans. Death became a more integral part of daily life and was widely accepted as inevitable, as death did not discriminate between rich or poor, man or woman, or even layman or clergy. Additionally, as Europeans tried to rationalize the reason for the disease, new philosophical and religious theories emerged. Many of these views were polarizing, and ultimately there was a split between those who sought to sing and dance the pestilence away, and those who sought to maintain religious decorum in order to ensure that they enter Christian heaven.

The Black Death of 1348 changed both the composer and the compositions, and the music of the plague was either somber to reflect the grim reality, or lively music to dance to during parties. Two plague survivors, Giovanni Boccaccio and Guillaume de Machaut, made strides in the world of secular music, which had grown distinctly more popular during and after the outbreak of the Black Death. Boccaccio's *The Decameron* highlights the changing worldview and societal attitudes during the time of the plague, and Guillaume de Machaut's music puts this into context, as the timeline of his compositions align with the societal upheaval that took place during the late 1340s.

Written in 1353 but set just five years prior when plague was running rampant, Boccaccio's *The Decameron* follows ten Florentine pilgrims on their journey out of the plague-infested and desolate city. Each member of the brigata, or group, tells a tale on each day of the ten day journey relating to a different theme, and each tale ends with a song belonging

to the *ballata* genre.[1] The poetic and musical genre was quite new and secular in nature, beginning as a dance genre but evolving into an art song. In addition to ballate in *The Decameron*, Boccaccio also wrote the text to *madrigals*,[2] which were set by different composers of the time.[3] Although *The Decameron* is a work of literature, music played an important role within the fictional brigata during the Black Death, as it served both as a means of escapism and storytelling. In this work, Boccaccio also demonstrates the changing worldview of the time, highlighting the beliefs that plague-era composers likely held which provides context for their music.

In the opening day of *The Decameron*, Boccaccio writes that the deadly plague came "through the operation of the heavenly bodies or of [their] own iniquitous dealings," which describes the split in ideals between those who thought that the plague was inevitable and due to the alignment of the planets, and those who viewed it as a punishment from the hand of God for sinful actions.[4] One common religious view was that the Black Death was the first of the Four Horsemen of the Apocalypse, which are pestilence, war, famine, and death. Contrarily, astrology was growing in popularity, and many believed in the theory of superior conjunctions, which is the idea that the positions of planets in relation to the moon in houses corresponds to major Earthly events, such as flooding or plague. This theory is most likely what Boccaccio was referring to in the line "operation of the heavenly bodies."[5]

In relation to the church, Saxby Pridmore and Garry Walter claim that due to "the impotence of the Church and the clergy in combating the plague," many began to question religion and the nature of God, as people sought answers that the church could not provide. There was both social and economic upheaval as the population suddenly shrank, especially as the nobility began to dress and act more extravagantly in order to truly distinguish themselves from the lower classes. Two major examples of societal upheaval were the dissolvence of the feudal system and, economically, the drastic trade reduction due to the disease. By the end of 1348, there was no collective idea of how to handle this pandemic, but rather two opposing views both on the origin of the disease as well as whether to choose between quarantine or fleeing the city, or to stay and

1 Medieval song genre that first emerged in Italy consisting of verses and a refrain and was meant for dancing.

2 Songs written for several voices that explored themes of love and often death.

3 W. Thomas Marrocco, "Music and Dance in Boccaccio's Time. Part I: Fact and Speculation," *Dance Research Journal* 10, no. 2 (Spring-Summer 1978), 19.

4 Giovanni Boccaccio, *The Decameron*, trans. John Payne, (Roslyn: Walter J. Black Inc., 2007), 2.

5 John J. O'Connor, "Astrological Background of the Miller's Tale," *Speculum* 10, no. 1 (Jan. 1956), 121.

party in the streets as the city is destroyed.[6]

Music is central throughout *The Decameron*, and the only lute player of the brigata, Dioneo, represents those who abided by the saying "Eat, drink, and be merry, for tomorrow you may die" in order to cope with the plague.[7] This portrayal was accurate because many, including King Henry VIII, held this philosophy. When Henry VIII was in quarantine, the only members of his court whom he did not dismiss were three of his best gentlemen, his physician, and organist Dionisio Memo. In this time of turmoil, Henry VIII equally prioritized his health and merrymaking in the form of musical entertainment.[8] Throughout *The Decameron*, Dioneo consistently tries to sing lewd songs, and tells the group before they begin the journey that he would return to the infested city if they were not interested in having fun. Additionally, both Dioneo and vielle player Fiammetta choose to amuse themselves through song while others in the brigata amuse themselves with games or conversation. This brings to light the notion of music as both a pastime and a coping mechanism rather than only for the purpose of communication or prayer. Dioneo and Fiammetta are also attractive and sensuous characters, portraying the Troubadour-esque archetype of the musician as one who focuses on love rather than one who is godly.[9]

Prior to the outbreak of the Black Death, composer Guillaume de Machaut was composing mostly sacred motets[10] and dabbling a bit in secular music. Roger Bowers notes that "the Machaut of the 1340s and 1350s was composing… lais and virelais, ballades and rondeaux" which are all secular genres, and these years mark a distinct break in his catalogue of sacred music.[11] The virelais is the French equivalent of the ballata, which is the genre of song that Boccaccio's brigata sings throughout *The Decameron*. Although he began to explore secular music shortly before the outbreak, his new styles did not gain popularity until the Black Death struck. Unlike many composers, Machaut also wrote his own

6 Saxby Pridmore and Garry Walter, "Suicidal Ideation and Completed Suicide in The Decameron," *Turkish Journal of Psychiatry* 25, iss. 1 (Spring 2014), 3.

7 The phrase "eat, drink, and be merry, for tomorrow you may die" was popularized in Dante's Inferno, written in 1321, but was originally a mashup of Bible verse snippets. The phrase is often used out of context but was a common saying during the time of the Black Death, used to justify the engagement in raucous behavior.

8 Leonard W. Courie, "Social and Economic Effects of the Plague," *Decameron Web*, last modified March 12, 2010, https://www.brown.edu/Departments/Italian_Studies/dweb/plague/effects/social.php.

9 Christopher Macklin, "Plague, Performance and the Elusive History of the Stella Celi Extirpavit," *Early Music History* 29, (Oct. 2010), 3.

10 Unaccompanied choral music often meant for church choir.

11 Roger Bowers, "Guillaume de Machaut and his Canonry of Reims, 1338-1377," *Early Music History* 23, (2004), 1.

poetry which he set to music, making him favorable among other poets and writers. He is widely regarded as one of the most notable composers of the fourteenth century, and by exploring his works one can understand the changes in music as a whole during this time.[12]

The ballata genre and virelais genre, which are nearly synonymous, are crucial to the development of secular music, and by the mid 1300s functioned as an art song rather than a dance. W. Thomas Marrocco states that the features that distinguished this new definition of the genre as opposed to the older dance tradition were:

> 1. A florid and prominent upper voice against a lower part or parts consisting of longer note values.
> 2. Contrapuntal and chordal treatment within a composition.
> 3. Rhythmic independence of each part.
> 4. Occasional presence of changing time signatures within a composition.
> 5. Absence of symmetrical periods and dance-like rhythmic regularity.[13]

Machaut had a direct confrontation with the plague in November of 1349, when it struck the city of Navarre in which he was living at the time. The introduction of his poem, "Le Jugement du Roi de Navarre," written in 1349, describes the hardships of this time and laments on the crumbling society. His account of the Black Death is consistent with historians', as the city of Navarre was one of the last to become infected. Machaut comments in this introduction,

> But what grieves me more
> To endure, and troubles me more too,
> Is that God is accorded little reverence
> And that there is no order to anything.[14]

This passage accurately describes the disorder throughout Europe, as well as Machaut's sadness that God was no longer at the forefront of society. The virelais genre as an art song removed the orderly dance beat, and introduced a sense of disorder and change into music. Many features of

12 Ibid.

13 W. Thomas Marrocco, "The Ballata: A Metamorphic Form," *Acta Musicologica* 31, (1959), 36

14 Guillaume de Machaut, ed. R. Barton Palmer, ed. Yolanda Plumley, "Le Jugement dou Roy de Navarre," in *Guillaume de Machaut, The Complete Poetry and Music,* vol. 1 (Kalamazoo: Medieval Institute Publications, 2016), 143.

Machaut's "Messe de Nostre Dame," which was composed within sixteen years post Black Death, retain elements from these secular genres, such as isorhythm.[15] Overall, these elements that were present in his later music were considered imperfect by medieval standards, but were utilized in a deliberate way to glorify God during a time when Machaut felt that he was forgotten. The contrapuntal quality of this mass can be interpreted as a tribute to the divine order of God perhaps being restored after the Black Death had ended.

While God was not widely viewed as a remedy for the plague, Remi Chiu notes that often "doctors prescribed song as a prophylaxis to the disease."[16] One Italian physician, Niccolo Massa, stated that it is vital to listen to beautiful music and look at beautiful art in order to fight the Black Death, introducing the idea of music therapy in order to lift one's spirits during a tumultuous time. When the outbreak began to take many lives in 1348, the city of Pistoia issued an ordinance which stated that the use of town criers or drummers to summon citizens to a burial was illegal.[17] At least for common people, music was no longer allowed to be associated with death after the passing of this ordinance. Neither prayer nor medicine at the time were able to effectively ward off the plague, so doctors and city officials advocated for the use of music to make the best of the situation.

Physicians prescribed all behaviors that would bring joy, and Remi Chiu writes that these include "socialisation, games, storytelling, beautiful objects and joyous music."[18] The brigata of *The Decameron* embody these remedies as they spend their days assigning each other the role of Queen or King for a day and filling their journey with stories and songs. Machaut's secular music explores a variety of emotions within the overarching theme of love. His virelais composed after the year 1349 especially encompass the theme of courtly love, which was considered noble and elegant. Although he was troubled by the thought of the crumbling of a godly society, he still utilized music to showcase earthly beauty, just as medieval plague doctors prescribed it as a rudimentary form of therapy. Highlighting the joy and beauty of love, as well as the beauty of love lost, was perhaps a coping mechanism for Machaut, just as it was for the fictional but historically based Dioneo.

These themes of courtly love are present in Machaut's post 1349 virelai, "Ay mi! Dame de Valour." The first verse of the poem reads,

15 An isorhythm is a repeated rhythmic pattern that is juxtaposed with other rhythms, creating a full musical texture.

16 Remi Chiu, "Music, Pestilence and Two Settings of O Beate Sebastiane," *Early Music History* 31, (2012), 154.

17 Ibid.

18 Ibid., 159.

Most gentle creature.
How can your tender sweetness
Be so hard towards me.
When my heart, my body and my love
I have given you without reward
And without regret?
Now you keep me in langour
Of which I fear I will die.[19]

The associations with love and death in his post Black Death secular music are characteristic of other courtly love poems and songs, and although he sings of earthly love, he does so in an honorable way. Judith Kraft's recording of this virelais illustrates the somber tone through the choice to record the song with a single male voice with no accompaniment.[20] It may have been sung this way, or it would have been sung with vocal accompaniment singing either a drone or slower notes underneath the melody. Although there are moments where a pulse can be heard, the beat is unsteady and free flowing, which does not make for an effective dance tune, unlike earlier virelais. The emotion and lamentation in this piece reflect Machaut's view of the plague, and grief is an overwhelming theme throughout the rest of the lyrical content of this virelais. This song was not a reflection of plague time merriment, but rather an illustration of the overall feeling of hopelessness that possessed Europeans following 1348.

The Black Death irreparably changed the worldview of Europeans, as many were split between two conflicting philosophies. While some thought that the plague was punishment for a straying society, others thought that it had been predestined in the stars and that it had nothing to do with one's actions. Institutions such as the nobility and the church failed, and the old feudal system was looked down upon after 1348. Social and economic uprisings further split the classes, as the lower class often resented the nobility who could afford to flee the infested cities and escape the plague, so those who were forced to stay made the best of the situation with song and storytelling.

The music that emerged from the time of the plague was uniquely secular during an era when sacred music flourished, and the compositions and writings of Giovanni Boccaccio and Guillaume de Machaut provide context for the philosophical views that gave rise to secular music. Secular does not mean anti-God, as Machaut produced a large catalogue of secular music before continuing on to write one of the most influential

19 Guillaume de Machaut, trans. Jennifer Garnham, "Ay mi! Dame Valour," *Medieval Music Database*, 2003, http://arrow.latrobe.edu.au/store/3/4/5/4/2/public/MMDB/Composer/H0033033.HTM.

20 Judith Kraft, "Ay mi! Dame de Valour," Track 23 on *Devotion*. 1997.

masses of the Middle Ages, “Messe de Nostre Dame,” during the recovery period after the plague. Although there are differences between the lustful music performed by Boccaccio’s fictional luenist Dioneo and the courtly love virelais of Machaut, both ultimately serve as a coping mechanism and a means for distraction in the form of pleasure. Whether this pleasure seeking was of noble intention or not, it was all one could do when faced with the first Horseman of the Apocalypse in the form of pestilence.

responses to systemic injustice

The Destruction of Slavery in the American Civil War

[Kent Beckman]

The Confederate States of America (Confederacy or C.S.A) seceded to defend their rights, including their right to own slaves, in 1861. The American Civil War that ensued after the secession ironically ended slavery rather than preserved it. In this paper, I will use the collection of primary sources in *Free at Last: A Documentary History of Slavery, Freedom, and the Civil War* edited by a group of leading historians, as well as the source *Confederate Reckoning: Power and Politics in the Civil War South* by historian Stephanie McCurry, to analyze several key events and ideologies that contributed to slavery's end in the U.S. The emergence of slaves as a politically relevant force during the Civil War contributed to their freedom. Slaves political relevance began with Confederates fear of their own slaves. Slaves practicality as guides and informants encouraged Union officers to keep slaves within their lines, which enabled Lincoln to enact gradual emancipatory policies, such as the Confiscation and Militia Acts. The use of slaves against the Confederacy eventually lead to the passing of the Emancipation Proclamation on January 1, 1863, which further inspired slaves to join the Union force. The military dominance of the Union combined with freed slaves signaled not just the end to the Confederacy, but also to the institution of slavery that the Confederacy perpetuated. The destruction of slavery was spurred by the Confederate's decision to secede, which cultivated the emergence of slaves as salient political figures during the Civil War, increased sensitivity of soldiers to the plight of slaves, and placed outside pressure on the institution of slavery from both the Union's invasion and Lincoln's Emancipation Proclamation.

For slavery to end, misconceptions of it being mutually beneficial for the slaves and slave owners had to be recognized. The Civil War forced slave owners and white southerners to abandon their long-held argument that slavery was based on paternalism and exposed the true relationship between the slave and master, which was a mutual fear of each other. Historian Stephanie McCurry explains, "War…was often part of a larger

crisis in which slaveholding regimes were pressed to take 'account…of social forces hitherto excluded from political life.'"[1] The Civil War forced the Confederacy to acknowledge the political power of slaves and the potential threat they posed. Less than a month after the onset of the war an Alabama farmer named William H. Lee urged president Jefferson Davis of the Confederacy to consider drafting slaves: "I think that you had better order out all the negroe felers from 17 years oald up ether fort them up or put them in the army and Make them fite like good fells for wee ar in danger of our lives hear among them."[2] Lee's letter demonstrates that the white Southerners were afraid slaves would rise in rebellion once the Union marched south, which exemplifies the tension between slaves and the broader white population. Therefore, the Confederacy had a notion that slaves were going to be a hazard during the war even before the Union had become dedicated to freeing slaves.

The Union Army was content to preserve the institution of slavery at the beginning of the Civil War but the Union's perspective gradually evolved because of increased personal interaction between Union soldiers and slaves. General Harney of the Union Army explained how the Union reacted to slaves in Missouri: "slaves have escaped from their owners, and have sought refuge in the camps of United States troops…They were carefully sent back to their owners. An insurrection of slaves was reported to have taken place in Maryland."[3] The Union Army not only returned slaves to their owners, but were also willing to help put down slave insurrections. Maryland was a border state instrumental to the Union war effort, so the Union Army was careful to ensure that the state remained content with the Union. However, slaves began to challenge Union policy by demanding immediate political attention. General Butler, a Union commander, was flooded with slave refugees at Fortress Monroe. Butler writes:

> "Up to this time I have had come within my lines men and women with their children…I have therefore determined to employ, as I can do very profitably, the able-bodied persons in the party…As a military question it would seem to be a measure of necessity to deprive their masters of their services."[4]

1 Stephanie McCurry, *Confederate Reckoning: Power and Politics in the Civil War South* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2010), 310.

2 "William H. Lee to Jefferson Davis, May 4, 1861," in *Free at Last: A Documentary History of Slavery, Freedom, and the Civil War*, ed. Ira Berlin et al. (New York: The New Press, 2007), 4.

3 "General William S. Harney to Sgd. Thomas T. Gantt, May 14, 1861," *Free at Last*, 7–8.

4 "General Benjamin F. Butler to General-in-Chief Winfield Scott, May 27, 1861," *Free at Last*, 9–10.

Butler was forced to make a decision about the slaves who flooded his camp; he decided to pragmatically employ the slaves rather than allow them to return and aid the Confederacy. Slaves were considered property by both the Union and Confederacy at this time, but Butler's decision led to a blow against the institution of slavery in the form of the first Confiscation Act. The Confiscation Act passed in August 1861 by Abraham Lincoln allowed all slaves employed in support of the rebellion to be captured and utilized by Union troops.[5] Slaves interaction with the Union Army had led to an ideological and legislative change in the Union's stance towards slavery.

The Confiscation Act exposed Union soldiers to slaves, which made the soldiers more sensitive to the cruelty of slavery. General Charles P. Stone reminded soldiers of their duty: "in several instances soldiers of this Corps have so far forgotten their duty as to excite and encourage insubordination among the colored servants in the neighborhood of their camps, in direct violation of the laws of the United States."[6] Soldiers decided to encourage slaves to leave their masters not only within the Confederacy, but within Maryland, a border state. Tension built between the Union Army and Maryland's political figures as soldiers ignored official policy and protected the slaves who were aiding the Union cause. Maryland Governor Thomas H. Hicks complained to the Secretary of War that Union soldiers and even officers were interfering with slaves being returned to their masters. Hicks explains, "[the slave master] was surrounded by [Union soldiers],[who] menaced him, and applied opprobrious epithets, such as Negro stealer, Negro catchers, and that the Negro was better than he, the master was &c &c until he was obliged to leave the ground."[7] Soldiers defended slaves for whom masters came because they began to empathize with the slaves who worked alongside them. Union soldiers who had not cared about slavery before the war now sided with slaves, yet another step towards ending slavery because it challenged the current law regarding the return and treatment of runaway slaves in service of the Union.

As Union soldiers became more sensitive to the plight of slaves for humanitarian reasons, Union officers viewed slaves in increasingly pragmatic and strategic terms. In March 1862, General Abner Doubleday wrote to a New York regiment to inform them that Union soldiers could no longer return fugitive slaves to their owners: "All negroes coming into the lines of any of the camps or forts under his command are to be treated as persons and not as chattels."[8] African Americans being treated as

5 Ibid., 11.

6 "Brigadier General Stone to Troops in Maryland, September 23, 1861," *Free at Last*, 12–3.

7 "Governor Thomas H. Hicks to Washington, November 18, 1861," *Free at Last*, 15–7.

8 "E. P. Halsted (General Doubleday's adjunct) to Commander of New York Regiment," April 6, 1862, *Free at Last*, 36–7.

people was an instrumental step to ending slavery because the institution of slavery illustrated them as inferior to white men. Doubleday further explained, "[freed slaves] bring much valuable information…They are acquainted with all the roads…and they make excellent guides. They also Know and frequently, have exposed the haunts of secession spies."[9] Union officers were not defending slaves out of abolitionist notions as the soldiers previously mentioned seemingly did. However, the Union officers saw that freed slaves were a valuable military resource in their role as guides and informants. Therefore, officers enacted policy that tangibly impacted the end of slavery by inducing the then radical notion that slaves were to be treated as people for the valuable service they gave the Union Army.

The change of Union attitude towards slaves and the institution of slavery was cyclical as the first Confiscation Act was driven by slave's initiative to flee to Union camps, which changed how soldiers and officers viewed slaves. Union military officers' new perspective inspired Lincoln to sign further legislation to alter the Union's policy regarding slaves and slavery. However, McCurry explains that none of the policy would have been considered without the political activity of slaves: "Southern slaves' insurrection against both slavery and the slaveholders' state alerted Union men to the potential utility of their labor, loyalty, and military service, and put emancipation on the agenda."[10] Lincoln signed the first federal law that abolished slavery in any place in April 1862 when he emancipated all slaves in Washington D.C.[11] Lincoln also signed the second Confiscation Act in July 1862, which expanded the freedom of runaway slaves from the Confederacy. Now any slave who escaped and who previously had a rebel owner was forever free, and Union troops were banned from offering up slaves in federal service to anyone, even if they had papers. The second Confiscation Act further incentivized slaves to travel to the Union encampments in their area, or even those that were a far and treacherous journey away. The exodus of slaves to the North ate away at slavery's power.[12] Lincoln also enacted a Militia Act in July 1862 that allowed any African American to join the armed forces. The Militia Act extended freedom to slaves' entire families if they joined the armed forces of the Union. Lincoln's Confiscation and Militia Acts helped end slavery by gradually granting more freedom to slaves in both the Union and the Confederacy.

Lincoln's emancipatory policy towards slaves in the Confederacy was echoed by abolitionist officers in areas under federal control, such as Southern Louisiana. When officers gave Unionist slaves free papers,

9 Ibid.
10 McCurry, *Confederate Reckoning*, 315.
11 "E. P. Halsted to Commander of New York," 39.
12 *Free at Last*, 59–60.

an enraged planter wrote to General George F. Shepley that his slaves were in a state of open rebellion: "One of the revolted named Auguste, demanded from the overseer his gun…In reply to M[r.] Smith's question, 'if he had a pass,' he said Gen. Dow had given him free papers which he produced."[13] Abolitionist Union officers, such as General Dow, gave slaves under Union protection free papers to further emancipate slaves in the U.S. The strained relationship between Union slaveholders and the Union military was highlighted when Colonel Smith D. Atkins of the 92d Illinois regiment refused to return runaway slaves who came within his unit. Atkins saw the slaves under his command as a practical asset. The press comments, "At Winchester, on the road to Lexington, the citizens threatened, with the aid of the 14th Kentucky to 'clean out,' the Illinois boys. Col Atkins accordingly marched through the town with fixed bayonets and loaded guns."[14] The drama that unfolded between Union slaveholders and the military at Winchester that had previously been contained to written complaints had exploded into tangible threats of violence following Atkins emancipatory efforts. Colonel Smith wrote to General Gillmore of the Union that "I am under orders to proceed southward with my command, and I do not know at what moment I may find the enemy, and I cannot afford to piddle away my time in hunting up niggers or in replying to bills in chancery filed against me."[15] Atkins refused to return slaves because he was commanding a military unit, and thought that being caught in the controversy regarding returning slaves inhibited his combat effectiveness.

The strong emotions surrounding the expectation of the Emancipation Proclamation explicitly betrayed the oppression of the institution of slavery to both planters and African Americans. A Louisiana planter, Pierre Soniat, feared insurrection, which he would not need to fear if masters and slaves truly had a cooperative relationship as the Confederates claimed. Soniat explains,

> "[Slaves] imagine that they are to be freed by Christmas. Vague reports are spread about what they intend, taking whatever weapons they can find, to come in vast numbers and force the federal government to give them their freedom…The negro regiments being organized and armed are especially to be feared."[16]

---

13 "John C. P. Wederstrandt to General George F. Shepley, September 19, 1861," *Free at Last*, 72–3.

14 "Colonel Smith D. Atkins Publication from the Cincinnati Commercial, Cleveland, Ohio, November 1862," *Free at Last*, 76–7.

15 "Colonel Smith D. Atkins to Brigadier General Q. A. Gillmore, November 19, 1862," *Free at Last*, 78–9.

16 "Pierre Soniat to General Nathaniel P. Banks, December 20, 1862," *Free at Last*, 84–5.

Soniat worried that slaves would rebel if the Emancipation Proclamation did not happen. This shows that many planters did not believe Lincoln would free the slaves, but also believed that slaves had the power to free themselves if armed. Union officers of color asked General Banks to allow African Americans in the Union military to celebrate the coming Emancipation Proclamation: "We…respectfully ask of you th privirliges of Salabrating Th first Day of January th 1863 by a Large procesion on that Day & We wish to pass the Head quarters of th Union officers high in a authority."[17] The very existence of this letter points to the progress made toward ending slavery before the Emancipation Proclamation. Free African Americans who served the Union corresponded with white Union military officers about having a celebration, which included the white Union officers themselves.

The Emancipation Proclamation officially ended the institution of slavery within the Confederacy on New Year's Day in 1863. The Emancipation Proclamation changed the primary goals of the war to emphasize ending slavery. However, as McCurry explains, "it took military victory to secure emancipation."[18] Lincoln's Proclamation could only be enforced through Union military action. Just days after the Emancipation Proclamation, a group of black men who served in the Union military, acted to free their families in North Carolina. Edward Stanley, a unionist who was military governor, protested: "A band of negroes & soldiers, 'armed', visited the premises of a Mrs. Page of that town, and carried away several negroes…They were very insolent in their conduct and threatened to have the town shelled if they were interfered with."[19] African-Americans acted with a newfound authority after the Emancipation Proclamation as they worked to free those still enslaved. The Emancipation Proclamation may have provided the legal spark necessary to end slavery, but it was the tangible actions of freed slaves and soldiers systematically freeing their families and friends that eradicated the institution of slavery.

The Emancipation Proclamation further pressured the Confederacy as it aided the Union's war effort through turning slaves to the Union cause. McCurry explains, "By the spring of 1863 the Union Army was recruiting aggressively in Confederate territory."[20] Even the Confederate officers realized that the Union military was a liberating force and that if they did not move their slaves away, they would be forced to fight them. General E. Kirby Smith of the Confederacy explained, "Our plantations are made

17 "J. M. Marshall and Henry Clay to General Nathaniel P. Banks, December 22, 1862," *Free at Last*, 85.

18 McCurry, *Confederate Reckoning*, 314.

19 "Edward Stanley to Federal Military Commander, January 20, 1863," *Free at Last*, 98.

20 McCurry, *Confederate Reckoning*, 319.

his recruiting stations, and unless some check can be devised, a strong and powerful force will be formed which will receive large additions as he advances on our territory."[21] The Confederacy's largest asset was becoming their largest liability as the Union force swept through the Confederacy and liquidized the Confederacy's investment from them. The Confederates themselves scrambled to recruit slaves to join their Army, emphasizing how the institution of slavery had lost hope of survival: "Because of slavery, the C.S. A. was forced to wage war with the Union Army in front and 'an insurrection in the rear.'"[22] Slaves had shattered the Confederacy's resolve, which is seen in General Lee's backing to emancipate slaves in return for arming them. The Confederacy had become focused on survival rather than perpetuating their own ideals. Lee asks, "'whether slavery shall be extinguished by our enemies and the slaves be used against us or use them ourselves.'"[23] Slaves managed to become such a politically important group during the Civil War that the Confederacy was willing to end slavery to fight off the Union.

The destruction of slavery was spurred by the Confederacy's decision to secede, which spurred the emergence of slaves as salient political figures during the Civil War, increased sensitivity of soldiers to the plight of slaves, and placed outside pressure on the institution of slavery from both the Union's invasion and Lincoln's Emancipation Proclamation. The Confederacy's hasty secession from the Union to protect slavery ultimately resulted in its demise. Slaves managed to make themselves political figures in an era where they were repressed and considered inferior to those who held power in both the Union and the Confederacy. Slaves managed to make an ally of the Union through proving their usefulness in combat and through providing more manpower for the Union. Lincoln passed several emancipatory policies, which culminated in the Emancipation Proclamation. The Emancipation Proclamation coupled with a Union victory ended slavery, as the institution crumbled under pressures from both outside and within the Confederacy.

21 "General E. Kirby Smith to Another Confederate Commander, September 4, 1863," *Free at Last*, 139–40.

22 McCurry, *Confederate Reckoning*, 327.

23 Ibid., 341.

Expanding Our Understandings of Knowledge(s):

Plurality Beyond Coloniality

[Sofia Lyazkowska]

Knowledge is generally understood as the acquisition and use of information through experience and education. It is crucial for human development and progress. But the production of knowledge, a shared human ability, has often been transformed into and understood as solely the production of valid knowledge, often constricted by the constraints of how valid knowledge must be produced, who can produce it, and most importantly, how it is defined. Furthermore, these distinctions of knowledge and the production of knowledge often are reflective of other institutionalized power dynamics. As Arowosegbe states:

> While knowledge is power, given the unequal distribution of global economic, military and political resources, unequal access to knowledge is a major part of the asymmetries of power that historically underline North–South relations. Consequently, and for the same historical reasons, countries controlling the concentration and possession of such resources naturally dominate the global production and dissemination of knowledge.[1]

Reflecting on such considerations, I intend to assess one contextualized aspect of knowledge—the production of knowledge about Africa—primarily through the works of Malawian historian Paul Zeleza. To start, I will summarize his key discussions on the unequal share of Africans in the "international political economy of knowledge production," specifically about Africa, followed by his argument for the need to increase African publishing and dissemination, both nationally and internationally.[2] This

1 Jeremiah O. Arowosegbe, "African Scholars, African Studies and Knowledge Production on Africa," *The Journal of the International African Institute* 86, no. 2 (2016): 325.

2 Paul Zeleza, "Manufacturing and Consuming: African Libraries and Publishing," *Development in Practice* 6, no. 4 (1996): 251.

all must be understood within the context of coloniality, the denial of agency; the imposition of a people, a society, or a culture into an object of another's worldview, hierarchy, history, future, and fundamental understanding. Coloniality's foundation was the construction of race as biological difference within a hierarchy.[3] Such was the impact and nature of imperialism and colonization, which were based upon the fundamental beliefs of the superiority of Europeans and the cultural contempt of non-European societies.

The first section will attempt to contextualize Zeleza's arguments through discussing how and why there came to be such an uneven production of knowledge by Africans, in reference to published works, and why the call for greater African scholarly production, especially aimed at knowledge about Africa, is a necessary and righteous argument. In the second section, I aspire to complicate and bring to light the intricacies that lie in emphasizing scholarly produced knowledge as the most fruitful method to counter coloniality, discussing how exalting academic knowledge can fall into the trap of the hierarchy of knowledge, itself a relic of coloniality. To conclude, I will assess how a radical and novel understanding of knowledge(s) is necessary and long overdue, and how this can be a key in overcoming the coloniality of knowledge that has become so deeply embedded as a result of the imperialist project.

Historical Contextualization of the Coloniality of Knowledge

Imperialism and colonialism were processes through which Europeans constructed and invented both themselves and those that they encountered. Such an argument is well represented in influential works such as *The Invention of Africa* by V. Y. Mudimbe, *The Wretched of the Earth* by Frantz Fanon, and *Orientalism* by Edward Said. These authors argued that the European encounter with the other, non-Europeans, was structured through a collection of binaries: culture/non-culture, civilization/non-civilization, civilized/primitive, superior/inferior, history/non-history, in which the Europeans always remained in the upper hand. The rise of early modern Europe in the late fifteenth century produced alongside its Eurocentrism — a worldview in which all societies, histories, and cultures had to fit into the European schema, where Europe was both the norm and the superior. Through this worldview, the European encounter with America produced the modern notion of race, previously simply signifying geographic origin such as Portuguese, then constructed into a biological structure existing within a hierarchy.[4] This supposed biological racial hierarchy was constructed as a justification for and legitimization of the

3 Anibal Quijano, "Coloniality of Power, Eurocentrism, and Latin America," *Nepantla: Views from South* 8, no. 3 (2000): 534.

4 Ibid.

conquest and domination by Europeans of the other.[5] Thus, the superiority/inferiority binary of the dominator/dominated was constructed to seem like the outcome of the natural state of relations between white and non-white.[6] Therefore, it imposed this binary upon all that related to those who were non-white, such as their culture, knowledge, and systems.[7] Ndlovu-Gatsheni discusses a concept introduced by Boaventura de Sousa Santos called the "abyssal thinking."[8] This concept describes the perception that upheld the imposition of a category of humans into these binaries, meaning "an imperial reason that reduced some human beings to a sub-human category with no knowledge."[9] The results of this Eurocentric imposition of binaries was the forced devaluing of conquered or colonized ways of being, and in some cases, the total eradication of them. The creation of such binaries did not simply serve to invent or construct the identities of the dominated people but were deeply integral to Europe's creation of itself as well. As Europe plundered Africa, it became more modern and developed through the riches gained, while Africa grew more underdeveloped. This argument is prominent in Walter Rodney's *How Europe Underdeveloped Africa* (1972), which argues that development/underdevelopment are two sides to the same process, yet another binary that was constructed through imperialism/colonialism and perpetuated into contemporary times.[10]

The binaries constructed through imperialism and colonialism have had lasting impacts on the ways societies and their histories are interpreted. In the context of Africa, the racial binary led to another fabrication, the creation of "sub-Saharan Africa" and its definition as "Africa proper" as G.W.F Hegel called it, arguing that "Africa was the ultimate 'undeveloped, unhistorical' other of Europe."[11] It is this fabrication of Africa that is so critically examined in Mudimbe's *The Invention of Africa*, which still haunts historical and historiographical works on both Africa and the world.[12] Zeleza

5 Ibid.

6 Ibid., 535.

7 Ibid.

8 Sabelo J. Ndlovu-Gatsheni, *Epistemic Freedom in Africa: Deprovincialization and Decolonization* (Oxford: Routledge, 2018), 3.

9 Ibid.

10 Walter Rodney, *How Europe Underdeveloped Africa* (London: Bogle-L'Ouverture Publications, 1972).

11 Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel, *The Philosophy of History*, trans. John Sibree (London: G. Bell and Sons, 1861), 109, quoted in Paul Zeleza, "The Inventions of African Identities and Languages: The Discursive and Developmental Implications," in *Selected Proceedings of the 36th Annual Conference on African Linguistics,* ed. Olaoba F. Arasanyin and Michael A. Pemberton (Somerville: Cascadilla Press, 2006), 15.

12 Valentin-Yves, Mudimbe, *The Invention of Africa* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1988), quoted in Paul Zeleza, "Banishing the Silences: Towards the Globalization of African History," paper presented at the 11th General Assembly of CODESRIA in Maputo, Mozambique, December 6–10, 2005, 4.

reveals one manifestation of this through the examination of a survey of world historiography in which the African history of Egypt is incorporated into the Western history and the African Islamic history is attributed simply to Islamic history.[13] Furthermore, the deeply influential Pan-Africanist works of W. E. B. Dubois are called the beginning of "European-American historiography of Africa," all while Western history takes up the most space and prominence throughout the work.[14] Additionally, Zeleza discusses how world history often only covers the past 5,000 years, disregarding the origin of our Homo sapien species of approximately 300,000 years, which is now well known to be Africa.[15]

Furthermore, Zeleza describes how world history often uses the European trajectory as the norm, disregarding that the rise of European hegemony occurred a comparatively measly two and a half centuries ago.[16] The use of the European and Western societies' historical trajectories as the standard to which all other societies are compared denies these non-Western societies epistemic freedom, what Ndlovu-Gatsheni defines as "the right to think, theorize, interpret the world, develop own methodologies, and write from where one is located and unencumbered by Eurocentrism."[17] Zeleza speaking to this point makes an incredibly apt assessment:

> [T]he fantasies of Eurocentric historiography [...] has inferiorized African difference by turning it into a difference in time and a difference in space. Temporal differentiation is articulated in evolutionary terms and historical stages in which the West is always ahead in a social Darwinist world of linear development, initiating progressive change that others are fated to imitate. Spatial differentiation posits central and marginal places, territorializes social development — wealth and poverty — so that levels of material accumulation become measures of human worth and historical agency in which the West, once again, is not only placed at the center but its global expansion and interventions become imperative humanistic acts of magnanimity.[18]

These temporal and spatial differentiations within Western history, historiography, and worldview are key elements of coloniality, as they have imposed into the understanding of humanity a trajectory of unilineal evolution, where all societies develop along a pre-destined path from

13 Zeleza, "Banishing the Silences," 4.
14 Ibid.
15 Ibid.
16 Ibid.
17 Ndlovu-Gatsheni, *Epistemic Freedom in Africa*, 3.
18 Zeleza, "Banishing the Silences," 2.

traditional to modern. This single path of social evolution places the Western "modern" society as the guide and teacher to all other societies, which are assumed to be simply in the earlier stages of civilization, from which they can progress only by following the footsteps and guidance of the West. Such a perception of linear historical development is reflective of and based on the "idea of Europe as a teacher of the world and the idea of Africa as a pupil" which formed the basis of the civilizing missions of the imperialist and colonial encounters.[19] Such distortions of Africa's history and culture are rooted in what V.Y. Mudimbe (1988) calls the "colonial library," which is the Africa that was invented and constructed throughout the process of imperialism and colonialism: "Europe's social imaginary of its ultimate 'Other.'"[20] Zeleza describes how Mudimbe aptly focuses on how such a construction occurred through the framework of "Eurocentric categories and conceptual systems, from anthropology and missionary discourses to philosophy, an order of knowledge constituted in the sociohistorical context of colonialism, which produced enduring dichotomies between Europe and Africa."[21] The knowledge constructed within these diverse domains by Europeans throughout their colonization of Africa functioned to affirm their search for difference and their perception of European superiority. This knowledge then served as a justification for the civilizing missions and colonial governments enacted within Africa and as a confirmation of the Eurocentric belief that Europeans must teach others their ways.

Countering the Coloniality of Knowledge About Africa

In the context of such enduring constructions, the perpetuation of knowledge about Africa rooted within colonial distortions is an incredible travesty to both the human societies of the world and those within Africa, as it disfigures the genuine richness of our collective humanity through the continuation of false narratives. While there have been incredible strides to destroy such dominant narratives, coming from within and outside of the continent, there exists a damaging perpetuation of knowledge on the Africa invented through the colonial and imperial domination. Zeleza discusses the constraints that have hampered African publishing and the impact this has had on the limited information available to Africans and the outside world about Africa that comes from Africans themselves.[22] This manifests itself in African libraries whose collections are based on Western libraries, university and research libraries with low levels of journal subscriptions (which in the case of receiving library aid are given books and journals that are European and North American), and subscriptions to databases

19 Ndlovu-Gatsheni, *Epistemic Freedom in Africa*, 6.

20 Mudimbe, *The Invention of Africa*, quoted in Zeleza, "Banishing the Silences," 4.

21 Zeleza, "The Inventions of African Identities and Languages," 16.

22 Zeleza, "Manufacturing and Consuming."

that are dominated by Western scholarship.[23] As a result, Zeleza argues that Africa is often left dependent "on external sources for knowledge about itself [which] is a cultural and an economic travesty of monumental proportions."[24] As we have discussed, this imported knowledge often is not reflective of the realities of Africa, instead reflective of the distorted Africa that has perpetuated itself throughout Western scholarship.

Knowledge about Africa must be informed by the people and realities of Africa, instead of solely through the understandings and perceptions of outsiders. The task at hand is what Ndlovu-Gatsheni (2018) terms "deprovincializing" Africa, "an intellectual and academic process of centering of Africa as a legitimate historical unit of analysis and epistemic site from which to interpret the world while at the same time globalizing knowledge from Africa."[25] Zeleza argues that publishing is the way forward and out of this information dependency, as it is critical for the cultural identities of Africans and "provides the material basis for producing, codifying, circulating and consuming ideas, which, in turn, shape the organisation of productive activities and relations in society."[26] Zeleza is joined by authors Walter Bgoya and Mary Jay in promoting African publishing, who argue that publishing is a reflection of a society's experiences, history, and identity and that it helps to preserve, enhance and develop a society's culture.[27] Bgoya and Jay identify that, as of 2000 publishing in Africa is heavily concentrated in educational texts, while recognizing that the textbook market is still dominated by international publishers.[28] As of 2013, Africa holds 15 percent of the world population and published less than 2 percent of the books.[29] Such figures reveal that there is much progress to be made, which Zeleza identifies as necessary on all fronts of the publishing business, especially libraries. He discusses how libraries in the U.S. are responsible for up to 90 percent of scholarly journal income and that they are crucial in the venture to increase African publishing.[30] Libraries are one of the major places where people come into contact with books, therefore, they have power in their ability to support African publishers so that there is financial support for the internal production of knowledge about Africa. Additionally, libraries have the power to provide African consumers greater access to knowledge that reflects their own experiences. Zeleza calls on African intellectuals to

23 Ibid., 294–7.
24 Ibid., 299.
25 Ndlovu-Getsheni, *Epistemic Freedom in Africa*, 4.
26 Zeleza, "Manufacturing and Consuming," 299.
27 Walter Bgoya and Mary Jay, "Publishing in Africa from Independence to the Present Day," *Research in African Literatures* 44, no. 2 (2013).
28 Ibid., 22.
29 Ibid., 23.
30 Zeleza, "Manufacturing and Consuming," 300.

> shed their inferiority complexes about their own work by publishing, without apologies, in journals they control; by reading and citing each other; by demonstrating a greater faith in their own understanding of their complex and fast-changing societies—for no one else will do that for them.[31]

In such a way, Zeleza makes a compelling argument for publishing as the means for Africans to regain control over the history of, reality of, and knowledge about Africa.

Constraints of Scholarly Publishing

While publishing does not necessarily mean scholarly publishing, scholarly works are often the most elevated, especially in the context of changing dominant narratives, which is why I will assess this aspect. Though scholarly publishing certainly offers one route to dismantling the coloniality of knowledge about Africa, it is fundamentally crucial to recognize that it is not the only way, nor even the best way. Such reflections must be made in consideration of the coloniality of knowledge itself. Zeleza contends that higher education is "historically the most important site of knowledge production," a valid justification for his emphasis on scholarly publishing.[32] Yet, it is necessary to recognize how such an emphasis on scholarly production can become a victim to the same coloniality of knowledge that it aspires to overcome by playing into the hierarchy of knowledge. Based on the scientific method, academic or scholarly knowledge are perceived as the basis for valid knowledge, positioning themselves at the top of the invented hierarchy of knowledge. Such a hierarchy is rooted in the Eurocentric belief of universal knowledge, that knowledge is not based in the cultural context it is produced within but transcends the identities and realities of who and where it is produced, positing a mind that could reason itself out of its body. As a result of such a framework, all knowledge that is produced outside of the Western scientific system is considered invalid, or at the most, inferior.

Such an epistemology is evident within higher education and academia, where the highest standard for producing valid knowledge through research is based on isolating objects of study from their context, "putting them in simplified and controllable experimental environments — which also means that scientists [researchers] separate themselves from

31 Ibid.

32 Paul Zeleza, "Knowledge, Globalization, and Hegemony: Production of Knowledge in the Twenty-First Century," in *Knowledge Society vs. Knowledge Economy*, eds. Sverker Sörlin and Hebe Vessuri (New York: Palgrave Macmillian, 2007), 80.

nature, the object of their study."[33] In recognition of this, there must be caution in placing scholarly publishing as the most effective route in countering the coloniality of knowledge, as it disregards the contexts of universities and research methods, themselves often mired in coloniality. Morgan Ndlovu discusses how universities are critical "producers and repositories of knowledge" and realizes how crucial it is to recognize whether universities in Africa "are African universities or merely Westernized universities on the African continent."[34] Ndlovu argues that "even though some of the universities in Africa were conceptualized and erected by nationalist-led post-colonial governments, their epistemic foundation remains Eurocentric."[35] This allows us to consider how African scholars, themselves, can partake in the construction of illusory, Eurocentric knowledge that they are aspiring to counter through the process of scholarly production. Thus, as a result of its invisibility, the coloniality of knowledge can reproduce itself through institutions of higher learning, perpetuating the same Eurocentric conceptualizations of Africa and the world.[36]

Diverse Knowledges

It is imperative to recognize and assess the hierarchy of knowledge that has come to be so internalized within academia and societies. As mentioned, Western scientific knowledge has been placed in a binary with traditional and, frankly, all other forms of knowledge. Furthermore, within this hierarchy, scholarly or academic knowledge based on expertise substantiated by credentials is often validated in opposition to embodied knowledge, or that which arises from experience. This embodied knowledge is often diminished to the status of local knowledge as opposed to the scholarly universal knowledge. Based on the scientific method, the supposed universality of Western knowledge is what upholds it as the valid knowledge from which we can gain value, placing Western knowledge at the top of its own hierarchy. As Ndlovu-Gatsheni states, "the signature of epistemic hegemony is the idea of 'knowledge' rather than 'knowledges.'"[37] The roots of the hegemonic Western knowledge are a materialist worldview, the separation of secular and spiritual, and in "narrowly focused scientific disciplines that neglect the interconnections of natural phenomena."[38]

33 Fulvio Mazzocchi, "Western Science and Traditional Knowledge. Despite Their Variations, Different Forms of Knowledge can Learn from Each Other," *EMBO Reports* 7, no. 5 (2006): 464.

34 Morgan Ndlovu, "Coloniality of Knowledge and the Challenge of Creating African Futures," *Ufahamu: A Journal of African Studies* 40, no. 2 (2018): 100–01.

35 Ibid., 101.

36 Ibid., 99.

37 Ndlovu-Getsheni, *Epistemic Freedom in Africa*, 8.

38 Anders Breidlid, *Education, Indigenous Knowledges, and Development in the Global South: Contesting Knowledges for a Sustainable Future* (New York: Routledge, 2013), 35.

These characteristics are themselves revelatory of how knowledge is deeply intertwined with and dependent on the worldview of the society that it is derived from, as they are representative of an inherently Western conception of the world. Due to this, it is crucial to recognize that there are different forms of knowledge that arise from disparate worldviews, cultures, and experiences—not simply reducible to a hierarchy—but that can be represented and understood through the concept of knowledges.

Indigenous Knowledges

In an attempt to discuss the characteristics of indigenous knowledges and ways of knowing that distinguish them from Western knowledge, we must emphasize the most common characteristics. Breidlid discusses the difficulty of describing indigenous knowledge systems without engaging in reductionism or essentialisms by contextualizing that the cultural experiences of different members within or between different societies are diverse and that, therefore, their knowledge and ways of producing knowledge can be divergent as a result.[39] Such a recognition substantiates the reality that diverse experiences lead to diverse knowledges. Despite this difficulty, Breidlid makes some general descriptions of indigenous knowledges that allow an understanding of how varying cultures and worldviews have shaped knowledges that are disparate from the hegemonic Western scientific knowledge. He illustrates indigenous knowledges as embedded in a worldview which sees the material and the spiritual as compatible, where there is a holistic understanding of the "interrelationship between nature, human beings, and the supernatural," and an emphasis on the relationship "of human beings to both one another and to their ecosystem."[40] One possible consequence of this divergent worldview and its resulting knowledge(s) is a success in sustainable development and ecosystem management, which is commonly related to the holistic conception of nature and the sacred and spiritual notions of land, as opposed to the Western exploitable, tame-able, and commodity notions of land.[41] The connections between these successes in sustainability and indigenous knowledges are documented in research from 2000 and 2010, which Breidlid uses to support his arguments.[42]

Breaking Through the Binary and Hierarchy

Instead of partaking in the binaries of knowledge, which demand the opposition of indigenous knowledges to Western knowledge, or at their best the hierarchies that impose a submission of the former to the latter,

39 Ibid., 43.
40 Ibid., 34–5.
41 Ibid., 38.
42 Ibid.

within a hierarchy of validity, there must be a recognition of the plurality of knowledges, each rooted within their cultural context.[43] This is not to say that there are distinct, separate knowledges that have mutually exclusive ways of understanding and criteria, because cultures and ways of life, themselves, are not so neatly separated, nor so stable.[44] It is to recognize that knowledges and cultures have permeable boundaries, where one way of thinking and being is only as valid as it is applicable and useful, without binaries or hierarchies among them. Ultimately, we need to realize that there is simply the incredible diversity of humanity that must be appreciated and understood on its own terms, in its own context.

In light of the recognition of the plurality of knowledge(s), we can reconsider how to counter the coloniality of knowledge, especially about Africa. As mentioned, the promotion of scholarly publishing is an important path, but it is one that must be understood within its context as having limitations and constraints. It is also to be understood that this is simply one of many paths, just as the African scholarly representations of Africa are but one portion of society's perceptions. To quote the decolonial revolutionary Frantz Fanon, "nobody has a monopoly on truth . . . the search for truth in local situations is the responsibility of the community."[45] Such a perception allows us to recognize the need to caution against exalting academic publishing as the best means to counter the coloniality of knowledge about Africa. It forces recognition of the diversity of people's ways of living, which are likely to produce divergent ways of understanding, resulting in a plurality of knowledges that are representative of their respective realities. In such a context, the effective countering of the coloniality of knowledge about Africa can only be the result of the opening of dialogue with the diverse populations and societies of Africa. Therefore, all may contribute to the shaping of shared, divergent, and constantly in flux conceptions of their culture, history, and society.

Expanding Notions of Libraries

One illuminating example of honoring the knowledge produced by all sections of society is by widening of our understanding and conceptions of what a library is, referring to where knowledge can be acquired. Cherry-Ann Smart offers a novel conception of a library that incorporates the knowledge and memories of enslaved Africans transported to the New World, with a specific focus on "Africans brought to the West Indies between the 1650s and the 1850s."[46] The basis of her argument is that enslaved

43 Paul Feyerabend, *Farewell to Reason* (London: Verso, 1987).

44 Ibid., v–vi.

45 Frantz Fanon, *The Wretched of the Earth* (New York: Grove Press, 1963), 139.

46 Cherry-Ann Smart, "African Oral Tradition, Cultural Retentions and the Transmission of Knowledge in the West Indies," *IFLA Journal* 45, no. 1 (2019): 17.

Africans brought with them a repository of knowledge, skills, and talents that were passed down through generations, producing novel technologies and techniques in their new localized context.[47] This is assessed in the context of White's definition of library that is "a means by which we can gain access to knowledge."[48] In conclusion, the transmission of knowledge by enslaved Africans is representative of these enslaved African's roles as libraries, through their facilitating of access to knowledge. This is implicative of the incredibly varied sources of knowledge that exist. These imposed hierarchies based on credentials, such as scholarly produced knowledge, distort the reality that there is not a section of society without a valid claim to knowledge whose specific perceptions and conceptions are crucial for understanding their society, and our human society, as a whole.

Conclusion

Producing knowledge is a human ability, which historically has had binaries and hierarchies imposed upon it, distorting its reality. Perceptions such as the beliefs that there is only one way to acquire knowledge, that there is one universal way of knowing, or that there is an objective, universal knowledge to be discovered, have mutilated knowledge. To counter this coloniality of knowledge there must be a recognition of the extremely contextual nature of all knowledge: socio-historical, cultural, individual, etc. In attempting to dismantle the coloniality of specifically African knowledge, the call for an increase in scholarly production offers one valid means for doing so. As a method, scholarly production offers unique limitations and important considerations, such as its commonly Western epistemic roots and its historically dominating position within the illusory hierarchy of knowledge. In consideration of this, we should feel pushed to truly recognize how claims to knowledge cannot and should not be monopolized, as all sections of society are entitled to them. Recognizing this leads to the realization that the plurality of knowledges within societies and among societies are manifestations of diverse, yet equally valid conceptions of reality. Ultimately, it is only through celebrating, disseminating, and appreciating the incredible diversity of humanity and its resulting knowledges that can offer a path to any meaningful dismantlement of the coloniality of knowledge.

47 Ibid.

48 Ben White, "Guaranteeing Access to Knowledge: The Role of Libraries," *WIPO Magazine*, August 2012, quoted in Cherry-Ann Smart, "African Oral Tradition, Cultural Retentions and the Transmission of Knowledge in the West Indies." *IFLA Journal* 45, no. 1 (2019): 17.

"Carve a Tunnel of Hope":

Exploring Dr. Martin Luther King Jr.'s Nonviolent Philosophy

[Isaac Winter]

During the Montgomery Bus Boycott, one of the volunteer drivers asked an old woman walking along the sidewalk if she wanted a ride to her house. The old woman responded that she was "not walking for [herself… but] for [her] children and grandchildren."[1] This vignette shows the power of nonviolent resistance during the Civil Rights era, and how laws can be protested by engaging in acts of civil disobedience. Through Dr. Martin Luther King Jr.'s speeches and his leadership during the Montgomery Bus Boycott, he explains that the non-violent movement shows its strength for both individuals as well as for the entire group's efforts. In his speeches "Nonviolence: The Only Road to Freedom" and "Pilgrimage to Nonviolence," King writes that the individual can gain a better understanding of one's self through incorporating the idea of satyagraha[2] into one's support of integration efforts on a national scale and in local communities.[3] Dr. King emphasizes the success of the Montgomery Bus Boycott as a way in which groups of people engage in direct actions to combat institutions perpetuating injustice and immorality across the country. For both the individual and the group, Dr. King remarks that there is a virtuous and practical urgency to carry out nonviolent efforts for the benefits of future generations. Dr. King's detractors—including Malcolm X—claim that nonviolence is a timid strategy, and are convinced that violence is the right way to retaliate against institutional racism. However, this does not deter Dr. King and other leaders of the Civil Rights Movement from organizing marches and boycotts—showing the power of nonviolence methods to enact change within American society.

---

1 Clayborne Carson, ed. "Chapter 8: Violence of Desperate Men," in *The Autobiography of Martin Luther King, Jr.*, (New York: Grand Central Publishing, 1998), 65–66.

2 When satyagraha is broken up into two words, "*satya* is truth which equals love and *graha* is force." When they are put together, "*satyagraha* means truth-force or love-force."

3 Martin Luther King Jr. "Pilgrimage to Nonviolence," in *Martin Luther King, Jr., Malcolm X, and the Civil Rights Struggle of the 1950s and 1960s*, edited by David Howard-Pitney, (Bedford/St. Martin's, 2004), 43.

Before understanding how Dr. King communicated his nonviolent philosophy to other people, one must first understand how his philosophy on nonviolence evolved from burgeoning intellectual ideas to concrete actions. Dr. King's nonviolent philosophy became complete when he started incorporating Mahatma Gandhi's method of nonviolence, including the idea of satyagraha, into his own philosophy. In a 1928 speech, Gandhi explained the idea of satyagraha as a way of "fostering the idea of [mental] strength…every day."[4] Thus, through Gandhi's method of nonviolence, Dr. King found a foundation of inner strength that complemented the Christian ideas of love and community. Though Dr. King had a steady faith in God, he gained a new sense of stability through Gandhi's idea of satyagraha—that would help provide him with another source of energy to persevere through tough moments during the boycott. The idea that one can cultivate the strength found in satyagraha combined with "the Christian doctrine of love…became the guiding light for the movement."[5] However, it was not until the Montgomery Bus Boycott began until Dr. King realized that "through the actual experience of…protest, non-violence became…a commitment to a way of life."[6]

Through both the "Christian doctrine of love" and Gandhi's method of nonviolence, Dr. King's ideas show how patient individuals, like Jo Ann Robinson, find a renewed sense of self and self-respect while engaging in nonviolent actions. During the Montgomery Bus Boycott, some people expressed their doubts about the nonviolence method, claiming that the Montgomery Improvement Association (MIA) "needed a more militant approach" to their boycott because the group's nonviolent actions had been "weak and compromising."[7] Dr. King believes that these people became impatient with the results of the nonviolent method, and claimed that it was just "talk of fearful men…whose bold talk produces no action."[8] When explaining his ideas on nonviolence, Dr. King notes that once an individual person commits wholly to the method's foundational beliefs, that individual then "calls up strength and courage they did not know they had" inside them.[9] Engaging in nonviolent actions can help individuals

4 Surendra Bhana and Bridglal Pachai, ed. "Chapter 44: Gandhi explains 'satyagraha,'" in *A Documentary History of Indian South Africans*, e-book, *South African History Online*. https://www.sahistory.org.za/archive/44-gandhi-explains-satyagraha.

5 King, "Pilgrimage to Nonviolence," 43.

6 Ibid.

7 Carson, "Violence of Desperate Men," 67.

8 Martin Luther King Jr. "Nonviolence: The Only Road to Freedom," in *Martin Luther King, Jr., Malcolm X, and the Civil Rights Struggle of the 1950s and 1960s,* edited by David Howard-Pitney (Bedford/St. Martin's, 2004), 91-92.

9 King, "Pilgrimage to Nonviolence," 44.

find a greater sense of self and acquire "new self-respect."[10] In addition, practicing satyagraha confirms an entrenched belief in an individual's nonviolent actions. Jo Ann Robinson is a prime example of an individual who showed these characteristics during the Montgomery Bus Boycott. Her devotion to her roles as both a planner of the boycott and a driver during the boycott shows how an individual can engage in courageous and righteous behavior to improve a community.[11] The idea that nonviolence can be branded weak or ineffective is a misconception that Dr. King says can be corrected through improving one's personal relationships with one's self. In "Letter from Birmingham Jail," Dr. King talks about this idea in relation to self-purification.[12] In order for these messages to be effective during the Montgomery Bus Boycott, Dr. King believes in the individual's ability to use nonviolence as a technique to combat social injustices in the community, and ultimately, "to adopt nonviolence later as a way of life."[13]

Overall, the Montgomery Bus Boycott showed how non-violent methods work with a whole system of support working to combat the institutions perpetuating oppressive ideas and laws in America's communities. In his autobiography edited by Clayborne Carson, Dr. King details the massive group effort from members of the MIA that helped their movement become a success. Dr. King notes that events like the Montgomery Bus Boycott are paramount to getting rid of laws that support inequality, writing that "there is nothing quite so effective as a refusal to cooperate economically with the…institutions which perpetuate evil in our communities."[14] Dr. King understands that making the Montgomery Bus Boycott a success requires a herculean effort by a coalition of different groups, including "the forces of the churches, labor and the academic communities."[15] At its core, participating in this boycott provides the group with a strong sense of solidarity throughout their year-long protest. This coalition helped with the logistics of the movement—from the MIA's planning sessions to the organization of dozens upon dozens of drivers helping African-Americans get all across Montgomery for work or going home.[16] All the planning, organizing, and boycotting are direct actions that transform the word boycott from an idea to a movement. From there, the participants in these nonviolent actions "see the misery of…people so clearly that [they] volunteer[ed] to suffer in their behalf and put an

10 Ibid.

11 Carson, "Violence of Desperate Men," 66.

12 Martin Luther King Jr. "Letter from Birmingham Jail," in *Martin Luther King, Jr., Malcolm X, and the Civil Rights Struggle of the 1950s and 1960s*, edited by David Howard-Pitney (Bedford/St. Martin's, 2004), 76.

13 Carson, "Violence of Desperate Men," 68.

14 King, "Nonviolence: The Only Road to Freedom," 95.

15 Ibid.

16 Carson, "Violence of Desperate Men," 65-66.

end to their plight."[17] Ultimately, these participants' efforts helped reach towards Dr. King's goal of creating "a beloved community" where love and kindness conquers injustice in the South.

When reflecting on his nonviolent philosophy, Dr. King notes that in order for these efforts to continue working across America, "a qualitative change in our souls [has to occur] as well as a quantitative change in our lives."[18] The core of the nonviolence movement has as much to do with growing one's inner strength, as it has to do with helping out hundreds of individuals to carry out these actions. Dr. King melds together the Christian faith in God and love, with Mahatma Gandhi's idea of satyagraha and "truth-force."[19] Critics of the nonviolence movement who believed that using weapons would be a quicker response than a boycott or a march did not understand the power that comes from a group of people expressing righteousness and compassion during a time of uncertainty. The people who participated in the Montgomery Bus Boycott expressed a desire to rid their communities of oppression and give future generations the opportunity to live in a beloved community.

17 King, "Nonviolence: The Only Road to Freedom," 93.
18 Ibid., 94.
19 King, "Pilgrimage to Nonviolence," 43.

female empowerment and sexuality

You Do You, Boo:

The Unsexy Truth about Sexual and Reproductive Justice

[Krista Grund-Wickramasekera]

What makes sex work illegal? Should law-makers control my access to contraception? Do I have the right to have an abortion? As the topic of sex continues to be taboo, we may never truly get an objective look at the justice behind these situations. Sexual stigmatization is not the only barrier in the search for intersectional commentary, for adequate exposure to the topic of sex and reproduction is shielded by cultural norms, religious values, and, most importantly, accurate and holistic education. In the United States, sexual taboo has invoked an intruding patriarchal influence of antithetical societal values creating weak representation of sexual and reproductive justice, leading to unfair and unreasonable restrictions. An individual's bodily autonomy consistently hits roadblocks created by government restriction and protocol. We can analyze these injustices by assessing a society's treatment of gender norms, the experiences of women and men in the same environment, and the political and religious foundations of that society. I will construct my argument using the Western lens and focus on events in the United States to form a conclusive idea about the country's current status and necessary adjustments for sexual and reproductive justice.

This paper will explore and assess sexual and reproductive justice by providing national case studies to analyze the treatment of these topics. It will begin by defining sexual and reproductive justice and exploring its historical origins. Then, it will focus on three topics: the legality of sex work, fertility and abortion rights, and transgender rights in the context of the sexual and reproductive health movement. After, it will offer institutional plans designed by the movement to sustain the longevity of sexual and reproductive justice.

What is Sexual and Reproductive Justice?

Definitions and Origin

Foundationally, sexual and reproductive justice exists when every individual

is equipped with the power and resources that allow them to make healthy decisions about their body, reproductive measures, and sexuality. In practice, individuals have the right to choose to have children, to set their own conditions for birthing and family creation, to have necessary social support to care for their children in a healthy environment, and to maintain complete ownership of their body without oppressive sexual or reproductive barriers.[1]

In 1997, SisterSong emerged as a leading organization of the reproductive justice movement, bringing it to a national, multi-ethnic level. Prior to becoming SisterSong, the group was formerly known as Women of African Descent for Reproductive Justice, and they based their movement on the United Nations internationally accepted human rights framework to combine reproductive rights and social justice. The movement was originally advocated for by Indigenous women, women of color, and transgender people, creating a diverse and inclusive foundation from the very beginning. According to SisterSong, "the reproductive justice movement is about access, not choice."[2] For example, the fight starts at having the legal choice to have an abortion, but it must also be affordable and geographically convenient. Choice is absent when there is no access. Along with abortion, the reproductive justice movement focuses on providing easier access to contraception, comprehensive sex education, STI prevention and care, and domestic violence assistance.[3]

The movement aims to assess power systems that perpetuate acts of dominance in gendered, sexualized, or radicalized forms and eradicate these dynamics. Secondly, it aims to address intersecting oppressions. For example, marginalized women can face multiple oppressions, such as being part of the LGBTQ+ community and being a person of color, and can only achieve freedom by understanding the connected impact of each factor. Lastly, the movement aims to focus on the most marginalized groups of people, which SisterSong defines as African American, Arab and Middle Eastern, Asian and Pacific Islander, Latina women, and LQBTQ+ people. By focusing on these groups, SisterSong can help to ensure them better access to social and healthcare resources, complete enjoyment of their human rights, and a life without fear, discrimination, or retaliation.[4]

International Developments

Sexual and reproductive rights are human rights, as declared by the

1 "Sexual and Reproductive Health," NYC Health, accessed October 24, 2019, https://www1.nyc.gov/site/doh/health/health-topics/sexual-reproductive-justice-nyc.

2 "Reproductive Justice," SisterSong, accessed October 24, 2019, https://www.sistersong.net/reproductive-justice/.

3 Ibid.

4 Ibid.

Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR) in 1948 by the United Nations. More generally, this proclamation sets a "common standard of achievements of all peoples and all nations recognizing the 'equal and inalienable rights of all members of the human family.'"[5] The UDHR recognizes that individuals have the right to live without oppression, to maintain their liberty and security of person, including social security, and to sustain an adequate standard of living. In particular, mother and child are afforded special care and assistance.[6] The 1979 *Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women* and the 1989 *Convention on the Rights of the Child* recognize human rights related to sexual and reproductive health. The Committee on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights and the Committee on the Rights of the Child adopted General Comments recognizing that sexual and reproductive health can only proliferate if barriers to commodities, information, and counseling are destroyed. This includes any policies requiring third-party consent or authorization.[7] The Human Rights Committee's last General Comment advocates for governmental accountability for high rates of death and injury in women when they must seek unsafe abortions because they lack adequate health opportunities. These measures push governments to supply comprehensive reproductive health services.[8] A universal declaration requires all nations within the UN to adhere to commonly held international principles. In this case, these rights are institutionalized to build the strength of the sexual and reproductive justice movement so humans everywhere can have full autonomy of their bodies.

International recognition for sexual and reproductive rights has been prominent over the past decades with particular developments in Europe, such as the recognition for sexuality education by the European Court of Human Rights in 1976. As of 2018, the Court decided to provide sexuality education to children, following Switzerland's decision to make this a legal obligation. This recognition was promulgated as a global education effort to fight against sexual abuse and to protect public health.[9] Sexual education is inadequate in the United States because only one-fifth of middle schools and less than one-half of all high schools teach all sixteen sexual

5 "Universal Declaration of Human Rights," United Nations, accessed December 8, 2019, https://www.un.org/en/universal-declaration-human-rights/.

6 Ezter Kismödi and Laura Ferguson, "Celebrating the 70th Anniversary of the UDHR, Celebrating Sexual and Reproductive Rights," *Reproductive Health Matters* 26, no. 52 (2018): 1, www.jstor.org/stable/26605055.

7 Ibid.

8 Ibid.

9 Ibid.

education topics recommended by the CDC.[10] Such topics include HIV and STD transmission and infection prevention, as well as necessary decision-making and communication skills. According to the Guttmacher Institute, a research and policy organization committed to advancing sexual and reproductive health and rights in the United States, fewer teens are being exposed to sex education topics in important and timely ways. 43 percent of female teens and 57 percent of male teens did not receive information about birth control prior to their first sexual experience.[11] It is important to make international comparisons to showcase the strength of sexual and reproductive justice around the world. Adolescents in the United States are being deprived of proper education and exposure that helps them understand themselves and their bodies because of intruding personal beliefs about how large a role sex should play in a society. Eventually, these beliefs become political and divisive when they should instead be accepted as human rights.

Historical Movements

Legal control of women's choice for reproduction began in the nineteenth century. Industrial capitalism is noted as being responsible for lowering the high fertility rate of white women because society was moving away from an agricultural way of life, which depended on ample familial help. Concurrently, the United States became an industrialized nation and a nation of immigrants, which was veering from the status quo of white people who were established in this country for decades. As a result, the declining birth rates of non-immigrant whites prompted a societal response to outlaw contraception and abortion. Higher birth rates of immigrants created movements at the federal and state levels to restrict access to birth regulation in order to coerce more white births. From the state level, U.S. physicians fought to make abortion illegal unless performed by or advised by a physician.[12] The shift in immigrant births led to the deprivation of sexual and reproductive rights while intersecting with nationalism and the preservation of the status quo. Policies that diminished access to birth control were much easier to garner public support for because it used the platform of national security to push a political agenda, which most people agreed was a larger priority, so the loss of individual rights flew under the radar. This is just another example of national precedent that suppressed the growth of sexual and reproductive justice.

10 "What's the State of Sex Education in the U.S," Planned Parenthood, accessed December 9, 2019, https://www.plannedparenthood.org/learn/for-educators/whats-state-sex-education-us.

11 Ibid.

12 Zakiya Luna and Kristin Luker, "Reproductive Justice," *Annual Review of Law and Social Science* 9 (2013): 328–335, https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-lawsocsci-102612-134037.

In the 1860s, Anthony Comstock was a prominent force behind original anti-birth control statutes. As a devout Christian, Comstock was appalled by the city streets that, to him, teemed with prostitutes and pornography. Comstock collaborated with police to provide information for raids on sex trade merchants, thus launching his anti-obscenity crusade. He found advertisements for birth control devices offensive and targeted the contraception industry. In 1872, Comstock independently penned and introduced an anti-obscenity bill to Congress, which included a ban on contraceptives. On March 3, 1873, Congress deemed contraceptives "illicit and obscene" and also criminalized the dissemination of birth control in the mail or across state lines.[13] This act was later known as the Comstock Act, and following official federal implementation, twenty-four states formalized their own versions of the Act with the same purpose: to restrict contraceptive trade at the state level.[14] Additionally, Comstock singlehandedly capitalized on the deplorable reputation of prostitution to push his own agenda. At this time, sexual and reproductive justice lacked societal poise and recognition, so it was much easier to deprive certain rights. Women in particular lacked the political footing to fight this oppression and, collectively, men were not advocating for women's rights. As a result, Massachusetts and Connecticut residents lived under the most restrictive laws. Specifically, in New England, people were fined and imprisoned for disseminating contraceptives or simply sharing information about it. Connecticut's birth control prohibition even meant that married couples could be arrested if they used birth control.[15]

Appalled by these national developments, Margaret Sanger made it her mission to challenge the Comstock Act. In 1916, Sanger, and her partners, Ethel Byrne and Fania Mindell, were arrested for opening the Brownsville Clinic, which was the first birth control clinic in America. Brownsville provided women with information about the female reproductive system and different forms of contraception. Brownsville's work violated the contraception laws at the time and resulted in criminal charges against the three women. Byrne was charged with illegally distributing contraceptive information, Sanger for the establishment of the clinic, and Mindell for distributing information about reproductive health and sexual education. After many appeals, Sanger reached an official decision in the New York State of Appeals.[16]

---

13 "Anthony Comstock's 'Chastity' Laws," WTTW PBS, accessed October 24, 2019, https://www.pbs.org/wgbh/americanexperience/features/pill-anthony-comstocks-chastity-laws/.

14 Ibid.

15 Ibid.

16 Lakshmeeramya Malladi, "The People of the State of New York v. Margaret H. Sanger (1918)," last modified January 1, 2018, https://embryo.asu.edu/pages/people-state-new-york-v-margaret-h-sanger-1918.

In 1918, in the case of *The People v. Sanger*, Judge Frederick Crane ruled that physicians could provide contraceptives to women if they had a medical reason for needing to avoid pregnancy, as this was deemed a public health measure. Judge Crane's decision required birth control clinics to be solely managed by physicians, so Sanger's criminal conviction was justifiable because she was not a physician. His justification rested in protecting the morals of society.[17] Time and time again, men made decisions for women's health and, in turn, women activists were labeled as "radical" or "lawbreakers" based on positive law violations. Judge Crane's decision displays how patriarchal influence attempts to maintain the status quo, specifically pushing a reactionary mentality. During this time, there were more male physicians and judges than there were women, so we can make the argument that the female voice in these policy and legal discussions was virtually absent. The only agenda and perspective being pushed at the time was patriarchal and male in nature and thus inspired some of the repugnant women's health laws existing today. Sanger and her partners put themselves on the line to prevent the erosion of sexual and reproductive rights for all women because, based on precedent, it has been easier to strip away rights than to advocate for them. This action was formative in the push for recognition and rights.

Sexual and Reproductive Justice and Philosophy

The Legality of Sex Work

The combined power of SisterSong's foundation of self-determination, the UDHR's proclamation for the right to non-discrimination, right to life, and security of person are reminiscent of John Locke's commentary in the *Second Treatise*. Locke, commonly known as the "Father of Liberalism," based his philosophy on the premise that people have the right to life, liberty, and property, which formed his conceptions of natural human equality and justice. He believed that humans would naturally preserve themselves and enforce the law of nature. The first thing an individual owns is their body; as a result, they own the work of their body and can claim the fruits of their labor.[18] We can connect this philosophical commentary to the modern-day contemplation of sex as work.

Sex researchers and international sex workers have advocated that sex is a type of labor, but this idea has not successfully permeated mainstream discourse. Anti-prostitution feminists have continued to promote the idea that sex work is risky and a global practice of exploitation that perpetuates male violence against women, normalizing their inherent

17 Ibid.

18 John Locke, "Second Treatise of Government by John Locke," accessed November 16, 2019, https://www.gutenberg.org/files/7370/7370-h/7370-h.htm.

subordination through sexual practice. Anti-prostitution analysts mostly focus on street-based trade, when only 5 to 20 percent of a city's sex industry is made up of street-based trade.[19] The "whore" stigma and ignorance about sex work sustains the misconception that prostitution is simply a woman selling her body to a man for his own pleasure.[20] Pervasive stigmatization of this practice is reflective of the taboo nature of sex that has been embedded in Western society.

Sex-work-as-labor proponents are pushing for decriminalization because it will lead to safer working conditions and less police interference.[21] Sex workers have an interesting relationship with police because they risk arrest for doing their job but lack protection from law enforcement as well. Police are supposed to protect people in times of difficulty, but there are no explicit protections for sex work. If a worker experiences a transgression with a client, their work alone is illegal and lacks support from the law, thus incriminating them as well. Sex as labor practice looks very much like a regular trade for a specific service: negotiation of time, terms, price, and specification of the exact service. Just like other workers in the social service sector, sex workers seldom receive the respect they deserve.[22] Decriminalizing sex work will foster a greater relationship with law enforcement because workers will not work in constant fear of arrest and will view law enforcement as their proponents.

Feminist labor theorists have taken Karl Marx's analogy of prostitution to labor as a way to connect a similar analogy of sex work as labor. Marx's analogy associated prostitution with other forms of labor, deeming it inherently problematic.[23] Feminist labor theorists used his analogy as a way to justify prostitution as labor. This is important to point out because it proves that prostitution is not a new formation, but, as the famed phrase jests, "the oldest profession in the world." Sex as labor is not another twenty-first century, millennial advocacy point, but has been observed as an element of many societies. In Rudyard Kipling's *On the City Wall* (1889), he writes:

> Lalun is a member of the most ancient profession in the world…In the West, people say rude things about Lalun's profession, and write lectures about it, and distribute the lectures to young persons in order that Morality may be preserved. In the East, where the profession is hereditary,

19 Emily van der Meulen, "When Sex is Work: Organizing for Labour Rights and Protections," *Labour/Le Travail* 69, (2012): 149–152, DOI: 10.1353/llt.2012.0033.

20 Anne McClintock. "Sex Workers and Sex Work: Introduction," *Social Text*, no. 37, (1993): 2-3, https://www.jstor.org/stable/466255.

21 Van der Meulen, "When Sex is Work."

22 McClintock, "Sex Workers and Sex Work."

23 Van der Meulen, "When Sex is Work."

descending from mother to daughter, nobody writes lectures or takes any notice.[24]

Kipling implicitly refers to prostitution and compares this practice culturally. The West recognizes sex work, but still refuses to accept it as a true form of labor. The antithetical patriarchal qualities manifest themselves in the circulated literature condemning this labor, criticizing it for its lack of *morality*. These intruding patriarchal concepts, however, do not reach the East and are regarded as natural and part of society. This depicts the subjectivity of prostitution internationally. Perhaps it is not regarded as the most luxurious or enviable job, but there are many established jobs in the labor market that are much less enviable than others. If this is an opportunity that is available for people to make ends meet and has precedent to be afforded the designation of labor, why prohibit it?

Interestingly, while the "whore" stigma contaminates the field of sex work, sex is flagrantly flaunted in Western media through advertisements, movies, and television shows. Americans seem to wipe away the taboo nature of sex when it is for their own entertainment, but when it becomes another person's way of life, it is suddenly problematic. This emphasizes the little respect for sex that Americans have, only deeming it acceptable for leisurely and procreational purposes, but not for health or societal relevance.

Emily van der Muelen conducted a series of interviews with sex workers and allies advocating for a fundamental shift in understanding sex work as labor. They argued that the only way to establish workplace rights and protections in the best interest of the sex worker would have to come from a transformation in the conceptualization of sex work. Justice can be found by recognizing that sex work is a means for individuals to provide for themselves and offer the same types of regulations and protections as other forms of work. At the core of the "sex is work" paradigm sits the decriminalization and removal of prostitution-related offenses.[25]

The Sexual Contract

Carol Pateman, author of *The Sexual Contract*, used contractarian philosophy to explain the element of free exchange between prostitute and customer and described the prostitution contract as any other employment contract. The prostitute owns her property and contracts part of that property in the market. She is not selling herself, or sexual parts, but contracts out her sexual services. Contractarians also believe that people do have a

24 Kipling, Rudyard, "On The City Wall," *University of Adelaide eBooks*, accessed 16 November 2019, https://ebooks.adelaide.edu.au/k/kipling/rudyard/soldiers/chapter27.html.

25 Van der Meulen, "When Sex is Work."

human right to engage in commercial sex.[26]

"Sound prostitution" upholds the freedom of contract and equality of opportunity to any individual who wants to buy or sell services on the market. Prostitution then likens to therapy, social work, or nursing. Pateman interestingly points out that a social acceptance of contractual freedom for the use of one's body will eliminate marriage and will favor the economic arrangement of prostitution because this practice systematizes sex, clearly determining the benefits of the exchange. In marriage, sex is typically not associated with a monetary benefit, so, in comparison, contracted sex trumps marital sex. The only restriction upon these contracts would be the willingness of another party to voluntarily make services available outside of their contracted time.[27]

Carol Pateman expertly emphasizes the various ways in which prostitution is labor but is restricted in settling its roots in the labor market because many people believe this work to be drastically different than established labor. From a contemporary perspective, Hendrik Wagenaar shows that prostitution is viewed as a form of deviancy and "inexplicable within the regular discourse on work, body, and sexuality," raising the question, "how can someone sell her body?"[28] To many, this resembles sex trafficking and, by association, deems it dangerous, repugnant, and immoral. Any means of labor, however, involves corporal affect. Sure, the "product" in sex work may not equate to an inanimate object, but the same goal exists: consumer satisfaction. All workers consent to completing their jobs in the labor market through contractual means, and prostitutes utilize this same process. At what point do we realize that we are invoking double standards here that are restricting freedom for bodily autonomy?

Conceptualizing sex work as labor work finds its footing in the sexual and reproductive justice movement. This movement is setting fair and reasonable standards for members of our society who use sex work as a legitimate way to make ends meet. Opponents would support criminalization to discourage the practice out of safety concern for potential bodily harm and/or the criticism of immoral lifestyle choices, however, we have everyday examples of individuals practicing various forms of hazardous behavior, such as tobacco usage, alcohol consumption, and reckless driving. It begs two questions. First, how has patriarchal influence shaped American society? Second, is this influence preventing freedom and liberty in the United States?

---

26 Carol Pateman, *The Sexual Contract* (California: Stanford University Press, 1988), 190–218.

27 Ibid.

28 Hendrik Weganaar et al., "Designing Prostitution Policy: Intention and Reality in Regulating the Sex Trade," *Bristol University Press Policy Press*, (2017): 29, https://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctt1wf4c8r.5.

Fertility and Abortion Rights

The reproductive justice movement calls for the right to have a child and the right to parent any children an individual has. Reproductive justice demands that the government exercise less interference in an individual's right to freedom, while also ensuring that social justice is maintained to promote human flourishing.[29] Practically, this looks like the government providing the means to maintain a healthy life while allowing individuals to choose to partake in those opportunities as they see fit. If a woman believes that she cannot support a child, it is ultimately her choice to continue to carry the fetus to full-term and should not be the lack of access to an abortion that makes this decision.

During the period between antiabortion and anticontraception laws and their reversion in the 1960s and 1970s, it was well established in medical practice and law that women with private physicians could obtain abortions and contraceptives, with clinical certification declaring that a potential pregnancy will be dangerous to their health.[30] Yet again, we see how reproductive justice is based on access, not choice. Women of color or poor women disproportionately do not have access to private physicians, so an entire demographic is being excluded from this fundamental right. This well-established practice is antithetical to the societal need for bodily autonomy.

While efforts were made to increase the fertility of native-born white women, the proliferation of attempts to deter the fertility of people seen as unfit to produce took place during the first half of the twentieth century. The practice of sterilization, prominent between 1900 and the late 1970s, exists as a repugnant spot in history, legally used by thirty states to prevent individuals deemed as "degenerates" and "hereditarily insane" from procreating.[31] Prior to 1927, criminal and civil sterilization statutes were overturned based on cruel and unusual punishment grounds and due process grounds, respectively. Supreme Court Justice Oliver Wendell Holmes' stated, however, in *Buck v. Bell* (1927):

> It is better for all the world, if instead of waiting to execute degenerate offspring for crime, or to tell them starve for their imbecility, society can prevent those who are manifestly unfit from continuing their kind. The principle that sustains compulsory vaccination is broad enough to cover cutting the Fallopian tubes.[32]

29 Luna and Luker, "Reproductive Justice," 328–335.
30 Ibid., 332.
31 Ibid.
32 Ibid.

The Court majority decided that sterilization was a benefit to the community and to the individual herself. *Buck v. Bell* legitimated eugenic sterilization for civil reasons and led to Carrie Buck's—of *Buck v. Bell*—sterilization. Such laws were not removed from Virginia statutes until 1984.[33]

The continuous struggle to fight for corporeal control has been enduring as reproductive laws were being determined by population control, desired demographic composition, and "assessments" of mental capacity. Justice was found more in the bare biological bones of reproduction, harkening to Darwin-esque theory. Should our reproductive laws be focused purely on the state of the community or based purely in autonomous use of one's body? And should sexual and reproductive justice purely be constructed by male configuration? Justice implies equity and can only achieve this standard if it is formed and enforced with consideration from everyone involved, and in this case, anyone with a body.

Struggle in the 21st Century

One of our modern-day reproductive struggles disputes the constitutionality of the Supreme Court's 1973 decision in *Roe v. Wade*, which declared that a woman's right to choose to have an abortion is a fundamental "right to privacy."[34] Commonly missed by many Americans is the Court's declaration that this fundamental right is balanced by state interest in women's health and the "potentiality of human life."[35] A state law that broadly prohibits abortion without respect to the stage of pregnancy or other interests violates that right. State interest, however, changes over the course of pregnancy, becoming progressively more involved as the pregnancy goes on, and so the law must be flexible as well. During the first trimester, *Roe* states that the state cannot regulate an abortion decision, only the pregnant woman and her attending physician can make that decision. During the second trimester, states can impose regulations related to maternal health. During the third trimester, once considered "viable," a state may regulate abortions or prohibit them entirely. Viability is determined if a fetus can live *ex utero*, survive into the neonatal period and attain "independent moral status." There is no universal gestational age to determine viability, so approximately twenty-four weeks has been determined as viable gestational age in the United States.[36] The laws must also contain exceptions when abortion is necessary to save the life of the mother.[37] The controversy behind this decision comes from the life-for-life

33 Ibid.

34 Oyez, "Roe v. Wade," accessed November 16, 2019, www.oyez.org/cases/1971/70-18.

35 Ibid.

36 Grzegorz H. Breborowicz, "Limits of Fetal Viability and Its Enhancement," *Early Pregnancy* 5, no. 1 (2001): 1, https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/11753511.

37 Oyez, "Roe v. Wade."

argument, where a woman should not take the life of another (fetus) for her own personal gain. This assumes that a fetus is a person with a life and would implicate the mother for murder, hence the "potentiality for life" phrase offered by the court.

In May 2019, the Alabama Senate approved the nation's strictest abortion measure that banned abortions in almost all circumstances, including rape and incest. Designed to challenge *Roe*, Alabama Governor Kay Ivey signed the bill into legislation and remarked that it is a "powerful testament to Alabamians' deeply held belief that every life is precious and that every life is a sacred gift from God."[38] Many states that are conservative on this issue are attempting to do the same in order to challenge *Roe* at the Supreme Court level with the hopes of overturning the precedent. Given the 10th Amendment, states have the right to create laws that are not delegated in the Constitution to only affect their state. *Roe* is legal in all U.S. states, but if it is overturned at the Supreme Court, only states legalizing abortion will provide it, while other states can choose to not. Even if *Roe* were to be overturned, however, women would still have a constitutional right to abortions, vested in her right to privacy. The issue expanded in breadth when states pushed to offer abortions services, yet they did not have any affirmative obligation to do so.[39] As discussed in the *Sanger* case, Crane ruled that providing options for women who had a medical need to avoid pregnancy was a public health concern, and thus we can see where states found their opportunity to involve themselves.

Jessica Shaw, professor of Social Work at the University of Calgary, takes an interesting approach connecting the relationship between birth activism and abortion activism. She explores the idea of de-medicalization of women's health, meaning the need to recognize how the patriarchal ideology has appropriated women's body, usurping their control, and must return power back to women. She specifically refers to the transfer of control from woman to medical professional during the birthing experience. At this time, women are no longer experts of their own needs and are simply bodies, rather than full participants in this process. Shaw reasons that medicalization, defined as the "biomedical tendency to pathologize otherwise normal bodily processes…whereby an expert-based biomedical paradigm dominates discussion of health and frames it in negative ways, usually as illness," views women's pregnancies as conditions to be

38 Emily Wax-Thibodeaux and Chip Brownlee, "Governor signs Alabama abortion ban, which has galvanized support on both sides, setting up a lengthy fight," *Washington Post* (2019): 1, https://www.washingtonpost.com/national/alabama-abortion-ban-galvanizes-support-on-both-sides-sets-up-lengthy-fight/2019/05/15/c60eb9a4-7729-11e9-b7ae-390de4259661_story.html.

39 Luna and Luker, "Reproductive Justice," 333.

treated rather than natural processes.[40] Having control over one's health care decisions is critical, and it is important that women have absolute control over their pregnancies and births in order to have positive birthing experiences.

The common thread of control connects abortion activism to birth activism. Activists for abortion advocate that a women's self-determination is largely defined by having control of her own reproductive health.[41] A woman who chooses to have an abortion—take the life of a fetus—and a woman who chooses a less medicalized birth—choosing to give birth at home—face the same pressure of social stigma and harassment.

Moreover, the pro-choice perspective becomes problematic by utilizing the term "choice" to establish this position. Choice is determined by having available resources and the ability to exercise status, whereas *rights* ought to be benefits accessible by all people. Poor women and women of color suffer the brunt of this dilemma that continues to marginalize them because pro-choice proponents negligently do not consider the social, economic, and political decisions of this so-called choice model.[42] Shaw lists four ways to combat reproductive oppression: abortion must be universally advocated; health services must be of equal access to all; maternal rights must be recognized and legitimated; there must be a better understanding of the relationship between women's empowerment and reproductive health.[43] These four ways expand health care access for all women because the "choice" issue becomes resolved as women's reproductive health is viewed as a general right available to all women universally, offering accessible resources and support without the exclusive barriers.

Transgender Rights

The fight for transgender rights stands as another form of resistance to corporeal control. Based on a fight for identity and self-actualization, individuals strive to be successful and healthy, common needs all humans work to achieve throughout their life. The concept of gender identity is a social construct based on sex and gender stereotypes and has shaped our social and medical view of human beings. Across the world, discussions about transgender people are entering mainstream discourse. The combination of media focus on the transgender community and growing acceptance of transgender identities still does not remove the systemic and societal barriers, including access to health insurance, stigmatization

40 Jessica Shaw, "Full-Spectrum Reproductive Justice: The Affinity of Abortion Rights and Birth Activism," *Studies in Social Justice* (2012): 145–155, https://journals.library.brocku.ca/index.php/SSJ/article/view/1059.

41 Ibid., 155.

42 Ibid., 154.

43 Ibid., 155.

from outsiders, harassment, and violence. Just as poor women and women of color struggle for access to abortion services and contraception, transgender communities, specifically individuals of low socio-economic status and people of color, face many barriers to healthcare access, causing unreasonable burdens to preventable morbidity and mortality.[44]

Recently, Donald Trump's administration has explicitly acted against transgender individuals. The most explicit decisions include the Department of Justice's withdrawal of landmark 2016 guidance detailing school administration efforts to protect transgender students under Federal Title IX law as well as the Administration's plan to discharge transgender military service members.[45]

The reproductive justice movement advocates for transgender-specific healthcare and providing medical students with the appropriate gender-affirming training in order to increase professional competency in healthcare providers.[46] This will help practitioners normalize transgender health so it can be included in their general knowledge and dismantle any bias they may have in their assessments. Diana Feliz Olivia, a Transgender Health Program Manager at St. John's Well Child and Family Center, advocates for reform in the medical community to address transgender social and physical needs through patient-centered models of care.[47] Obstruction of access to healthcare has marginalized transgender individuals because some practitioners hold the view that individuals in this community are difficult or different to care for.

We can connect this to the values of anti-prostitution activists. They believe prostitution is drastically different from regular labor because of its sexual nature and should not be afforded the same rights. Deeming a person's way of life as "different" or "too difficult to understand'' discourages constructive conversation that can help to dispel preconceived notions and propel diversity of thought. When sex is labeled as taboo, not only does it condemn sexual intercourse, but anything related to the use of the body and the control over it. It minimizes the body to an inanimate object instead of embracing it for its myriad organic functions, natural beauty, and inexplicable capabilities. In short, simplifying the intricacies of the body dilutes its power and thus dilutes the power we have over it.

---

44 Diana Feliz Olivia et al., "In transition: ensuring the sexual and reproductive health and rights of transgender populations. A roundtable discussion," *Reproductive Health Matters* 26, no. 52, (2018): 23, https://www.jstor.org/stable/pdf/26605061.pdf?ab_segments=0%252Fbasic_SYC-4222%252Ftest&refreqid=excelsior%3A6404d1f82de881c96ac2ce62e5ecdb57.

45 "Trump's record of action against transgender people," National Center for Transgender Equality, accessed December 11, 2019, https://transequality.org/the-discrimination-administration.

46 Feliz Olivia et al., "In transition."

47 Ibid., 23.

Transgender rights challenge many classical theorists' observations about the attributes of the human body and its articulation into social and political power. Carol Pateman, using contractarian philosophy, points out that classical theorists believe women lack the attributes and capacities of their male counterparts. In effect, sexual difference becomes political difference, creating the determinant between freedom and subjection.[48] The structure of our society and our everyday lives incorporates the patriarchal conception of sexual difference established in gender norms. If we look at men and women in their natural state and already see an inherent power disparity, such as in familial or romantic relationships, the freedom to alter one's gender and sex challenges the social structures in place that determine our political and social power. Suddenly, inherent female disadvantage becomes a fluid and modifiable quality.

Sari L. Reisner, assistant professor in the Department of Epidemiology at the Harvard University T. H. Chan School of Public Health, shifts the conversation from healthcare to gender affirmation in the social sphere. Gender affirmation is the process of being affirmed in one's identified gender identity or expression. Gender affirmation can manifest in four dimensions. Socially, individuals will recognize and use a transgender person's name and pronouns. Psychologically, people will recognize any internalized transphobia they may have to be aware of any difference in treatment they may exhibit towards a transgender person. Medically, transgender people will be able to transition with hormones and surgery. Legally, transgender people can change their name and gender marker on their identification documents. Some transgender individuals medically affirm their gender, while others socially affirm.[49]

The concept of fair and reasonable treatment for transgender individuals is based on the right to your life and body. The identity of an individual should not be vulnerable to outside interference or antithetical societal values. One could argue that the individual autonomy one has over their body is weaker for transgender individuals because it is not solely up to the individual to transition, but that they must be provided with the specific medical care to physically transition, as well as receive acceptance from their community to socially affirm. This argument leaves out one crucial point. Our society has gradually grown to accommodate the needs for different identities, such as the legalization of gay marriage, spaces to celebrate various cultural values, less restrictions on reproduction (i.e. adoption, surrogacy). These developments work to offer resources and choices that were not already part of society to allow groups to enjoy the

48 Pateman, *The Sexual Contract*, 190–218.

49 Sari L. Reisner et al., "Integrated and Gender-Affirming Transgender Clinical Care and Research," *Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes* 72 (2016): 1, https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4969060/.

same rights. If transgender individuals are offered resources to fully enjoy their rights, then they can truly claim autonomy over their body.

The effect of social advocacy, education, and exposure disseminates information and creates discussions to help us recognize other needs. Collectively, LGBTQ+ rights in the U.S. have substantially expanded because the realization occurred that society was neglecting this community and failing to respond to their needs. LGBTQ+ rights in the U.S. are not fully accepted by everyone, but a space has been created for them at the table. The transgender community is part of this coalition but is currently facing many roadblocks to freedom. Expansive accommodations to normalize transgender individuals can help foster greater power in their bodily autonomy. Then, we can create an all-inclusive push for bodily autonomy that frees all individuals stuck in this cage. To get there, we must normalize the topic of sex, be open to different forms of bodily autonomy and transitions, and thus strengthen the sexual and reproductive justice movement.

The Future of the Movement

Healthcare reform in the United States has typically walked on partisan lines. With a divided legislature, conservative lawmakers are trying to dismantle the Affordable Care Act (ACA) and progressive lawmakers are working to expand and extend the ACA in incremental and comprehensive ways.[50] The ACA works to lower out-of-pocket health care costs to make healthcare more affordable. For example, the ACA offers contraceptive coverage which requires new private insurance plans to provide coverage for a wide range of preventive services, such as mammograms and contraceptives without co-payments. This means that women will have "access to oral contraception (the Pill), the shot (Depo-Provera), the ring (NuvaRing)… and permanent contraceptive methods like tubal ligation without paying a co-payment or having the costs applied to her deductible."[51]

The ACA also prohibits discrimination on the basis of sex and includes transgender and gender non-conforming people. This means that any individual and group within the health care system cannot discriminate against "an individual's internal sense of gender…which may be different from an individual's sex assigned at birth."[52] Physicians and insurance

50 Leah H. Heller and Adam Sonfield, "More to Be Done: Individuals' Needs for Sexual and Reproductive Health Coverage and Care," last modified February 28, 2019, https://www.guttmacher.org/gpr/2019/02/more-be-done-individuals-needs-sexual-and-reproductive-health-coverage-and-care.

51 "Contraceptive Coverage in the New Health Care Law: Frequently Asked Questions," National Women's Law Center, accessed February 24, 2020, https://www.nwlc.org/sites/default/files/pdfs/contraceptive_coverage_faq_11.9.11.pdf.

52 "Affordable Care Act Fact Sheet," Transgender Law Center, accessed February 24, 2020, https://transgenderlawcenter.org/resources/health/aca-fact-sheet.

firms can no longer explicitly refuse to work with transgender individuals on the basis of their identity, thus removing barriers to health care access.

The ACA is working towards a more progressive and inclusive society where individuals can feel more comfortable with their bodies and have access to greater reproductive choices. This is an incredible next step because sexual and reproductive health needs are often discounted by policymakers, yet these rights have far-reaching implications for people's overall health. Weak representation at the government level showcases the political sensitivities regarding crucial topics like sexuality, reproductive health, and gender inequality. Although the ACA is not perfect, complete repeal without immediate policy replacement will result in medical catastrophes for many Americans.

The Guttmacher Institute focused on ways to accelerate progress in sexual and reproductive health and rights (SRHR). Their recent report proposes a comprehensive and integrated definition of SRHR and recommends an essential package for SRHR services and information that should be universally available. The package includes an extensive list, such as contraceptive services, abortion care, infertility treatment, and sexual health and wellbeing counseling, to name a few. The cost of meeting all women's needs for contraceptive, maternal, and newborn care comes to an estimated US$9 per capita annually in developing regions. Such an investment would yield enormous returns, from greater access to sexual and reproductive health services, promotion of gender equality, multigenerational benefits to improve children's health and wellbeing, and greater household income.[53]

The fight for sexual and reproductive justice requires strength from financial and social sources. Its' future relies on guaranteeing transparency and accessibility to individuals everywhere. We must reconstruct the values in our society, so the inherent patriarchal values do not predetermine our biological and social lives. Justice is lost when we do not challenge and reform these ideas when our society is yearning for it.

Conclusion

Sexual and reproductive justice promotes autonomy over one's body to provide an individual with the right to have options to determine their course of life. We need to continue to have critical discussions about corporal control, reproductive rights, and affordable health care because this will allow us to see the different needs in every community and the failures to address these issues in our healthcare system. Justice is found when a society devotes their time and resources to seeking the truth and creating

53 Ann M. Starrs et al., "Accelerate progress – sexual and reproductive health and rights for all: report of the Guttmacher-Lancet Commission," *The Lancet* 391, no. 10140, (2018): 2643, https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(18)30293-9.

solutions, and when a government supports the needs of its citizens and grows with the changing society.

As the power of the sexual and reproductive movement continues to grow, it is vulnerable to outside pressure. When new modes of thinking try to permeate the mainstream, people will become uncomfortable. They will be forced to think outside of their “norms” and consider how those ideas may be restricting the freedom of others. It is not an easy transition and those wishing to conserve the “natural” order of things will fight the movement. In order to push our society forward, though, we have to be willing to acknowledge that our world is built on preconceived notions of sex, gender, and sexual orientation. Only then can we see how structured and exclusive our society can be. Differing views in lifestyles are completely natural and necessary for an egalitarian community, however laws and justice need to recognize and address changing social values. If the United States continues to view sex as taboo and conform to old patriarchal values, this will only weaken sexual and reproductive justice, generating more bodily restrictions.

Advocating for less corporeal control begins by analyzing the inherent power structures in place that are obstructing sexual and reproductive autonomy and observing the effects of these restrictions on different communities. Without the infringing social and cultural norms, sex work is just like every other form of labor and exchange, thus sex workers need to have proper labor rights because their profession does put them in vulnerable positions, as does any career that involves bodily work and human interaction. Restrictions on fertility, abortion, and transgender rights prevent individuals from attaining full control over their reproductive organs. The pathway to achieving complete and comprehensive sexual and reproductive justice brings us one step closer to the freedom our nation promises.

Hussite Women:

Fighting More Than the Crusaders

[Anna Hevrdejs]

The *Ninety-five Theses* that Martin Luther posted on the church door in Wittenberg in 1517 have long been seen as the catalyst which caused the many tensions within the Western Catholic Church to burst forth in the Protestant Reformation movement that swept across Europe beginning in the sixteenth century. Despite Luther's famed role, his *Ninety-five Theses* were simply the spark that ignited the Reformation which already had its roots in previous proto-Reformation ideas and movements from across the continent. In particular, the Hussite followers of Jan Hus and Jerome of Prague rose in popularity in the Bohemian and Moravian lands of Central Europe in the late fourteenth and early fifteenth centuries. The Hussites built on reforms by lesser known Czech clerics in the fourteenth century that were embraced by much of the regional population. Following the death of Jan Hus at the stake at the Council of Constance in 1415, the region descended into religious turmoil until the failure of the fifth and sixth crusades declared against the Hussites throughout the 1430s.

As much of the social structure defined by the Church collapsed amid the shifting religious ideas that characterized the period, many women began to play greater roles in both religious and temporal society. I contend that despite the semi-fanciful tales of female warriors fighting on the battlefield, the nature of this period gave Hussite women the chance to champion other social battles—such as public preaching and social reforms—and experience a degree of equality. That these women later returned to traditional roles only emphasizes the powerful pressures of the primary roles which had been expected of them before the Hussite Revolution. This relative glimmer of female emancipation, strengthened by cultural depictions of strong women, was eventually snuffed out; however, these women had experienced a level of freedom *en masse* that many European women would not experience again until the nineteenth century and beyond.

To explore the various roles that women played in the years leading up to the Hussite Revolution, we will examine documents from Early Reformation scholar Thomas A. Fudge's anthology of sources, which contains papal bulls against the Hussites, records of military campaigns, Hussite manifestos, song lyrics, and letters from the time of the first crusade against the Hussites in Prague in 1420. I will focus mostly on the

sparse mentions of women in these documents and use the extensive work of John M. Klassen, a scholar of medieval gender and Christianity, to examine women's roles in the extended period of the Hussite movement. Then, I will briefly touch on the traditional role of the female victim, which is often associated with women during violent clashes, before discussing in more depth the religious and social reform roles which a variety of women took upon themselves during this period. Last, I will cover the famous, if limited, military involvement of Hussite women.

The traditional experience of women in war has long been a vulnerable and precarious one with women as a symbol of the home and often the inspiration or the emotional reason for men to continue fighting. That women's bodies have been considered as both sacred and symbolic for many cultures implies that the practice of capturing the enemy's women is symbolic of capturing the anchors of the home and thus, of their society.[1] The violation of women's bodies during war through sexual assault, too, can be seen as a way of destroying this sanctity that each opposing side wishes to protect.[2] Yet, the motives for such violations were often simply unbridled lust and obsession with the power experienced amid the violence of these wars. The declaration that any person who adhered to Hussite beliefs or had any sympathies for Hussites was a heretic also allowed further justification for such violence in the minds of crusading armies as it was directed against people who were no longer considered Christian. Crusading armies treated non-Christians and heretics as sub-humans because of the common, pervasive imageries against them. This attitude easily justified the practice of violence against civilian populations—especially women—as seen in the various anthologized letters and records which note the "abominable acts" women experienced.[3]

While many Hussite women were certainly involved in the social and religious movement in different ways, the vulnerability of both female bystanders and active participants in a battle or siege unfortunately meant that many were victims of sexual violence. The majority of records refer to "many abominable acts…committed against young girls and wives… [who] were treated so villainously that it is awful even to write about it!"[4] A similar threat is recorded in the following passage from a general account of the conquest of towns deemed heretical by the papally-approved crusading armies. The passage attempts to appeal to the Republic of Venice for an alliance against the Holy Roman Emperor and King of

1 Kylie Alexandra, "War, Society, and Sexual Violence: A Feminist Analysis of the Origin and Prevention of War Rape," *HOHONU* 8 (2010): 18.

2 Ibid.

3 Thomas A. Fudge, *The Crusade Against Heretics in Bohemia, 1418–1437* (Aldershot, England: Ashgate Publishing Ltd., 2002), 63.

4 Ibid.

Bohemia, Sigismund. The diplomats note that Sigismund has shown "himself to be an open enemy of the realm and all of its citizens,…He leads the Hungarians and Germans…whose impious hands are soiled with the blood of virgins, infants, pregnant women, and men."[5] Therefore, though women took part in roles other than their traditional domestic ones during the extended Hussite uprising and defense, it must be acknowledged that the conventional threat to themselves and their bodies remained very real.

While the conventional wartime violence against women is clearly documented, we also have documents that note the active role many women had in the changing society emerging from a wide array of reform suggestions. Though there was a body of women who went out and either fought personally in the battles against the crusaders or supported male soldiers by adopting traditional female roles as army followers, we will discuss these women further below. We must first explore the experience of female religious figures and their role as Hussite reformers. The eighteenth of the twenty-four papal resolutions against the Hussite heretics published by the Council of Constance in 1418 states: "Preaching by women and the laity should be prohibited entirely and [violators] ought to be punished."[6] Such a statement from the Catholic church implies that women were involved deeply enough in the movement and reform of the Hussites that the Catholic Church felt the need to address the heretical nature of their involvement. These women preached and promoted Catholic doctrines that the Hussites agreed with such as utraquism—communion in both forms, or bread and wine—for the laity and not simply bread. The sense that the papacy felt the need to formally reject permission to women preaching, and preaching in the vernacular, implies that these women existed in the movement in large numbers.

While these particular primary sources have little more to say about the existence of female religious figures and preaching, the central role of religious reform in the Hussite movement makes it clear we must discuss women's religious experiences of this period. To do this, we will examine what Klassen's scholarship on Hussite women reveals about female participation in the doctrinal reforms of this movement. By the death of Hus in 1415, the long-established group of female religious, the Beguines, had already started practicing Christianity in a way which mostly agreed with Hus' message of clerical poverty, humility, and religious debate.[7] The strong presence of the Beguines and their houses of lay followers in Prague included their leading role in public debates over Scripture and other religious matters.[8] In this way, the Beguines were not only aligning

5 Ibid., 72.

6 Ibid., 20.

7 John M. Klassen, "Women and Religious Reform in Late Medieval Bohemia," *Renaissance and Reformation* 5, no. 4 (1981): 205.

8 Ibid.

themselves with a newer reformer who was under immediate threat from the Church, but they were using their status as a lay order to go against the traditional cloistering of female religious. This, perhaps, was what made female preaching so threatening—the direct female affront to papal authority—as the Beguines did not formally ask permission to continue preaching the way they had been for two centuries. That the Beguines joined the Hussites in debate and sympathized with their doctrines, meant that these women were not simply outside of papal authority, but they were also involved with those who formally rejected papal authority when the Pope rejected their requested reforms. Other women were attracted to the newer and more radical branches of Hussitism, especially the Taborites.[9] Some of these Taborite doctrines particularly influenced some of the women's extreme reactions in the midst of and following battles, as we will see when we discuss Hussite warrior women and female fighters.

Among the most famous roles which some Hussite women took upon themselves was that of becoming soldiers and defending Czech villages and cities. They fought alongside the majority male armies against the crusading armies that threatened their land, people, and reform movement. We see evidence of this female military participation in a 1420 letter to the Duke of Bavaria in which the Margrave of Meißen told of the crusaders who "took 156 prisoners, women who had fixed their hair like men and had girded themselves with swords, with stones in their hands, wearing boots. Among these were some high-born."[10] While scholars have long debated whether these stories of women fighting "in the military gear of men" are, in fact, true, and if true, how prevalent were they among the Hussites, the consensus is that Hussite women did fight, but many did not dress as male soldiers.[11] Such dress was expensive and not always available when women needed to fight, since many female warriors were peasant women who were either thrown into defending their towns, as told in the account of the Battle of Vítkov where "two women, with one girl and twenty-six men…offered brave resistance hurling stones and thrusting with spears…[in an attempt to] repulse [the invaders]."[12] That one "possessed no armour" but still "stood valiantly refusing to yield a single step saying that no faithful Christian must retreat from [the] Antichrist…[until she] breathed her last," emphasizes that these women did not just fight to defend their land and lives against those with the papal authority to kill them where they stood—they fought zealously for the Hussite reforms and participated in the utraquist mass which followed the battle.[13]

9 Ibid., 207.
10 Fudge, *The Crusade Against Heretics in Bohemia*, 73.
11 Ibid., 73.
12 Ibid., 77–78.
13 Ibid., 78.

Such women did not simply fight when called upon; they also worked in other roles which contributed to the Hussite defense against and rebuttal of all five Catholic crusades waged against them. Again, we see this in the account of the Battle of Vítkov where the famous blind commander Jan Žižka ordered the reinforcement of a defensive bulwark at Vítkov which was undertaken by "a large number of women, girls and laypeople from Prague."[14] These were women who saw themselves as civilians, but were willing to help the Hussite armies and their cause. In addition to the building and maintaining of defenses, many women became traditional army followers to provide such services as cooking, laundry, and medical care for the wounded.[15] These women often travelled in the portable *wagenburg*, or "wagon castles," a caravan of army wagons which could quickly wrap around itself to create a defensible position from which to fight.[16] Thus, many of these women were in the midst of battle whether they took on a fighting role or not.[17] Thus, women were not only participating in the uprising by cross-dressing, but also aiding the cause through their vital role in regular army support.

The involvement of women in these battles, and the wide array of roles women had in the Hussite Revolution—especially as lay religious, warriors, and army followers—was relatively unusual for the time. These women had more opportunities to participate in civil, religious, and military society due to the nationalistic overtones of the Hussite Revolution, which included an emphasis on the Czech language and culture of the German "invaders." Klassen argues that this influence of nationalist sentiment and preference for Czech traditions allowed the ascent of the mythical founding story of the Czechs in Central Europe.[18] While Klassen notes Petra Kellermann-Haaf's argument that "warring women were a reality in the middle ages…[and the chroniclers] referred to real women engaged in actual combat,"[19] they were often underrepresented due to the various chroniclers rejecting their role in defying the traditional non-violent and passive roles of women. Chroniclers included direct or passing comments in letters such as that sent to the Margrave of Meißen as well as official Church historians who were unwilling to recognize the female role in religious activities, much less in reforms they condemned.

The story of Libuše, a mythical eighth-century princess who was

14 Ibid., 79.

15 Hannesjoachim Wilhelm Koch, *Medieval Warfare* (London: Bison Books, 1978), 166–167.

16 Ibid.

17 Ibid.

18 John M. Klassen, *Warring Maidens, Captive Wives, and Hussite Queens: Women and Men at War and at Peace in Fifteenth Century Bohemia* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999), 22.

19 Ibid.

chosen as the next ruler of the Czech lands, emphasizes the familiarity of strong female warriors in the general consciousness. Libuše's tale was expanded in the fourteenth century to fulfill the political need of supporting a noblewoman's claim to her family inheritance over the claim of a male outsider.[20] To support this female claim with an empowering tale, the myth of Libuše came to include a battle waged by her female second-in-command, Vlasta, against those men who repudiated Libuše after her death.[21] This popular tradition of a pair of strong female antecedents in the Czech lands was likely a unifying force that inspired a level of acceptance of women's greater roles in society and justified the embracement of women who became warriors. The tale of Libuše suggests a level of agency among Czech women by the fifteenth century, which made their roles in the Revolution much less shocking, if still novel, in their society.

As these diverse sources show, Bohemian and Moravian women engaged in society in many ways during the Hussite Revolution and had an impressive level of emancipation during the social upheaval surrounding the religious reform and resulting strife with the Catholic Church. Despite the oft-exaggerated tales of female warriors fighting on the battlefield, these women did fight, both in the military and in other social battles. While women were still as vulnerable to capture, rape, and death as they had been for centuries, women also took on more religious roles, as the Hussites and their various theological branches allowed room for lay female preaching in the vernacular. This opportunity to not be cloistered as a religious order gave women such as the Beguines in Prague more opportunity for their voices to be heard in the vibrant religious debates of the time. In addition to increasingly public religious roles, women also contributed to the defense against the crusading armies as warriors, nurses, army followers, and local populations. This relative agency, especially when compared with the lives of many women in Western Europe, was a moment in history where women began to become as involved in society as they had ever been, supported by nationalistic myths of the strong female progenitor of the Czechs, Libuše. Despite these opportunities, many women did maintain their traditional roles as wives and mothers, briefly creating a society of choice for many women. That women eventually resumed their previous gendered roles did not mean that they had lost all progress in society; however, even as these roles became more restrictive again, the uneasy reconciliation between the Hussites and the Church allowed an unprecedented level of religious freedom and expression in the region. Thus, while women gained social agency and then lost the majority of it, they retained the freedom to believe as they liked without threat of persecution—a freedom which would not emerge in the rest of Europe until Luther.

20 Ibid., 14.
21 Ibid.

Hatshepsut:

The Powerful Female Pharoah

[Alicia Maynard]

Hatshepsut was a powerful pharaoh who ruled in the Eighteenth Dynasty. Her rule was an era of peace and prosperity, during which time, Egypt flourished and grew in power. Hatshepsut was the daughter of the pharaoh Thutmose I and was married to the succeeding pharaoh, Thutmose II. When Thutmose II died, she was appointed regent for her nephew and stepson, Thutmose III. In approximately the seventh year of Thutmose III's "reign" and her own regency, Hatshepsut took the title of pharaoh and the powers and privileges conferred with it. However, Hatshepsut also faced a litany of issues due to her gender and due to the ethno-cultural norms she both upheld and transgressed.[1] The question to be asked then is, how did Hatshepsut shape and legitimize her reign in view of her gender and in relation to her ethno-cultural boundaries? I will examine how she legitimized her reign in light of her gender and how she used her ethno-cultural norms, common to the Eighteenth Dynasty pharaohs, to accomplish this action. Hatshepsut modified these practices and incorporated additional ones to suit her situation. An important facet of these adaptations was how she substantiated her rule through art, with particular regard to her own depictions as pharaoh. These modifications were also particularly evident with regard to her travels to Punt, her projects concerning infrastructure, and her relationship with the cult of Amun.[2] Essentially, Hatshepsut both followed and manipulated the established practices of Eighteenth Dynasty pharaohs to legitimize and found her reign.

To understand how Hatshepsut used and contravened the ethno-cultural limits of her society, one must understand the norms of the Eighteenth Dynasty pharaohs. The Eighteenth Dynasty pharaohs had

1 By ethno-cultural norms, I mean the accepted and typical customs relating to a particular ethnic group's culture.

2 Amun, also known in the Eighteenth Dynasty as Amun-Ra, the creator and the sun; the king of all the gods. However, Egyptian gods tended to be rather fluid in their aspects. Their attributes and names often changed over time.

three key aspects of their reign. Firstly, they were usually warrior pharaohs, as opposed to simply being living gods; they were no longer just the physical manifestation of the divine, but the actual and incarnate hand of the particular god's will. They had turned from being passive objects, to dynamic actors. These warrior kings based their rule on expansionist policies and practices, thus creating a new method of rule which was very different from that of the Middle Kingdom.[3]

Secondly, these pharaohs had a specific purpose for their rule. Once again, they could no longer be passive. They had active duties and objectives which had to be fulfilled. The most important of these duties was the unification of Egypt through the protection and benefit of the populace. This concept is vital to my third point.

Thirdly, the pharaoh had to support the preeminence of the cult of Amun. In honouring this cult, the pharaoh gave gold, tribute, and buildings to the god in gratitude for successes, thus bettering the overall status of the empire and the people.[4] In addition, the pharaoh cultivated a deep and personal relationship with the god. In this relationship the pharaoh became the god's son, in addition to being the physical embodiment of the god, and of his divine will.[5] This connection was essential to the pharaoh's position as the rightful ruler of Egypt.[6] Hatshepsut utilized these methods and conventions to cement her reign. She both realized and altered the ethno-cultural practices of the Eighteenth Dynasty pharaohs to better suit her own personal and specific needs. In an almost alchemical process, Hatshepsut managed to use the traditional methods of conferring rule in a new and untraditional way which, nevertheless, still bestowed power and authority.

Another typical aspect of pharaonic power which Hatshepsut used greatly to her advantage was the language of art and statuary. This subtle form of communication was not so much a value of the Eighteenth Dynasty pharaohs, as their military prowess, language of unification, or devotion to Amun was, but was rather a standard feature and system of expression of their rule. It was Hatshepsut who made these designs extraordinary through her use and alteration of them. The pharaohs always had traditional methods of art which had conventional symbols and motifs expressing the fact that they were pharaoh and, with this portrayal, their privilege and power of rule. Hatshepsut, in her typical fashion, then transformed this innocuous and mundane expression of rule into a revolutionary expression of her assumption of royal pharaonic power. Quintessentially, she used

3 Phil Sheppard, "New Kingdom Egypt," Phil Sheppard Video Production, 2010, 6.48.

4 Tribute, meaning general gifts and valuables given to the god Amun.

5 Phil Sheppard, "New Kingdom Egypt," 7.40, 8.50.

6 Ibid., 5.00.

statues and other artistic portrayals of herself as a male pharaoh to further legitimize and affirm her position as a female pharaoh.[7]

This aforementioned strategy has engendered an enormous amount of debates concerning the connotations of Hatshepsut's change of garb, as she exchanged her queen's dress and vulture crown, for the uniform of a pharaoh complete with pleated kilt, crook, flail, fake beard, and headdress. Some have argued that this shift indicates that Hatshepsut did not consider herself a woman—rather, she thought of herself as a combination of man and woman, or a man. However, it is known that Hatshepsut was biologically female, as she did have a child. Everyone at court had known her since childhood so it is highly unlikely that she was attempting to obscure the fact that she was a woman. Further evidence that Hatshepsut still saw herself as a woman was her continued use of female pronouns, despite her new form of portrayal. This fact, far from crippling her efforts, awarded her even greater power as it allowed her to take on the features of female goddesses, such as names and specific female characteristics, something which male pharaohs could not do, and which allowed Hatshepsut to be both king and queen.[8] Additionally, according to Professor Uros Matić, the system of gender in Egypt was a primarily binary system, though this established structure did not mean different gender expressions were forbidden or even penalized. Moreover, Matić argues that this tradition more likely indicated a certain type of divine being or a divine interaction even though there was a tradition of portraying individuals with both masculine and feminine features.[9]

Through assuming the garb of pharaoh, it is much more likely that Hatshepsut was appropriating the official garments in order to demonstrate that she was taking control of this type of pharaonic power. These clothes were not a simple outfit; they were a uniform which conferred the authority, power, and majesty of the pharaoh's position. They had less to do with assuming a gender identity, and more with assuming a new royal status and rank. These statues, displayed all over the empire, were a traditional expression of authority and it was their garb which held the power and station. This shift was the ritual representation of a new position.[10]

Even before Hatshepsut, women played an important role in the royal traditions of the Eighteenth Dynasty. Significantly, this dynasty

---

7 Artistic portrayals specifically refers to reliefs in temples and tombs.

8 Gay Robins, "The Names of Hatshepsut as King," *The Journal of Egyptian Archaeology*, no. 85 (1999): 106, 111.

9 Uros Matić, "Gender in Ancient Egypt: Norms, Ambiguities, and Sensualities," *Near Eastern Archaeology* 79, no. 3 (2016): 177.

10 Uros Matić, "(De)queering Hatshepsut: Binary Bind in Archaeology of Egypt and Kingship Beyond the Corporeal." *Journal Archaeological Method Theory,* no. 23 (2016): 819.

was already replete with powerful women such as Ahhotep and Queen Ahmose Nefertary.[11] Many of the pharaohs in this dynasty died young, leaving immature heirs and a space for powerful female reagents. As Matić states: "This means that women in the roles of kings' mothers or queen regents ruled Egypt for almost half of the seventy years before Hatshepsut."[12] Furthermore, it was the matrilineal line which conferred royal power and passed on the royal lineage.[13] In addition, by this point, a female consort had become an imperative. The idea of both a pharaoh and a female consort had become an important and central concept of Amun's balance and of Maat.[14]

Despite Hatshepsut's many powerful female predecessors, it was still highly unusual and vaguely scandalous for a woman to declare herself pharaoh, especially in light of the fact the Thutmose III had already been crowned. Due to these circumstances, a great deal of Hatshepsut's efforts had to be expended securing and cementing her own rather precarious position.[15] She lacked manhood—one of the most basic aspects that was usually necessary to be pharaoh—and as a result, many of her later actions were taken in an attempt to compensate for this "deficiency." Hatshepsut, despite this "set back," was a highly competent ruler; however, she needed to make sure that her subjects saw her as such in order to function properly and without serious threat.

In her aim to assert herself as the pharaoh of Egypt, Hatshepsut used many of the traditional ethno-cultural methods of her Eighteenth Dynasty forebears in her own unconventional manner. First, she fulfilled the dictates of a warrior pharaoh by expanding Egypt's reach. Not by military conquests, though she did lead several campaigns in Nubia, Syria, and the Levant, but by trade.[16] This trading expedition was also fundamental to her accomplishing Egyptian unity, and to her devotions to the Cult of Amun. These trading relationships incorporated one of the most central and important aspects of Hatshepsut's affirmation of her reign, namely, her expedition to Punt. This expedition was the foundation on which she secured and anchored her reign and her assumption of power.

Punt was an ancient quasi-mythical kingdom abounding with rich treasures, such as gold, ivory, exotic animals, and most centrally, incense trees, among many other treasures. The location of Punt is debated in

11 Dimitri Laboury, "How and Why Did Hatshepsut Invent the Image of Her Royal Power?," in *Creativity and Innovation in the Reign of Hatshepsut: Papers From the Theban Workshop 2010*, ed. José Manuel Galán, Betsy Morrell Bryan, and Peter F. Dorman (Chicago: The Oriental Institute of the University of Chicago, 2014), 86.

12 Matić, "(De)queering Hatshepsut," 814.

13 Sheppard, "New Kingdom Egypt," 10.50.

14 Maat was the goddess of truth and balance.

15 Laboury, "How and Why," 50; Sheppard, "New Kingdom Egypt," 20.8.

16 Sheppard, "New Kingdom Egypt," 22.58.

the scholarly community, and its true geographical position remains unconfirmed. Punt had been an ancient trading partner of the Egyptians, dating back to the time of the Pharaoh Khufu, during a much earlier dynasty, and perhaps even proceeding this pharaoh.[17] However, as time had passed and confusion broke out during the Second Intermediate Period (1800 BCE to 1570 BCE), contact with Punt had been lost.[18] A central reason as to why Hatshepsut's Punt expedition held so much symbolic significance was that, through this mission, she reestablished an old and revered trading route and with it a connection to Egypt's traditions and past. In successfully completing her mission, she was establishing herself to be worthy of her position, her god, Amun, and of her forebears.[19]

Though Hatshepsut had already declared herself pharaoh, the Punt expedition allowed her to truly cement her power and demonstrate her strength. This journey increased trade and brought a great amount of wealth to Egypt. During this expedition, many exotic luxuries were brought back, including many new and intriguing wild animals as clearly demonstrated by the relief on the wall of her mortuary temple. The most prominent and the most important of these spoils however, were the live Frankincense trees which she transplanted back to Egypt, in addition to the many other aroMatićs.[20] This mission, though it accrued the same amount of glory and prestige as a military victory, was focused entirely on trade and was in no way a military conflict.[21]

Furthermore, the expedition helped Hatshepsut to build relationships with the people of Punt. Compelling evidence for this relationship is, once again, provided by the relief in her mortuary temple. One panel of this relief depicts the queen and king of Punt, along with some of their royal attendants. However they are not portrayed in the traditional Egyptian style, but rather in a more emotive and realistic depiction, with very few Egyptian attributes.[22] Yet, another panel which renders the king and queen of Punt after their peaceful interactions with the Egyptians shows the queen in

17 This dynasty extended from approximately 2613–2498 BCE.

18 The Second Intermediate Period was a time of great upheaval and unrest. During this time there were many different dynasties, including the Hyksos dynasty.

19 Joshua J. Mark, "Punt," *Ancient History Encyclopedia*, last modified August 1, 2011. https://www.ancient.eu/punt/.

20 Frankincense is an aromatic used to create incense and perfumes used in embalming and other religious practices. It was extremely valuable in the ancient world. These trees would have spawned new trees, in addition to providing the Egyptians with valuable aromatics and wood. Punt Relief Copy, (Hatshepsut's Temple), Royal Ontario Museum, Toronto, ON, Canada (15th century BCE); Sheppard, "New Kingdom Egypt," 23.48.

21 Sheppard, "New Kingdom Egypt," 24.20.

22 The traditional Egyptian style was slim tall bodies, long white dresses, and jeweled collars and hairstyles for royal women and a specific hairstyle with a linen kilt for royal men.

new Egyptian dress and shows the king and their attendants with new Egyptian attributes.[23] This change clearly indicates there was then a distinct relationship between these two cultures. Through the image of the Puntians taking on Egyptian fashions, Hatshepsut was showing how, not only had she established a relationship with this rich foreign land, but that the occupants of that land were in some ways submitting to the Egyptians and identifying with them.

The success the expedition accrued and the riches it brought back also helped to enrich Egypt's infrastructure and, in so doing, helped to create unity. Hatshepsut built relationships through her allocations of persons to oversee the expedition and through her distribution of goods on the expedition's return. She was also able to use the wealth and riches she gained on this trip to fund the building of new structures and temples which furthered her cause of bringing unity to Egypt.[24] In doing this, she also employed the use of very specific rhetorical strategies which were designed and formed to help further the unification process.[25]

Hatshepsut also made good use of her distribution of Puntian treasure, particularly the aromatics, when it came to the Cult of Amun. She gave the temple of Amun massive gifts stating that all the glory of the venture was due to Amun, as he himself had ordered this expedition and had brought about its success. These gifts and honours had the dual purpose of gaining her the support of the Temple of Amun and legitimizing her own position.[26] The Cult of Amun was particularly important in Hatshepsut's legitimization of her reign. One of the ways she utilized this advantage was in a myth, which she popularized, concerning her conception and birth. According to this legend Amun made a specific decision to beget Hatshepsut and so took the form of Thutmose I so that he could have relations with Hatshepsut's mother, thus creating Hatshepsut through divine conception.[27] Furthermore, in this legend, there was a prophecy in which Amun stated his intention to create a daughter who was destined to rule Egypt.[28]

However, Hatshepsut went even further than promulgating this myth, stating that she was commanded and guided directly by Amun because of her deep and personal relationship with him. In this idea, she declared

23 Punt Relief Copy, (Hatshepsut's Temple).

24 Pearce Creasman, "Hatshepsut and the Politics of Punt," *African Archaeological Review* 31, no. 3 (2014): 401–40.

25 Susanne Bickel, "Worldview and Royal Discourse in the Time of Hatshepsut," in *Creativity and Innovation in the Reign of Hatshepsut: Papers From the Theban Workshop 2010*, ed. José Manuel Galán, Betsy Morrell Bryan, and Peter F. Dorman (Chicago: The Oriental Institute of the University of Chicago, 2014), 29.

26 Creasman, "Hatshepsut and the Politics of Punt," 398–9.

27 Sheppard, "New Kingdom Egypt," 20.25.

28 Ibid., 20.44.

that, because of her particular connection to him, it was she alone who truly knew his heart and his mind.[29] This connection acted to legitimize her further, as she was claiming a direct knowledge of a deity. She also used many phrases to demonstrate the high level of intimacy shared between her and Amun, giving herself many titles in which she is directly connected to Amun. These titles changed as her own position changed, but always kept the feminine pronoun. This use of titles was also in keeping with the ethno-cultural traditions of the Eighteenth Dynasty pharaohs as they also took similar titles, usually "the son of Amun" giving them political power.[30] Hatshepsut did the same thing, though while maintaining her own gender and pushing this connection further than ever before.

Hatshepsut also used her male relatives to help substantiate her own power. Despite the fact that royal power passed through the matrilineal line, and she was born of a queen, Hatshepsut still needed a male connection to legitimize her own control. As her position changed, so did the relation she drew power from. During her time as reagent, she drew authority from her nephew/stepson Thutmose III. This connection is apparent from reliefs and statues where they are often portrayed together, though Hatshepsut always took precedence in both prominence and number. During her pre-coronation period, Hatshepsut drew prestige primarily from her deceased husband, Thutmose II, showing them together and in great amity. During the period after her assumption of the throne she was often portrayed by herself, and later, she is seen with both Thutmose I and III.[31] This portrayal was another way in which Hatshepsut validated her reign. Through acting through her powerful male relatives, she was acting within the ethno-cultural bounds of the Eighteenth Dynasty tradition. However, these actions were necessitated due to her gender and the unconventional role it placed her in, as it broke the confines of her ethno-cultural bounds.

Hatshepsut was faced with many challenges as a female pharaoh. However, she ultimately used the ethno-cultural tools and customs of the Eighteenth Dynasty pharaohs to legitimize her own reign, using their practices to her own advantage. Hatshepsut accomplished the same and more, through her hugely successful Puntian expedition, as the warrior pharaohs did through their conquests. She brought great unity through her careful choices and through the wealth acquired from her excursions to Punt. Additionally, she enriched and gained power from the Cult of Amun, enhancing it with her own connections and through the valuable goods from Punt. She also expertly used the art and symbolic depictions of the period to further legitimize her reign, working within the conventions of her

29 Bickel, "Worldview and Royal Discourse," 24–8.

30 Roger Dunn, "Hatshepsut: A Female King of Egypt and Her Architecture," *Bridgewater Review* 20, no. 2 (2001): 10.

31 Laboury, "How and Why," 85.

ethno-cultural limits to legitimize her distinctly unconventional rule.

In assuming power, Hatshepsut broke with royal tradition in naming herself pharaoh. This action led her to use both conventional and unconventional methods to validate and maintain her throne. Her rule was particularly prosperous and, despite much speculation, the consensus that she died of natural causes supports the idea that she was a highly competent pharaoh, as incompetent rulers, in the ancient world, were typically murdered.[32] These facts did not protect her memory however; for reasons, such as fear of another female pharaoh, a later ruler, attempted to destroy her memory, erasing every trace of her being.[33] They failed in this attempt however—Hatshepsut is known and will continue to be studied and lauded. She is a bright symbol for many women today, exemplifying strength in the face of sexism and adversity and serving as a testament to just how powerful a woman can be.

32 It is postulated that Hatshepsut died of diabetes.

33 It used to be thought that, in a fit of vengeance, Thutmose III tried to erase Hatshepsut's memory; however, newer research suggests that Thutmose III did not in fact hate his aunt, and the desecration was caused by a later ruler.

[critiques of popular culture]

Making and Breaking a Heroine:

Cultural Disparity in *Mulan*

[Tam Nguyen]

The concept of the hero is one that has existed for as long as the art of storytelling has been around and is a component of many human cultures. It is one of the strongest "fairytale" archetypes, often embodying every characteristic that a given culture values and conveniently wrapped up in one ideal figure: an object of admiration and aspiration.[1] Every group and era in human history has had its heroes or heroines who have gone down in history as the shining stars of those groups, conquering adversaries through wit, cunning, and strength; winning the hearts of strangers they meet through hard work, kindness, and "correct behavior."[2] Families and communities pass down hero stories and legends to remind their descendants of what makes a hero—what makes up the best person. A well-known heroine of Asia is Hua Mulan, the Chinese girl warrior who risked her life in order to protect her father's. Her story, originally told in the form of a ballad, was animated in Disney's 1998 feature film *Mulan*. However, what arises in Disney's retelling is not the bold Asian woman who joined the army in place of her father, but, by Disney's hand, the girl who abandons the Chinese tradition of filial piety in favor of living through individualism, a Western ideal. Still, Mulan's situation is recognizable for first- and second-generation Asian immigrants to America due to its timely release in the late twentieth century following a dramatic increase in Asian immigration to the United States. The subtle racism and whitewashing in *Mulan* causes the film adaptation to lose some of the cultural significance of the original ballad and permanently modifies Mulan to reflect more Western values. This essay will discuss the original "Ballad of Mulan," the history and significance of cross-dressing in Chinese culture, the liberties that Disney took in *Mulan* to alter history and distort Chinese history, and

1 Benjamin S. Keefer, "Go The Distance: The Hero's Journey," *Prologue: A First-Year Writing Journal* 58, no. 3 (2016): 8.

2 Molly Kaushal, "Crossing Seven Seas: The Hero's Quest in Oral Narratives," *India International Centre Quarterly* 30, no. 3/4 (2003): 57.

finally, the impact that *Mulan* has on bridging the gap between tradition and coming of age.

The "Ballad of Mulan," a poem composed in the style of a folk song, first appeared between the fifth and sixth centuries CE in the Southern and Northern Dynasties in China at a time when the Northern sector was engaged in a series of wars against foreign invaders.[3] The narrative unfolds in fourteen stanzas, telling of an "ordinary young woman who rises under extraordinary circumstances in order to spare her father the hardship and danger of fighting in the war."[4] In the ballad, the only reason given for Mulan's desire to serve in the army is to make sure that her father does not. She disguises herself as a man and fights for ten years, after which she declines the emperor's offer of a high official position, choosing instead to come home and resume life as before. After she returns home and puts on her old clothes, she reveals herself to be a woman to her fellow soldiers, who are stunned that her secret had never come out in the entire decade of serving together.[5]

Disney's cartoon retelling was released in 1998, starring Ming-Na Wen, Lea Salonga, Eddie Murphy, BD Wong, Donny Osmond, Soon-Tek Oh, Pat Morita, and James Hong.[6] The film opens with the Huns, led by Shan-Yu, executing an attack on the Great Wall of China and declaring war on the emperor; elsewhere, a young woman named Mulan prepares for her matchmaking, which later turns out to be a complete disaster. When a decree calling one man from every family arrives in the village, Mulan does fear for her elderly father. She makes the decision to dress as a man, naming herself Ping, and takes her father's place in the army. At first, she is ostracized and clearly does not fit in, but with time she earns acceptance and her place among them. Soon enough, they encounter the Huns and although they seemingly defeat them in a huge upset, Mulan is discovered to be a woman and the army abandons her. However, she finds that Shan-Yu and some of the Huns are still alive and are plotting to attack the Imperial City. With her quick wits, Mulan and the soldiers fight off and destroy Shan-Yu, saving the emperor. She is hailed by all as the savior of China and returns home a heroine, a relationship budding between her and Captain Li Shang.

A discussion on this film would be remiss without first noting that Disney is a gargantuan multibillion-dollar media company and no stranger

3 Feng Lan, "The Female Individual and the Empire: A Historicist Approach to Mulan and Kingston's Woman Warrior," *Comparative Literature* 55, no. 3 (2003): 231; Jinhua Li, "Mulan (1998) and Hua Mulan (2009)," in *Heroism and Gender in War Films,* eds. Karen A. Ritzenhoff and Jakub Kazecki (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014), 187–205.

4 Li, "Mulan and Hua Mulan," 188.

5 Ibid.

6 *Mulan*, DVD, directed by Tony Bancroft and Barry Cook (1998; USA: Walt Disney Animation Studios, 1998).

to homogenizing their products so that they reach an ever-increasing number of consumers. In her article on the reception of Disney's *Mulan,* scholar Jun Tang argues that "globalization of distribution has produced more homogeneous consumer needs, tastes, lifestyles, and preferences all over the world."[7] In *Mulan*, Disney has aimed to rewrite the story based on elements typical of popular fairy tales. For example, a romantic element is inserted into the narrative at the very beginning of the film, as viewers are introduced to Mulan on the day of her matchmaking. Adding the whole matchmaking yarn serves to satiate the need for the love story element in common fairy tales. In doing so, the film loses much of the history of the original legend—that which makes it so uniquely Chinese.

Despite Disney's choice to westernize aspects of *Mulan*, its interpretation includes Mulan's choice to cross-dress—a distinct and key component to the story of Mulan. It is not a new concept; the history of gender portrayal in entertainment and literature across the globe is fraught with gender blending, and the history of cross-dressing in Chinese culture is surprisingly rich, given historical Asian attitudes towards women. Numerous pieces of literature—theatre, ballads, opera—have characters who feature incongruence in gender roles, especially women who disguise as men. In his book *Cross-Dressing in Chinese Opera*, historian and author Siu Leung Li posits, "The history of Chinese opera can…be instructively described as a series of narrative fragments of 'gender trouble'."[8] According to Holly Devor in her review of Vern and Bonnie Bullough's article *Cross Dressing, Sex, and Gender,* men and women historically have engaged in cross-dressing for different reasons: males' motives were typically for sexual purposes, and they could do what they pleased without much worry for consequence, simply because they were protected by their gender and automatic status above women.[9] On the other hand, females would cross-dress in order to experience taking their lives into their own hands, such as in the matters of economic freedom and independence. Often, the women who partook in cross-dressing came from lower classes, as these women had the least to lose and the most to gain by trying to live new lives as men, motivated by the desire to participate in the male-domineered realms of office, rank, and power.[10] Ronald Altenburger writes that "female-

7 Jun Tang, "A Cross-Cultural Perspective on Production and Reception of Disney's Mulan Through Its Chinese Subtitles," *European Journal of English Studies* 12, no. 2 (2008): 149–50.

8 Siu Leung Li, *Cross-Dressing in Chinese Opera* (Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 2003), 1.

9 Holly Devor, "Cross-Dressing Then and Now," *The Journal of Sex Research* 30, no. 3 (1993): 289, www.jstor.org/stable/3812730.

10 Roland Altenburger, "Is It Clothes That Make the Man? Cross-Dressing, Gender, and Sex in Pre-Twentieth-Century Zhu Yingtai Lore," *Asian Folklore Studies* 64, no. 2 (2005): 170.

to-male dressing-up was perceived as dressing 'up', as an upgrading in social status, and hence as a willful transgression toward more power and freedom."[11] Men were already the center of the world, be it politically, socially, or anything in between, and a massive gap existed between men's and women's statuses. Cross-dressing in the imaginary worlds of myths, art, and writings provided a brief respite from this discrimination.

In Chinese theater, the earliest record of role switching was observed in the early years of the Tang Dynasty (617–908 CE), with men beginning to play female roles; women began to play male roles toward the middle of the Tang Dynasty.[12] The actress in a male role grew popular and has held a unique and strong presence in Chinese opera since Yuan Dynasty (1271–1368 CE), a period that scholars generally dub the "golden age" in Chinese theatrical history.[13] Actresses in male roles were so popular they were often given the lead roles onstage. In fact, these actresses "were not only capable of performing male roles that required a good deal of singing, but they also portrayed military male figures, demonstrating their artistic mastery of martial arts and acrobatics."[14] It would seem that because the practice was so widespread, it would be tolerated and normalized, but still from the ancient Chinese orthodox point of view, these cross-dressers were regarded as "human demons."[15] Nevertheless, the practice continued through the Ming and Qing periods (1368–1911 CE, collectively) and cross-dressing remained a popular feature in both private troupes and public theatres.[16]

It is a slightly gauche gesture for Disney's adaptation to take this complex and significant facet of Chinese history and use it as a punchline. *Mulan* pits Mulan's femininity and masculinity against one another, but neither side truly wins. As a woman, she is clumsy, clueless, and lacking social graces and evidently unable to be a good daughter or bride; as a man, she is still incompetent and awkward, and her decision is scorned—the ancestors do not want to claim her, as one of them scathingly yells, "No! Your great-granddaughter had to be a CROSS-DRESSER"![17] Mushu also complains that he is doomed "all because Miss *Man* decided to take her little drag show on the road."[18] Then her disguise falls apart anyway

11 Ibid., 170–1.

12 Chou Hui-Ling, "Striking Their Own Poses: The History of Cross-Dressing on the Chinese Stage," *TDR* 41, no. 2 (1997): 133.

13 Leung Li, *Cross-Dressing in Chinese Opera*, 1.

14 Hui-Ling, "Striking Their Own Poses," 133.

15 Roland Altenburger, "Is It Clothes That Make The Man?," 170; Xue Keqiao and Angela Yiu, "Women Disguised as Men: Longing for the Past in Chinese Cinema," *Review of Japanese Culture and Society* 8 (1996): 33.

16 Leung Li, *Cross-Dressing in Chinese Opera*, 2.

17 *Mulan*, 1998.

18 Ibid.

against her will. Reverting back to woman was a shameful event for her, as she suddenly became a "treacherous snake," having committed high treason and exemplifying the ultimate dishonor.[19] Where an actress dressing as a man was historically regarded as a step up, in *Mulan* it is more like a fall down several flights. Even as she destroys Shan-Yu once and for all and saves China as a woman, her feminist significance is heavily watered down by the anticipated romance growing between her and Shang.[20]

The cultural significance of cross-dressing is not the only piece that was lost in the film. There are no shortages of non-Chinese (but specifically Western) influences and references throughout *Mulan*, both major and very minor, from physical motions and gestures to dialogue and architecture. In fact, much of the film is not catered to Asian viewers at all. The humor is only funny to Western audiences: as General Li prepares to leave for the Tung Shao Pass after reviewing the military's plan with his son, a dazed soldier salutes him before collapsing, yet saluting was not considered military etiquette in the time period. Mushu waking Mulan with a cricket alarm clock and yelling "All right, rise and shine, sleeping beauty!" is not funny to Chinese viewers as the phrases are not familiar. Toward the end of the film, Shan-Yu appears on the roof of the emperor's palace next to gargoyles, yet gargoyles are Gothic-derived and have no place in the architecture of ancient China. Finally, Chinese culture is generally disapproving of physical contact and displays of affection between different genders, never mind between different social classes. In reality, for Mulan to throw her arms around the emperor would likely have carried consequences, and to embrace her companions would be very unrealistic.[21]

On the other hand, but in a similar manner, certain significant, distinctive Chinese historical facts and cultural traits were grossly exaggerated to build an obvious "Chinese" feel, creating an exotic appeal to non-Asian viewers. Disney shamelessly capitalized on these stereotypes, resulting in a somewhat skewed timeline and a warped sense of China. The Great Wall, a landmark unique to China, is front and center at the start of the film, but does not appear again in the remainder. Janet Maslin even remarks in a movie critique for *The New York Times* that "the China of *Mulan* has surprisingly little depth of field or background detail. The Great Wall and the Forbidden City are here, but so are a lot of empty spaces and scenes in which only one figure moves."[22] Although Shan-Yu

19 Ibid.

20 Li, "Mulan and Hua Mulan," 196.

21 Jun Tang, "A Cross-Cultural Perspective," 151.

22 Janet Maslin, "Film Review: A Warrior, She Takes on Huns and Stereotypes," *The New York Times,* June 19, 1998, www.nytimes.com/1998/06/19/movies/film-review-a-warrior-she-takes-on-huns-and-stereotypes.html.

supposedly lived during the Han Dynasty (202 BCE–220 CE), the film also highlights the Imperial City, which was not established until 1420 CE.[23] Tang continues to detail the featured cultural hyperboles: Mushu wakes up the ancestors with a gong; one ancestor brags about his descendants all being "acupuncturists" (probably the equivalent of a doctor); Mushu sits on a panda bear, cooks a dumpling on a fire, and is heard suggesting that he and other characters in that sequence "call out for egg rolls;" holding and waving fans is used as a display of femininity; the victory parade stars lion dancers and acrobatic dancers.[24] She writes,

> Lion dancers as well as Chinese food and utensils seem to reflect the American concept of "Chinatown," … whereas acupuncturists, panda bears, the Great Wall, the Imperial City, Chinese calligraphy and Chinese martial arts are used in the Disney version of Mulan as elements conveying an Americanized index of "Chineseness."[25]

The stereotypes portrayed in *Mulan* construct a conveniently compressed China, ready for packaging and mass distribution to Disney's consumers. The bent image of Chinese culture that is left promotes unjust stereotyping and places Chinese viewers in a strange position, where they are being depicted on a huge platform, but incorrectly. Though telling the story of Mulan may have had the intent of diversifying Disney's films, it inadvertently excludes Chinese viewers even further by giving the Chinese characters Western traits.

Looking past the plethora of cultural inaccuracies and stereotypes, a close examination of the titular character also reveals that she is not quite the empowering Asian figure that many would hope. There is no mistake that Mulan is strong and powerful, more so than a clear majority of Disney's female characters. Most female protagonists preceding Mulan have had very passive roles in their own fates, leaving it up to outside heroes. Mulan takes matters into her own hands and, when presented with a problem, does not hesitate, whether acting as a man or a woman. However, her whitewashing shows in the very traits that seem to make her so looked up to. Her "need to assert her individuality, her inability to be punctual, or even the humorous portrayal of her reading notes off her arm" paint her as another one of the typical "quirky" American girls who is self-proclaimed to be not like other girls, tipping into the realm of white feminism.[26] The white woman's feminism is privileged and mostly self-

23 Jun Tang, "A Cross-Cultural Perspective," 152.

24 Ibid.

25 Ibid., 153.

26 Juhee, "Mulan: The White Feminist," Asian American Feminist (blog), *Wordpress*, July 2, 2012, www.aafeminist.wordpress.com/2012/07/02/mulan-the-white-feminist/.

seeking; whiteness ensures privilege but being female puts one below males, so the white feminist only cares about white male/female equality. They let their issues take precedence over others, and Disney's Mulan falls to this phenomenon.

It would seem that for fear of being sexist *and* because it would be too brash—scholar and author Sam Abel writes that Disney "cannot critique traditional gender roles because [it] buy[s] into them"—Disney chose an already egalitarian story and pushed it to the extremes of Western feminism, losing the context of Chinese society in the process.[27] Although it is not Mulan's intent to submit to white feminism, the subliminal underlying message in the film is that her Chinese culture and familial obligations are to be disregarded and discarded. Mulan becomes almost a caricature, far too wild to fit into her familial role and apparently beyond the hope of ever fulfilling it. Moreover, the film gives Mulan a second motivation, the much more individualistic, white feminist desire to discover who she is inside (heard in the musical number "Reflection"), in addition to fighting on her father's behalf. The former is emphasized so much in the film such that it begins to obscure the latter, only furthering her disregard for obedience and duty, turning her into an "Americanized hyper-individualistic heroine."[28] Even though Mulan ended up coming home bearing gifts to honor her family, her purposes had become too far divided.

On top of the contrast of gender roles, it is simply unfaithful to the original narrative, which was not so much praised for the bravery of the heroine rather than it was for the values and morality that it represents—for being "the embodiment of loyalty and filial piety."[29] After being abandoned by the army, Mulan laments, "Maybe I didn't go for my father. Maybe what I really wanted was to prove I could do things right, so when I looked in the mirror, I'd see someone worthwhile."[30] To Western audiences, it might seem normal in the development of a young woman and that there is nothing wrong with wanting to focus on oneself. To Asian audiences, for whom family is often the most important building block of society, it is irreverent and perhaps one of the whitest and most disrespectful things one could say.

Mulan has been widely praised for finally presenting a strong female role model to young girls, especially in the Asian-American population. In many aspects, she is a perfectly solid role model, needing no Prince Charming and having the self-initiative to be the change she

27 Sam Abel, "The Rabbit in Drag: Camp and Gender Construction in the American Animated Cartoon," *Journal of Popular Culture* 29, no. 3 (1995): 188; Juhee, "Mulan: The White Feminist."

28 Zhao Gengcheng, "American Mulan: Powerful and Powerless," Beijing Foreign Studies University, 2010, https://www.uscet.org/sites/default/files/american_mulan_-_powerful_and_powerless_by_zhao_gengcheng.pdf.

29 Keqiao and Yiu, "Women Disguised as Men," 33.

30 *Mulan*, 1998.

wants to see. However, Disney modifies Chinese history and capitalizes on stereotypes to appeal more to Western consumers. The implications reach far and wide, but Asian-American families, especially those who have gone through the immigration process, may be affected in a particular way. The twentieth century saw a huge influx of Asian immigrants, seeking new beginnings and better lives after fleeing war-torn homelands, having left everything behind. In 1965, the United States passed the Immigration and National Act, removing quotas based on nation of origin and sharp restrictions on immigration from Asian and Middle Eastern countries, bars that had been established since 1921.[31] Following the passing of this act, migrations from Asia rose dramatically, propelled by events such as the gruesome regime of Mao Zedong, the bloody Vietnam War, and the North Korean Gulag, among an inexhaustive list of many others.[32] Between 1980 and 1990, the population of Asian immigrants in the United States nearly doubled from 2,540,000 to 4,979,000, according to data from the U.S. Census Bureau.[33] By this time, many of the families that had immigrated following the Immigration and National Act had children and grandchildren of their own who would be consuming media from Disney.

Immigrant families invested themselves wherever they ended up, just knowing that the harder they worked, the better future they could provide for their children. These parents wanted their offspring to be able to take advantage of as many opportunities as possible in the New World, and so tried hard to integrate themselves into American society, but still wanted to preserve the culture and traditions of their old home.

This put the children and future generations in an interesting position: they should uphold and honor their family's and culture's traditions, yet they had not experienced it in the homeland like their parents or grandparents had. At the same time, they must work to be as fully assimilated into America as possible so that they could build the future that their parents came here for. New lifestyles clashed with traditions of culture and resulted in family friction; for instance, women generally had more freedom in America than in Asian countries, and parents and their daughters would disagree on what was acceptable for them to do. As if this were not enough, language divided the generations. Immigrant parents continued to speak their native languages; the children spoke English at

31 Jie Zong and Jeanne Batalova, "Asian Immigrants in the United States," *Migration Policy Institute*, January 6, 2016, https://www.migrationpolicy.org/article/asian-immigrants-united-states.

32 Milton Leitenberg, *Deaths in Wars and Conflicts in the 20th Century*, 3rd ed. (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2006).

33 Jie Zong and Jeanne Batalova, "Asian Immigrants in the United States"; Campbell J. Gibson and Kay Jung, "Historical Census Statistics on the Foreign-Born Population of the United States: 1850-2000," Working Paper no. 81, *U.S. Census Bureau*, February 2006.

school and with their friends, but at home spoke their native languages as well. The grandchildren of many immigrants could only speak English.

To the daughter of Asian immigrants, *Mulan* probably hits very close to home. Classic Chinese philosophy maintains the female as a submissive entity throughout her entire lifetime, keeping in line with her family and then that of her husband's.[34] Disney's *Mulan* does not fit in anywhere, cannot please her parents although she loves them and tries to, and is trying to discover herself. What *Mulan* will not do is encourage upholding familial traditions and obligations, but it will inspire young girls to break away from the expected to "find who they are inside." Since the values of Disney's Mulan lean toward white feminism, this is likely to work against what an Asian-American family wants. But a girl probably would not see anything off about Mulan—by ditching the role that she is supposed to play, she saves China, gets to hug the emperor, and comes home triumphant *and* with a potential suitor. Of course, the problem is that today most girls are not expected to see a matchmaker or bear sons to serve the emperor, as it was in the setting of *Mulan*; rather, the expectations could be to exhibit an appropriate amount of respect and politeness towards elders and authorities, to keep the peace and avoid confrontation, to aspire to certain professions, and to dress "properly." The list goes on. But with rapidly evolving societal norms, generations continue to find themselves at odds with each other over the "right" ways to behave. Given Disney's influence, there is no doubt that *Mulan* has shaped the childhoods and mindsets of millions of girls.

Mulan presents a stark contrast between the traditions and culture of Mulan's China and the imperialistic power of the West, making it clear that the only way to truly be an empowered heroine is to leave your traditions behind and live the Western way. However, it remains a powerful film, the first from Disney to star an Asian main character, and a heroine to boot. To some degree of success, it offers a glimpse into Asian culture, values, and its flaws, as well as tackles gender roles. As filled with inaccuracies and stereotypes as it is, and as much as it endorses Western ideals instead of the ideals of its intended setting, *Mulan* was still a monumental first step in Asian representation in mainstream media. For a hero's journey that is usually reserved for male protagonists, *Mulan* is a declaration of a fearless Asian heroine, one who has influenced a generation of young women and will continue to for years to come. Yet Disney falls too short in doing justice to the culture from which it drew this story. The sentiment and values put forth by the "Ballad of Mulan" were filtered in their film rendition with whitewashing and typecasts—truly consistent with Disney's own values in catering to American entertainment and the white American household. All

34 Carol C. Fan, "Language, Gender, and Chinese Culture," *International Journal of Politics, Culture, and Society* 10, no. 1 (1996): 96.

the while the younger generation of Asian-American girls is left to watch *Mulan* and wonder who it is who can really embody who they are.

Machinal and *Society of the Spectacle*:

Treadwell's Reply to Society's Spectacularizing of Human Tragedy

[Nina Dominique Codell]

Time and time again, Sophie Treadwell's play *Machinal* has been pigeonholed by genre. The scholarly conversations surrounding *Machinal* primarily revolve around three spheres. Many scholars look at the text from a purely feminist perspective as a play written by a woman, about women, and for women. Others study the play in its historical context—tracking the similarities and differences between *Machinal* and the Snyder-Gray murder case, from which the play was loosely based. Still, some consider the play as a flagship of the American Expressionist theatre movement and focus their analysis on Treadwell's use of expressionist techniques. While each of these analyses serve as valid entry points in comprehending aspects of the text, few have researched how *Machinal* comments on American society in general—not just the specific 1920s milieu or the female experience.

Considering *Machinal* in relation to Situationist International theory emphasizes how the play attempts to dethrone the mainstream societal mode of the spectacle. Formed in France, the Situationist International Organization was made up of social revolutionaries and led in part by Guy Debord. From 1957 to the organization's dissolution in 1972, the movement's primary aim was to critique and ultimately halt the degrading effects of modern capitalism. Debord's most famous text, *Society of the Spectacle*, published in 1967, effectively indicted the mass commodification and consumption of spectacle—or mass media—over lived experiences. Despite the fact that Treadwell wrote *Machinal* twenty-nine years prior to and an ocean away from where the Situationist International was formed, her play bears striking resemblance to Situationist theories. *Machinal* directly mirrors Debord's concept of the spectacle society, in which, "modern conditions of production prevail, […] all of life presents itself as an immense accumulation of *spectacles* […] [and] everything that was directly lived has moved away into a representation."[1] Ahead of its time, the play portrays

1 Guy Debord, *The Society of the Spectacle* (Bread and Circuses Publishing, 1967), Apple Books, 72.

an individual steeping in isolation and in opposition to a society that privileges the spectacle, or "the sector [of society] which concentrates all gazing and all consciousness," over real, human connection.[2] Through the protagonist's juxtaposed relationship with her husband, George H. Jones—a representative of the society of the spectacle—and her lover, Richard Roe—a man whom she perceives as an escape from said society—Treadwell depicts the ultimate risk that people within a spectacle-laden society face when they do not blindly accept their own passivity. By using the events that were hijacked by the spectacle and creating something new with them that effectively critiques the spectacle society's way of pacifying the public and isolating individuals, Treadwell's work functions as detournement. A Debordian detournement, or rerouting of the 1927 Snyder-Gray murder case, *Machinal* ultimately indicts the fundamental wrongdoing in deemphasizing the lived experiences of a person.

To fully comprehend how Treadwell metamorphosed the spectacle, one must understand the extent to which the original court case was spectacularized. Although the names Ruth Snyder and Judd Gray mean comparatively little to the average citizen today, they were the highlight of nearly every New York newspaper's crime section in the late 1920s. Snyder and Gray were extramarital lovers, who conspired to and successfully followed through with the murder of Albert Snyder, Ruth's husband. After months on trial, both were sentenced to capital punishment and died by the electric chair on January 12, 1928. If the crime itself was not shocking enough (equipped with chloroform rags, haphazard alibis, and a poor daughter caught in the cross-fire), the media coverage that followed was unprecedented. According to critic Katherine Weiss, "There were roughly 180 reporters assigned to the case and within three months over 1,500,000 words had been written on it."[3] All this coverage turned the case into a sort of circus attraction. Scholars Jean Marie Lutes and Jennifer Jones both note that 1,500 spectators came to witness the trial each day.[4] To further the spectacle, Lutes found that "tickets were required for admission, although at least 120 spots were reserved for members of the press," and according to Jones, "for the first time in history, microphones and speakers were set up in the courtroom."[5] In effect, the trial became a fully-fledged Debordian example of the spectacle society.

---

2 Ibid.

3 Katherine Weiss, "Sophie Treadwell's 'Machinal': Electrifying the Human Body," *South Atlantic Review* 71, no. 3 (2006): 4, www.jstor.org/stable/20064750.

4 Jean Marie Lutes, "Tears on Trial in the 1920s: Female Emotion and Style in 'Chicago' and 'Machinal,'" *Tulsa Studies in Women's Literature* 30, no. 2 (2011): 365, www.jstor.org/stable/23349339; Jennifer Jones, "In Defense of the Woman: Sophie Treadwell's 'Machinal,'" *Modern Drama* 37, no. 3 (1994): 486, doi:10.3138/md.37.3.485.

5 Lutes, "Tears on Trial," 356; Jones, "In Defense of the Woman," 486.

Masses were so consumed by the spectacle that the court case began to take on the outward appearance of a show devised solely for entertainment. For those who could not procure a seat for themselves in the courtroom, newspapers covered the case in detail and were delivered "to readers in a decidedly non-intimate form, […] through easily smudged pages that could be passed from hand to hand or carelessly discarded."[6] Accordingly, the treatment of the Snyder-Gray case cheapened the lived, human experiences of the two on trial by prioritizing the spectacle and the sale of the spectacle over their humanity. Jones notes that after the crime was committed, "Newspapers capitalized on the huge market for this sordid courtroom drama […] reporting everything Snyder and Gray said or did, reviewing their performances on the stand, and keeping running commentary on the 'audience's' reaction."[7] In response to this phenomenon, Treadwell re-imagined the case in the form of a play not to placate the mass media's demand that the case operates like a Broadway production, but to reclaim the story and inspire audiences to feel their sense of humanity again.

Treadwell pushed back against the media's spectacularizing of the trial by re-imagining the events. To reinvigorate the audiences' awareness of their humanity, she made a few critical changes to her plot that distinguished it from the actual trial. Although the play maintains noticeable similarities to the Snyder-Gray case (the female protagonist marries a man she does not love, enters into an illicit affair, kills her husband, testifies for herself at court, and is sentenced to death), Treadwell chose to tell the story from the wife's perspective only—there is no co-conspirator. While Helen Jones (the protagonist) is inspired by her lover to commit the crime, she is never validated by him. By focusing the play on the experiences of a single person, Treadwell avoids writing a misguided love story and focuses on humanizing her protagonist and examining the sort of society that could drive someone to commit such a heinous crime.

Machinal begins with a dilemma—Helen can either marry her boss, who she does not love, or lose her job. The culture that surrounds her is one of conformity—one that derives from the ecosystem of the spectacle, in which those who consume spectacle are expected to passively accept whatever the state, and the spectacle sanctioned by the state, feeds them. While her coworkers seem to accept their place in society with few qualms, Helen struggles to fit into the script that has been written for her. After arriving late to work, the Stenographer asks her why she does not get to work, and Helen responds, "My machine's out of order."[8] When the Stenographer asks why she does not fix her machine, Helen replies, "I can't—got to get

6 Lutes, "Tears on Trial," 344.
7 Jones, "In Defense of the Woman," 486–7.
8 Sophie Treadwell, *Machinal* (London: Nick Hern Books, 1993), 9.

somebody."[9] When faced with the broken machine, she has no means of fixing it herself. Like the typewriter, she too is "out of order;" there is a clear disjunction between herself and those around her. Whereas her coworkers seem more or less content to operate automatically within the system, she is anxious and withdrawn and appeals to "somebody" to give her guidance and put her back in order.

Not only does she stand apart from the order of the system, but her appeal for "somebody" also suggests her sense of isolation and desire for companionship. Helen's isolation directly results from the office milieu, which is founded on principles of the spectacle that completely isolate people from themselves in favor of progressing the status quo. While this scene may not look like the stereotypical spectacle form (e.g. mass media), Treadwell effectively creates a living picture of the type of society that Debord describes in *Society of the Spectacle*. In other words, the individuals have no *real* control over their lives because they are subjugated beneath the system of production. Treadwell captures this by embracing the expressionist practice of casting her characters as "types." To use the words of scholar Dassia Posner, "Treadwell emphasizes the erasure of individualism by listing the *dramatis personae* by their social function."[10] Instead of representing themselves, the office workers represent the role that their society cast them in without their consent; the adding clerk adds, the filing clerk files. While some appreciate their roles more than others—for instance, when the adding clerk points out that Helen does not belong in an office, the Stenographer admits, "I do"— it is much harder for Helen to accept her role. Even Mr. Jones, who holds the most power in the office, does not really have control of his identity; instead, popular modes of spectacle do his living for him.[11] This is evident in that his words are not truly his own; his language is made up almost entirely of platitudes. When he enters, he tells his workers that "haste makes waste" and "the early bird catches the worm."[12] While he speaks *at* those around him, using clichés to make his point, he never truly communicates with them person to person.

At the end of episode one, Helen plunges into a stream-of-consciousness style soliloquy. Jumbled and clipped, the words of others intrude her inner thoughts. She hears Jones say to her, "How would you like to marry me—what do you say—[…]—let me look at your little hands—you have such pretty little hands—let me hold your pretty little hands."[13] Repeatedly, she meets his words with denial, stating, "no—I can't—[…]

9 Ibid., 9.

10 Dassia N. Possner, "America and the Individual: 'The Hairy Ape' and 'Machinal' at the Moscow Kamerny Theatre," *New Theatre Quarterly* 34, no. 1 (2018): 9, doi:10.1017/S0266464X17000641.

11 Treadwell, *Machinal*, 3.

12 Ibid., 4–5.

13 Ibid., 11.

don't touch me—please—[…] please don't—[…] don't touch me—please—no—can't."[14] But, as much as she knows what it is she wants (or rather, what she does *not* want), she also knows that if she denies George, "she'll lose her job."[15] She feels so weighted by the pressure applied by others around her that she recognizes what she must do.[16] Driven by pressure from her co-workers in episode one and her mother in episode two, she decides to marry George and effectively marry into the society of the spectacle in hopes that she will learn to cope with her sense of isolation and find a place for herself in life.

However, the extent to which George H. Jones is a product of the society of the spectacle becomes intolerably clear on their honeymoon in episode three. In his attempt to connect with his wife, he relies on the stories that he has heard from other people to forge a connection with his wife, demonstrating how "the externality of the spectacle in relation to the active man appears in the fact that his own gestures are no longer his but those of another who represents them to him."[17] Jones tells Helen, "That reminds me of the story of the Pullman porter and the [tart]" as a means to get physically closer to her.[18] As he tries to be intimate with his wife, he relies on someone else's experiences and someone else's words to set the mood.

When he does divulge into his dreams, attempting to tell his wife "all about [himself]," it is obvious that his desires are manufactured around commodities and ideas that have been sold to him.[19] He tells his wife, "Next year maybe we'll go to Paris. You can buy a lot of that French underwear—and Switzerland—all my life I've wanted a Swiss watch—that I bought right there—I coulda' got a Swiss watch here, but I always wanted one that I bought right there…"[20] In accordance with Debord's theory,

> the alienation of the spectator to the profit of the contemplated object [...] is expressed in the following way: [...] the more he accepts recognizing himself in the dominant images of need, the less he understands his own existence and his own desires.[21]

Steeped in the spectacle, George's only desires are the ready-made commodities afforded as symbols of status or luxury. While he takes his

14 Ibid.
15 Ibid., 10.
16 Ibid., 11–2.
17 Debord, *The Society of the Spectacle*, 87.
18 Treadwell, *Machinal*, 24.
19 Ibid.
20 Ibid., 25.
21 Debord, *The Society of the Spectacle*, 87.

dream a step beyond simply buying the product, his dream of pilgrimaging to the *source* of the product only further illustrates his obsession with the product itself in its "purest" form.

His "relationship" with his wife proves to be just another way for him to obtain one more status symbol in his spectacle society. The scene ends with Helen calling out, "I want *somebody*" (my italics).[22] While her husband tells her, "You got me, haven't you?" she continues to seek "somebody—somebody—" because she knows her husband has not truly tried to connect with her as a person or see her for who she is.[23] Because Jones represents a society that privileges spectacle over authentic human connection, he sees his wife as just another object for consumption—yet another product that he can own.

In his feeble attempt to inspire his wife after the birth of their daughter, Jones bombards Helen with platitudes. He tells her, "…Make an effort! Pull yourself together! Start the up-hill climb! […] Will power! That's what conquers! […] Face the music! Stand the gaff! Take life by the horns! Look it in the face!"[24] Because of his investment in the spectacle society, he cannot communicate with his wife—or anyone for that matter—since he does not truly know himself. Alone in the hospital and fed up with her husband's refusal to see her for who she really is as an individual, she vows not to submit any longer.[25] Seeking freedom and autonomy after her traumatic birthing experience, she meets Richard Roe in a speakeasy, and they become lovers. Through her relationship with Roe, she circumvents the spectacle and lives her life authentically. Unlike George, Richard's stories are his own—he tells her of San Francisco and Mexico, of fighting off "banditos" to save his life and find freedom.[26] In her eyes, he is a man who goes on adventures and lives by his own accord; he is above the spectacle. With him, she can be self-reflective and curious about the world around her—she asks him what certain Spanish words mean, about the flower he keeps in his room, and about life in San Francisco.[27] He gives her a taste of the human connection she has always yearned for but never known how to find—both in the physical and emotional sense. Through her sexual awakening and relationship with Richard, she realizes things about her life and herself. A poignant example occurs when she sings the children's song "Hey Diddle Diddle," and admits, "I never thought that had any sense before—now I get it."[28] Now, she feels she can assign meaning to the world around her instead of passively letting the world assign

22 Treadwell, *Machinal*, 26.
23 Ibid.
24 Ibid., 28.
25 Ibid., 31.
26 Ibid., 40.
27 Ibid., 46, 49, 50.
28 Ibid., 47.

meaning to her.

Unfortunately, Helen's romance with Roe is short-lived, and within a year, he leaves for Mexico. Without Roe to distract her from her husband, she is left alone and feels, once again, submerged beneath the spectacle: unhappy, isolated, and distraught. Once again, in the sitting room with her husband, her life is mediated by the spectacle of mass media. As Jones reads newspaper headlines of production—"record production. […] sale hits a million— […] market trend steady—," Helen reads headlines that illustrate the life she wishes she could lead: "girl turns on gas […] woman leaves all for love— […] young wife disappears."[29] While she is physically near her husband, they spend their time alone together. Treadwell indicates in the scene directions, "they are seated on opposite ends of the divan. They are both reading papers—to themselves."[30] Per usual, Jones treats his wife as another object he can own instead of as a person he should seek to understand. He even goes so far as to illustrate the parallel between his property and his wife. He says, "The property's mine! It's not all that's mine […] I got a first mortgage on her—I got a second mortgage on her—and she's mine!"[31] In accordance with Debord's theory, George is detached from his life in so much as he is detached from those around him and from himself. George's life, like the spectacle, "is the common ground of the deceived gaze and of false consciousness, and the unification it achieves is nothing but an official language of generalized separation."[32] While Helen and George share a culture, a marriage, a family, they experience everything alone. George is just too dense to recognize it.

Operating within the spectacle, Helen is so separated from herself that she looks to the spectacle for a model of how she should live her life. She finds inspiration for murdering her husband in one of the headlines that she reads: "Woman finds husband dead."[33] Within the spectacle society, even her actions are inspired by the media. As Helen's mental health begins to deteriorate, Treadwell employs expressionist techniques to materialize the young woman's inner turmoil. Helen fixates on the voice of her lover, explaining how he killed two men in Mexico to free himself from their bonds by smashing a bottle filled with pebbles over their heads.[34] His voice mingles with other, strange voices repeating, "stones—stones—small stones," and Treadwell indicates in the stage directions that "*the music—the voices—mingle—increase—the YOUNG WOMAN flies from her chair and cries out in terror.*"[35] If, as Debord says, "the spectacle is

29 Ibid., 53.
30 Ibid.
31 Ibid., 54.
32 Debord, *The Society of the Spectacle*, 73.
33 Treadwell, *Machinal*, 57.
34 Ibid., 58.
35 Ibid., 59.

the nightmare of imprisoned modern society" and the "guardian of sleep," then Helen represents, at this moment, the insomniac hostility that an individual may be driven to should they refuse to be lulled to sleep by their surrounding society.[36] In a vicious attempt to refuse the spectacle before her, she murders her husband in his sleep by hitting him over the head with a bottle filled with small stones.

It is within episode eight, "The Law," that Treadwell's detournement realizes its most explicit form. On trial for murder, Helen testifies for herself; however, Treadwell overlays her testimony with the interpretations of nearby reporters, who scrutinize her every move. After her defense lawyer completes his examination of her, the first reporter says, "the accused woman told a straightforward story of—," while the second reporter claims, "the accused woman told a rambling, disconnected story of—."[37] Later, when Helen lies about the murder weapon, reporters intervene once more. The first reporter writes, "Under the heavy artillery fire of the State's attorney's brilliant cross-questioning, the accused woman's defense was badly riddled."[38] The second reporter now portrays the woman in a more positive light, stating, "Undaunted by the Prosecution's machine-gun attack, the defendant was able to maintain her position of innocence in the face of rapid-fire questioning that threatened, but never seriously menaced her defense."[39] Treadwell's depiction of reporters disrupting the court proceedings mirrors how the mass media infiltrated the story in real life and *made* it a product for audiences to ingest. The reporters' biased interpretations serve to comment on the subjectivity of the spectacle that presents itself as objective truth. By portraying the way the media hijacks the protagonist's experience in favor of creating a story that fits whatever narrative supports their agenda, Treadwell depicts the inauthenticity of the spectacle as the primary societal mode.

While some may argue that it is morally corrupt to empathize with a murderer, Treadwell encourages her audience to see Helen's humanity by illustrating her deep mental anguish. When she learns that her lover has betrayed her "voluntarily [...] in the furtherance of justice" by writing an affidavit detailing their affair, she is overwhelmed and, in a frenzy, confesses to her crime.[40] After her confession, the stage directions read, "*Young Woman begins to moan—suddenly—as though the realization of the* enormity of her isolation *had just come upon her. It is a sound of desolation, of agony, of human woe*" (my emphasis).[41] Once again, she is

36 Debord, *The Society of the Spectacle*, 81.
37 Treadwell, *Machinal*, 66.
38 Ibid., 73.
39 Ibid.
40 Ibid., 74.
41 Ibid., 76.

consumed by her isolation, the direct product of her spectacle society. In Debord's words, "*Separation* is the alpha and omega of the spectacle."[42] Thus, for Helen to be so entranced in her own isolation means that the spectacle has won in its efforts to consume her. By portraying moments of human suffering during the trial, Treadwell detracts from the original spectacle of the crime as a product for consumption and emphasizes the real, human experience and distress behind it.

By the end of the play, the spectacle effectively swallows Helen whole, and she no longer belongs to herself. Similar to the way that mass media infiltrated Ruth Snyder's court case, Helen Jones is inundated with the voices of reporters as she walks to the electric chair. In the final episode, reporters observe Helen as she makes her way to the electric chair, noting minute details and speculating what might happen—"suppose the machine shouldn't work!" the first reporter calls out.[43] The second reporter responds, "it'll work—it always works!"[44] The electric chair operates as the spectacle that always works, always consumes, and always overtakes. While Helen attempts to call out, again, for "Somebody! Somebod—," her voice is cut off by the electric chair, yet another machine. The play closes not with Helen's lamentation for companionship, but with the words of the priest that the state assigned to Helen on her execution day: "Christ have mercy—Lord have mercy—Christ have mercy—"[45] Ending the play this way emphasizes how closely tied the spectacle is to the state or governmental power since the priest not only represents Christianity but also the entire governmental institution that is complicit in the spectacle's power. Through this ending, Treadwell invites audiences to consider what is lost when an institution has the final say over a human life. As a result, audiences may feel their sense of empathy pricked for the loss of an individual that sought so desperately to be seen, heard, and known. Thus, *Machinal* invites audiences to experience the heart of the Snyder-Gray case in a way that they may not have experienced the case when following the news coverage by way of disposable sheets of inky paper or watching the trial as an audience-member like Romans watching gladiator's fight—waiting to see who would be devoured first.

In turn, considering *Machinal* in relation to Situationist theory broadens the scope of the conversation surrounding the play. The play is certainly about the female experience in a patriarchal society, holds parallels to the Snyder-Gray murder case, and is a prime example of Expressionistic theatre; however, the play breaks the bounds of its immediate context and speaks to deeper issues in the foundation of the spectacle society.

42 Debord, *The Society of the Spectacle*, 83.
43 Treadwell, *Machinal*, 82.
44 Ibid.
45 Ibid., 83.

While the popular avenues of analysis are important and valid, the play's other concern, to reject and renounce society's obsession with passively consuming spectacle and thereby isolating people from themselves, is critical to fully understanding *Machinal*'s scope. Treadwell's play is not only relevant to 1920s culture or the late 1950s ethos that bred the Situationist International, but also to today's modern American culture, in which media permeates the public's lives more than ever. If audiences and scholars only ever categorize the play as feminist, or biographical, or expressionistic, then they will compartmentalize the text and miss a larger aspect of the work that synthesizes the three components that make it up. If audiences and scholars begin to analyze how *Machinal* speaks to the consequences and dangers of spectacle societies that continues to privilege media intake and state power over human connection and autonomy, then Treadwell's play can further enlighten the human experience.

"Oh, Stuff and Fluff!":

Amplifying the Cute Aesthetic of Winnie the Pooh

[Emily Dietrich]

In many ways, Disney's[1] 1977 film *The Many Adventures of Winnie the Pooh* remains true to author A. A. Milne's source texts.[2] Both feature hypodiegetic narratives that celebrate the power of imagination; both present quaint art evocative of a simpler time; and both arguably leave audiences feeling warm and fuzzy inside. Where the two media largely diverge, though, is in their cast of characters with Disney amplifying the characteristics of Milne's core cast. As such, Tigger becomes more raucous; Piglet becomes more timid; and Rabbit becomes more bossy. Less notably but no less interestingly, Winnie the Pooh becomes…cuter. This is achieved as *The Many Adventures of Winnie the Pooh* amplifies Pooh's soft, malleable, and subsequently cute body, as well as his vulnerability by exaggerating the precarious situations he finds himself in. To what end this amplification takes place is debatable, but may lie in Disney's consumerist culture.

Before one can fully address how Disney facilitates this amplification, it's important to first consider what the cute aesthetic is and how it manifests in Milne's text. Focusing on the physical attributes of the cute, aesthetics scholar Sianne Ngai defines a cute object as small, compact, soft, and malleable.[3] In her text *Our Aesthetic Categories*, Ngai explains,

> Cuteness is a response to the 'unformed' look of infants, to

1 The Disney corporation is referenced throughout this paper as "Disney." These references do not refer to the actual person Walt Disney, although he was involved in the production of *The Many Adventures of Winnie the Pooh*.

2 Disney's *The Many Adventures of Winnie the Pooh* is based on two of Milne's texts (*Winnie-the-Pooh* and *The House at Pooh Corner*), but this paper will not discuss the latter.

3 Sianne Ngai, *Our Aesthetic Categories: Zany, Cute, Interesting* (New York: Harvard University Press, 2015), 64.

> the amorphous and bloblike as opposed to the articulated or well-defined. Indeed, the more malleable or easily deformable the cute object appears, the cuter it will seem.[4]

An example Ngai supplies of the cute is a frog-shaped bath sponge marketed for babies that not only possesses a simple design but is also physically malleable—one can squeeze the sponge and witness the object's reaction to that force. The fact that this sponge is designed for babies—Ngai notes how the purpose of the sponge is "to be pressed against a baby's body"—also reveals the connection between the cute and commodities designed for children after World War I.[5] Tracing the history of toys and their respective physical forms, Ngai notes how the "exemplary cute object, the stuffed animal or manufactured plush toy" evolved as a reaction to twentieth-century psychology and the recognition of children's aggressiveness.[6] In other words, as people began to recognize just how aggressive children can be, they began crafting softer, more malleable products that could withstand force like the bath sponge previously described. The result is that children's toys began to exemplify the physical form of the cute aesthetic.

With this connection between the cute and children's toys in mind, it becomes easier to comprehend how Winnie the Pooh embodies the physical form of the cute aesthetic. Instead of being an actual bear that lives in the forest, Winnie the Pooh is the teddy bear of Christopher Robin, Milne's son, who is also a key character in the *Winnie the Pooh* series. As a teddy bear, he is rendered soft, cuddly, and malleable. Readers are indirectly informed of Pooh's status as a stuffed animal in the first chapter of *Winnie the Pooh* as Milne writes, "Here is Edward Bear," Pooh's original name, "coming downstairs now, bump, bump, bump, on the back of his head," accompanied by E. H. Shepard's illustration of Christopher Robin dragging Pooh headfirst down a set of stairs.[7] The fact that Christopher Robin is able to handle Pooh in such a manner, with Pooh withstanding the force of the stairs just like the bath sponge, prompts readers to deduce that Pooh isn't a real bear but instead a stuffed animal. This notion is supported by Shepard's various illustrations which depict Pooh not as a realistic-looking bear that predominantly stands on four legs, but as a teddy bear that constantly stands upright. Additionally, by employing sketch-like lines, Shepard's illustrations imitate a certain sense of downiness to Pooh's character evocative of the cute's connection to softness.

---

4 Ibid., 30.

5 Ibid., 64, 76–7.

6 Ibid., 75.

7 A. A. Milne, "Winnie-the-Pooh," in *The Complete Tales of Winnie the Pooh* (New York: Penguin Random House, 2015), 1.

In Disney's *The Many Adventures of Winnie the Pooh*, Pooh's cute physicality is amplified in a number of ways, including through the use of song and Disney's revamped character design. Consider, for instance, the film's theme song, which serves as an introduction to the characters featured throughout the movie. Penned by veteran Disney songwriters Richard M. Sherman and Robert B. Sherman, the song emphasizes Pooh's soft body describing him as a "tubby, little cubby all stuffed with fluff."[8] From this song, viewers not only learn that Pooh is a stuffed animal but also to associate Pooh with fluff and, by extension, softness. These lessons are reiterated in Pooh's exercise song, "Up, Down, Touch the Ground," also by the Sherman brothers, as Pooh bends over to touch his toes causing one of his seams to pop.[9] His response? "Oh, stuff and fluff."[10] Here, Pooh's status as a stuffed animal is communicated by the visual of his burst seam, while his association with fluff is made apparent by his language. Both of these creative decisions contribute to Pooh's cute characterization.

In addition to highlighting Pooh's connection to softness, these songs also serve to exaggerate Pooh's rotund, and therefore more bloblike, figure—a key facet of the cute's physical form.[11] Described in the theme song as "tubby," and in Pooh's exercise song as "stout, round…short, fat," Pooh is clealy identifiable by his round figure. This is supported by the animators' character design of Pooh as they give him a larger belly and cheeks than Shepard does, thusly exaggerating his curves. Furthermore, the animator's decision to clothe Pooh in an undersized red shirt makes him appear even fatter than in Shepard's illustrations[12] by bisecting, and therein calling attention to, his stomach. Coupled with the Sherman brothers' songs, it becomes clear that Disney amplifies Pooh's cute physicality by emphasizing his soft as well as round body.

Another facet of the cute aesthetic that Winnie the Pooh exemplifies and Disney exaggerates is the cute object's vulnerability. In discussion of this quality, aesthetics scholar Daniel Harris explains how "the process of conveying cuteness to the viewer disempowers its objects, forcing them into ridiculous situations and making them appear more ignorant and vulnerable than they really are."[13] The result is that objects are rendered

---

8 Richard M. Sherman and Robert B. Sherman, "Winnie the Pooh," *The Many Adventures of Winnie the Pooh*, directed by John Lounsbery and Wolfgang Reitherman (1977; Burbank: Walt Disney Productions, 2007), DVD.

9 Richard M. Sherman and Robert B. Sherman, "Up, Down, Touch the Ground," *The Many Adventures of Winnie the Pooh*, directed by John Lounsbery and Wolfgang Reitherman (1977; Burbank: Walt Disney Productions, 2007), DVD.

10 *The Many Adventures of Winnie the Pooh*, directed by John Lounsbery and Wolfgang Reitherman (1977; Burbank: Walt Disney Productions, 2007), DVD.

11 Ngai, *Our Aesthetic Categories,* 30.

12 Pooh only wears clothes in Shepard's illustrations when it is cold outside.

13 Daniel Harris, quoted in Ngai, *Our Aesthetic Categories*, 65.

cutest when they are "in the middle of a pratfall or a blunder," or rather any situation that manipulates them into a physically and/or mentally vulnerable position. Examples Harris provides of the cute "in distress" include a teddy bear fitted with an orthopedic boot, as well as the Care Bear, Love-a-Lot Bear, with a paint can upturned upon its head. However, the most relevant example Harris provides to this analysis is Winnie the Pooh himself, "with his snout stuck in the hive."[14] It should be noted, though, that in Milne's text Pooh only gets his head stuck in a honey jar—not a beehive as Harris describes—and therefore is only placed in a vulnerable situation by Milne rather than a dangerous situation.

In addition to the instance Harris cites, there are a number of other scenes in Milne's text that feature Pooh in a vulnerable situation. For instance, he falls down from a honey tree; he falls from a balloon trying to scale that honey tree; he gets his arms stuck above his head from holding onto the balloon to scale that honey tree—all in a single sequence. As these events reveal, Pooh's vulnerable characterization often evolves as one mishap gives way to another mishap, which gives way to another mishap. That being said, not all mishaps are equal in threat; they vary from being a minor inconvenience like the "funny feeling" of hunger on a warm day, to being stuck in someone's front door for an entire week.[15] What they all have in common, though, is that they consistently undermine Pooh's intellect (demonstrated by his creative plans, song lyrics, and poetry) just as the process of communicating cuteness makes cute entities seem more vulnerable than they truly are.[16]

As previously discussed, the fact that Pooh is first introduced to readers with his head hitting every step of the staircase Christopher Robin descends speaks volumes about his characterization as a disempowered entity that is put into precarious situations. What's interesting is that in each of these situations Pooh is ultimately protected and/or rescued by the character of Christopher Robin featured within Milne's hypodiegetic narrative, while the "real life" Christopher Robin, featured in the outer layer of Milne's narrative, causes him harm (albeit inadvertently). This contrast between hurting and protecting the cute can be related to another of Harris' observations. As he writes, "the cute object's exaggerated passivity seems likely to excite the consumer's sadism or desire for mastery as much as her desire to protect and cuddle."[17] As such, Christopher Robin's desires and actions that at one moment cause Pooh harm, and in another moment, rescue him from harm, can be understood as a consumer's diverging reactions to the cute aesthetic.

14 Ibid., 65–6.
15 Milne, "Winnie-the-Pooh," 77.
16 Harris, quoted in Ngai, *Our Aesthetic Categories*, 65.
17 Ibid., 65.

In Disney's film adaptation of Milne's text, this relationship between Christopher Robin and Winnie the Pooh is rendered far less complex, with Christopher Robin consistently serving as the protector and guide of Pooh and his friends. This is a comforting development given the film's amplification of Pooh's vulnerability by exaggerating the distressing situations he often finds himself in. A prime example of such exaggeration takes shape as Pooh tries to steal honey from a swarm of bees protecting their hive by holding onto a balloon and pretending to be a rain cloud. While in Milne's text the bees never directly threaten Pooh—one briefly lands on Pooh's nose but doesn't try to sting him—Disney turns the scene into an aerial battle.[18] The bees malevolently laugh at Pooh, frantically chase him, and even cause the balloon he's holding onto to deflate.[19] The result is that instead of gently floating down from the sky as he does in Milne's text, Pooh suddenly plummets to the ground and into Christopher Robin's arms.[20] As such, Disney exaggerates the vulnerable situation Pooh finds himself in.

In fact, the scene becomes so overwhelming that some might even argue that it incorporates the zany—an aesthetic category that features an entity overwhelmed by frantic activity often associated with manual labor.[21] However, because viewers remain emotionally connected with Pooh and share Christopher Robin's desire to save him (the zany aesthetic promotes emotional distance between spectator and audience), the scene favors the cute aesthetic.[22] Analysis of this scene, therefore, demonstrates how Disney amplifies Pooh's vulnerability by exaggerating the precarious situations he's placed in.

Having analyzed two ways Disney amplifies the cute aesthetic of Milne's Winnie the Pooh, one can't help but wonder to what end such amplification takes place. What purpose does making Pooh, a character that already exemplifies the cute aesthetic, even cuter serve? Given the cute aesthetic's deep-seated relationship with commercial culture, the answer may lie in the fact that the cuter a product is the more likely it is to sell.[23] Disney's exaggeratedly cute Winnie the Pooh is soft and cuddly and because he consistently ends up in precarious situations, he is also in need of a protector. As Ngai explains, "cuteness solicits a regard of the commodity as an anthropomorphic being less powerful than the aesthetic subject, appealing specifically to us for protection and care."[24] In other

18 Milne, "Winnie-the-Pooh," 16.
19 *The Many Adventures of Winnie the Pooh*, 1977.
20 Milne, "Winnie-the-Pooh," 17; *The Many Adventures of Winnie the Pooh*, 1977.
21 Ngai, *Our Aesthetic Categories*, 7.
22 Ibid., 8.
23 Ibid., 59.
24 Ibid., 60.

words, cute objects make consumers feel like the cute object not only wants them but needs them.[25] The result is that commodities, like Disney merchandise, that are divorced from consumers (they're made by strangers often halfway around the world and sold by an impersonal corporation) become personal. Whether or not it's fair to accuse the Disney corporation of allowing consumerist culture to dictate their art, though, is questionable. Nonetheless, as Disney continues to dominate the media industry and the line between art and commodity is increasingly blurred, it remains an important topic to address.

By analyzing how Disney amplifies the cute aesthetic of Winnie the Pooh, one gains a better understanding of not only what the cute aesthetic is, but how corporations such as Disney manipulate it. Whether or not Disney's changes to Milne's source texts are for better or worse is debatable as Milne's texts and Disney's now series of *Winnie the Pooh* films fail to exist in vacuums separate from one another. The two respective series inform one another with readers and viewers often coming to each source with preconceived notions of who Winnie the Pooh is and what each story is about. That said, it seems fairer not to pass judgement about which series is better, but rather to amicably recognize their own strengths and differences.

25 Ibid., 64.

[feature articles]

"Say It Loud": The Song That Backed the Civil Rights Movement

Song Review

[Sarah Coffman]

Released in August of 1968, in the middle of the modern Civil Rights Movement, "Say It Loud – I'm Black and I'm Proud" by James Brown became an anthem voicing black frustration with unchanging socioeconomic inequality in the United States. It came at a time when the American government had passed legislative reform that struck down segregation, but the law was not put into practice. In the song, Brown called for a continuation of the fight for equality and challenged his black listeners to take pride in African American persistence and resilience in a country where they had never been seen as equals by the white majority. I aim to reflect upon the historical context of the years up to "Say It Loud's" release, consider what this says about Brown as an artist, and how his audience received the song's message.

In the years prior to "Say It Loud's" release, the Civil Rights Movement had mostly taken a pacifistic approach to protesting segregation. Peaceful demonstrations such as the Montgomery bus boycott, which lasted from 1955 and 1956; the sit-ins in the South in the 1960s; the 1963 March on Washington; and the march from Selma to Montgomery in 1964 were effective in showing African Americans' desire to see social change, and the passing of both the Civil Rights Act of 1964 and the Voting Rights Act of 1965 suggested that their protest efforts were effective.[1] While these two acts ensured African Americans equal protection under the law, the government did not establish the means of enforcement for the new policies; the lack of enforcement was especially evident in unequal housing opportunities, inadequate schooling, and social discrimination.[2] Thus, even after the government enacted legislation that was supposed to protect their fundamental rights as American citizens, black people still could not enjoy the same rights as their white counterparts. As a result, Brown addressed grievances with the vast inequality between white and

1 Courtney Joseph, HIST 228 Lecture 01.1, September 4, 2018.
2 Ibid.

black Americans in his song.

Until the release of "Say It Loud," James Brown was not involved with the modern Civil Rights Movement. Before the song's 1968 release, James Brown was one of America's favorite black artists, famous for fun, rhythmic hits like "Papa's Got a Brand New Bag" and "I Got You." This demonstrates that Brown felt compelled to take a pro-civil rights stance as a prominent black figure, and once Brown established himself as a combative black rights activist through the creation of "Say It Loud," he maintained this stance for the rest of his life and career.[3] As both white and black Americans liked his music, he risked losing some of his white audience by releasing a song about black empowerment. Brown explained in his 1986 biography that he did not regret taking the risk: "People called 'Black and Proud' militant and angry...The song cost me a lot of my crossover audience. The racial makeup at my concerts was mostly black after that. I don't regret recording it, though, even if it was misunderstood. It was badly needed at the time."[4] It becomes clear that Brown had placed a priority on conveying his message of black solidarity rather than how he was perceived by his white audience.[5]

While some members of the white community reacted angrily to "Say It Loud" and stopped attending Brown's shows, the song made waves within the black community. In 1967, white people tended to call African Americans "Negroes" or "colored people," not black people.[6] Yet, by the end of the 1960s, Brown had "put the phrase on everyone's lips."[7] Chuck D., leader of the rap group Public Enemy, reinforced this idea when he said, "'Say It Loud – I'm Black and I'm Proud' was a record that really convinced me to say I was black…James said you can say it loud: that being black is a great thing instead of something you have to apologize for."[8]

James Brown had a two-part message for African Americans

3 Alan Paul, "Behind the Scenes of James Brown's 'Say It Loud (I'm Black and I'm Proud)'...Yep, I Interviewed Him," last modified September 28, 2013, http://alanpaul.net/2012/04/behind-the-scenes-of-james-browns-say-it-loud-im-black-and-im-proud-yep-i-interviewed-him/.

4 James Brown and Bruce Tucker, *James Brown: The Godfather of Soul* (London: Sidgwick & Jackson, 1986), 200.

5 Considering that Martin Luther King Jr. was assassinated in 1968, it can be interpreted that James Brown created "Say It Loud" to maintain the pace of the Civil Rights Movement and motivate activists to keep going, despite the assassination of a profound and peaceful leader. When Martin Luther King Jr. became a martyr of the movement on April 4, 1968, many protests erupted and many activists lost hope. However, "Say It Loud" became a rallying point for many black people.

6 Mike Vago, "James Brown Said it Loud and Inspired a Generation in Less Than Three Minutes," last modified March 18, 2014, https://music.avclub.com/james-brown-said-it-loud-and-inspired-a-generation-in-l-1798267026.

7 Ibid.

8 Vago, "James Brown Said it Loud."

listening to "Say It Loud." First, that black people needed to keep fighting against racial injustice, as he, like many others, had grown tired of being seen as a second-class citizen. This idea was brought to light when Brown sang: "We're tired of beating our head against the wall."[9] In my own interpretation, Brown's phrase "beating our head against the wall" alludes to tactics used by African Americans to attract the attention of white people so that they could express their discontent with the system, including public demonstrations. Over time, beating their heads against the wall becomes tiring, because white people should be able to recognize the strife of their fellow man. Black people are, simply put, *people*, and deserve rights like any other citizens. The rest of the verse, "We'd rather die on our feet/ Than be living on our knees" implied that black people would rather endure violent retaliation against their protests than remain inferior to the white majority in their own country; therefore, they would keep fighting against both injustice and ignorant racism.[10]

Brown's second message—expressed in the title—is that blackness and pride are synonymous. Black youth were the most susceptible to feeling embarrassed by or ashamed of their racial identity. The polarizing effects of racial segregation for young children became apparent in Kenneth and Mamie Clark's "Clark Doll Experiment" of the early 1940s.[11] During the experiment, black children sat down at a table with two baby dolls: a white doll and a black doll. The Clarks asked children to identify which of the dolls was a "good doll," and which doll they would rather play with. The results revealed an overall preference for the white doll, which further exposed that young black children internalized biases and racism, since they perceived dolls—objects intended for fun and play—as inferior if the doll had dark skin.[12] Brown was aware of how segregation impacted young black children, and the main message of the song was focused on fostering black racial pride for the youth. As he stated in a 1999 interview, Brown purposefully used the voices of children in the call-and-response refrain of the song so "young black kids [could] wake up and realize that they should be proud of who they were…and try to make something of themselves."[13] Brown saw identity as central to a person's sense of self-worth, so it was critical that black children knew that their race was a point of pride rather than shame.

The message of James Brown's song "Say It Loud – I'm Black

9 "James Brown – Say It Loud: I'm Black and I'm Proud Lyrics," accessed September 12, 2018, https://genius.com/James-brown-say-it-loud-im-black-and-im-proud-lyrics.

10 Ibid.

11 "NAACP Legal Defense Fund: Defend, Educate, Empower," accessed September 12, 2018, http://www.naacpldf.org/brown-at-60-the-doll-test.

12 Ibid.

13 Paul, "Behind the Scenes."

and I'm Proud" remains relevant in twenty-first-century America, as the black population faces the issues of police brutality, inferior schooling, an achievement gap, a pay gap, and racism in the form of microaggressions or outright bigotry like job and hiring discrimination. Considering that these are just a few of the issues that African Americans are up against in post-racism America, it is critical that black people continue to embrace the messages of James Brown's song. Hip hop lyrics, since the creation of the genre in the early 1970s, often contains themes of black identity and experience with inequality in the United States. From the influence that "Say It Loud" has had on both civil rights and music, it becomes clear that black pride, power, and solidarity were as essential during the civil rights era as they are today.

A Musical Analysis of Milk

Movie Review

[Alexis Heredia]

Milk is an inspirational biopic about the life of gay activist Harvey Milk in the 1970s. Brimming with talented actors, this film serves to revive Milk's legacy in a world that was beginning to forget how much of an impact he made as an individual for the LGBTQ+ community. Released in 2008, this film is still relevant today as it serves as an influence to younger generations, suggesting that they step up and fight for what is right. Interviewed by *The Washington Post* feature reporter Ellen McCarthy about the film, activist and friend, Cleve Jones reflects upon his time with Milk: "'In most regards he was an ordinary person. I think there's a great lesson for us... to see an ordinary man who did, in fact, change the world.'"[1] McCarthy's quote here serves as a testimony to the legacy he left behind and the hope he gave to all. *Milk* effectively leaves an emotional mark on its audience through the use of instrumental score. The film draws on this musical element to elevate the viewer's experience and guide their emotional journey from start to finish.

Many factors, such as editing, directors, sound design, cinematography, etc., go into making a movie soar toward success and, in that regard, composers hold much more power in one's movie-going experience than people recognize. More often than not, audience members take for granted the musical score that plays in the background of a film, never really thinking about how it can drastically affect the mood. The score of a film is non-diegetic sound, which is what the audience can hear on screen that is outside the story's world. When exhibited effectively, it enhances both the film and its message to leave an emotional impact on viewers. Danny Elfman, the composer of *Milk*, does an incredible job

1 Ellen McCarthy, "Cleve Jones Discusses 'Milk,' a Film About Activist Harvey Milk." *The Washington Post*, November 21, 2008, http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2008/11/20/AR2008112001079_2.html??noredirect=on&sid=ST2008112002048.

of setting a variety of moods throughout the narrative. For instance, at the beginning when Harvey and his boyfriend at the time, Scott, open up the camera store "Castro Camera" (the Castro in San Francisco, CA is known for being one of the first gay neighborhoods of the United States), Elfman's score is filled with hopeful, brisk, staccato strings paired with a choral element of uplifting, high voices. This track, "The Kiss," both optimistically speaks to how much Harvey envisioned for his life with Scott as it also lets the viewer know that they are settling in for a rollercoaster of events to come.

An example of placing the audience in an intensely emotional state is when riots begin to ensue in the streets of the Castro because of the repeal of the gay rights ordinance, a law which would make it legal for employers to fire employees who are gay. Harvey is brought down from his apartment to the streets to help. Once Harvey is outside, the camera turns to direct the audience's attention towards Scott's reflection in the glass inside their store window. The track "Politics is Theater" hums as the camera lingers on Scott, who is alone in the shop as he stared at Harvey, saddened and a bit disappointed. He feels abandoned by Harvey, as he picks politics by running for office a fourth time, instead of choosing him. Reflecting on Scott's mood, the score here is somber and uneasy, which indicates this as an important scene in the film. Like "The Kiss" it relies on strings. However, this time it is much slower and takes on a darker tone. The song sticks to lower pitches, or lower notes; the previous upbeat mood that is portrayed earlier is destroyed by Scott's feelings of betrayal. This parallel to "The Kiss" is interesting as that track plays when Scott and Harvey first arrive at the Castro while "Politics is Theater" plays as their relationship begins to crumble.

Much later in the film, the suicide scene of Jack, Harvey's lover in the latter half of the film, occurs and Harvey walks up the apartment stairs with post-it notes blaming him for what he is about to see. During my personal experience watching this film, I immediately got very nervous for Harvey as he cautiously made his way through the apartment, warily repeating Jack's name. As he finally approaches the bathroom curtain that is hiding Jack's body, there is a final note that says, "You always loved the circus Harvey. How do you like my last act?"[2] It is hung up with one of Harvey's election pins which is a final touch to Jack's blame on Harvey for focusing so heavily on his political career and not him. The score pauses for what seems like forever when Harvey pulls back the curtain and discovers Jack's body, making the audience desperate to fill the unbearable silence. This emotionally tormenting scene plays the track called "Weepy Donuts" with a focus on a subtle acoustic guitar solo and strings hauntingly echoing in the background. There are some distinct moments of dissonance—clashing

2 Gus Van Sant, dir. *Milk*. 2008; Universal City, CA: Focus Features, 2010. DVD.

notes, which intensify the unnerving scene. There are also many instances of legato, or long, drawn-out notes, for the strings that build up the viewer's anticipation for what the next note will be, or in relation to the movie, the audience finally discovering Jack's fate. The guitar then comes in and takes over the focus of the track, placing the strings in the background as the scene comes to a devastating close.

Near the end of this film's emotional journey, archival footage of the Castro's residents holding a candlelit vigil for Harvey Milk and then-Mayor of San Francisco, George Moscone, after they were killed in City Hall is shown. This scene uses a powerful track by Elfman entitled "Give 'em Hope," a famous phrase by Harvey himself, which has sections that are similar to "Harvey's Theme 1" as it contains a leitmotif, or a repeated melody, from the latter track. Just as his theme is throughout the film, Harvey Milk was a symbol of hope not just to the people of the Castro and San Francisco, but to those across the nation, both young and old, who saw the chain reaction that his actions and bravery brought about. Having it repeated during this vigil, when it seems like hope is lost, is very moving because it is a cue to the viewer that slowly but surely things will get better and heal themselves. Though it will not be the same, life will progress, and hope will be restored.

Through his political activism, Harvey Milk became a symbol of hope to the gay community across the country. The enormous, widespread impact that he had on the world is immeasurable. He helped the gay community gain civil rights, created representation for the LGBTQ+ community in a public seat of office, spread awareness for the issues that the Castro community were affected by, and helped pass laws to protect gay people across the nation from the bigoted regulations that stood against them; the list goes on and on. Despite his struggles, Harvey found solace in hope for a "better tomorrow."[3] He shared that hope with the world making it a more loving and accepting place than when he was born. Danny Elfman's score beautifully transforms this film into a moving piece of art and underlines the activist's beliefs and hopes for the future. His narrative and musical journey move in tandem with one another as the events of Harvey's life drive this emotional journey. In Harvey Milk's simple yet wise words, "You gotta give 'em hope, you gotta give 'em hope."

3 Ibid.

What It Is Like Being a Senior in College

A Reflection

[Leah Farfan]

The time has finally come. I am a senior at Lake Forest College. I still remember freshman orientation, where I met my new friends and participated in exciting activities. Now, I walk around seeing freshmen experiencing their first semester as college students, exactly where I was three years ago. The past four years have flown by and it has officially hit me: I only have two semesters left of undergrad. Soon, I have to start applying for jobs and live like an adult. So, what is it like to be in my position right now? It is not easy; I have had sleepless nights, several cups of coffee just to keep my eyes open, and moments of trial and error. I may have, unfortunately, fallen under the spell of "senioritis"—a lack of motivation and the urge to graduate—but despite these inevitable obstacles, I want to share my college experience and what it is like to be a senior in college.

When I started my freshman year, I had no idea what I wanted to study, and I think that's a good thing. I came into college undecided, ready to explore the different classes and areas of study that were offered. I was already enrolled in my first-year studies class, so I needed to determine my other classes. I had an idea of what I was interested in, yet I was intimidated by the other freshman students who already declared their majors. Even now, as I study Communication and Sociology and Anthropology, I still haven't figured out what I want to do. While I have found my interests in advertising and marketing, I am still exploring my options in the Communication and Sociology and Anthropology career paths. Ultimately, I learned that I don't have to rush into figuring out what I want to do for the rest of my life. From talking to friends and professors and connecting with upperclassmen, I have been able to expand my knowledge on the opportunities that are available to me.

Currently, my support system consists of the great friends I have met from my four years of college. I struggled freshman and sophomore year getting to know people due to my quiet personality. Additionally, being a commuter did not help much. I commuted by train, so I had to arrive and leave at a scheduled time every day. However, I drive to school now and

this has greatly impacted my social life. I have become more independent and I have much more flexibility in my schedule. Of course, I may be missing out on the full “college experience” by not living on campus, but I have learned how to better manage my time while commuting and being involved off-campus. It is relieving to have the support of my friends and making connections through them. In addition to friends, I also have support from my professors. In fact, if there is one valuable lesson I would share with others in my position, it would be to take advantage of professors’ office hours. In getting to know my professors, they have helped to guide me through class assignments while also sharing their valuable wisdom and advice. I’ve learned that it’s important to grow a relationship with your professor and let them get to know you as both a student and a person.

Ultimately, being a senior in college is stressful, yet extremely rewarding. I have experienced the ups-and-downs of being a senior and I have amazing memories to reflect on. I am grateful for the friendships I have made and the classes I have taken that continue to remind me to be open-minded and become a better version of myself. Despite the stress, I can’t wait to attend more school events, hang out with friends, and learn as much as I can before graduation. When I walk across the stage and receive my degree, I know I will be ready to see where the next chapter of my life takes me. Whether you are a freshman, sophomore, or junior, get involved, communicate with your professors, and spend time with your friends. The remaining semesters of your college career are crucial, so value the moments you have left because everything will be worth it in the end.

Ancient Governmental Concepts of China:

Confucianism Versus Legalism

[Aaron O'Neill]

Almost everyone has an idea of what government should do or how it should be structured. The difference between Joe's water cooler critique of a bill that was just passed by Congress and a full-fledged political philosophy like Confucianism or Legalism is that the latter has the means to put their theory into effect. These two philosophies present very different ideas of the correct way to govern a society; however, they both have had significant influence on China's political anatomy. The two schools of thought are very detailed and encompass much more than just political structure, but for the purposes of this paper, I will strictly focus on what these two philosophies recommend in terms of an ideal government, specifically how they differ in style. Confucianism is more fluid and encourages respectful interaction, while Legalism is more rigid and implements deterrence policies.

Confucianism is a concept based in virtue and humaneness and suggests that if a ruler demonstrates loyalty and righteousness towards his followers, these characteristics will be reciprocated. The Analects, one of Confucianism's sacred texts, argues that, "One who governs through virtue may be compared to the polestar, which occupies its place while the host of other stars pay homage to it."[1] Here, Confucianism indicates that if a ruler governs virtuously, his followers will respect and remain loyal to him. In addition, the advice is directed specifically toward the ruler. A majority of Confucian teachings regarding government suggest that it is necessary for the ruler to set an example of virtue and humaneness. The ruler's example is critical for the success of Confucian government. The Analects also recommends that rulers avoid the application of punishments and guidelines. The text asserts: "Lead them by means of regulations and keep order among them through punishments, and the people will evade them and will lack any sense of shame. Lead them

1 "The Analects," in *The Chinese Tradition in Antiquity*, ed. William. Theodore de Bary (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999), 46.

through moral force and keep order among them through rites, and they will have a sense of shame and will also correct themselves."[2] This aspect of Confucian philosophy emphasizes that governing through rules and consequences is detrimental to society because people will bypass these laws and avoid punishment. Instead, if one governed through virtue, rules would not be necessary because people would regulate their own behavior. This embodies the Confucian idea that people are naturally good, and therefore if you lead them with humaneness, they will behave loyally towards their ruler, and act morally towards each other.

In contrast, Legalist philosophy emphasizes a strong state government with strict rules and punishments. William Theodore de Bary's introduction to the Legalist text, *The Book of Lord Shang*, describes the foundations of Legalism: "Especially the need for strong and decisive leadership, state domination over the people, and reliance on strict laws, including generous rewards and harsh punishments rather than traditional fiduciary relations and family ethics."[3] Here, Theodore de Bary identifies the main pillars of Legalism's philosophy on government: strong state government, strict laws, generous rewards, and harsh punishments. Additionally, the state prided itself on the powerlessness of its people: "A weak people means a strong state and a strong state means a weak people."[4] In the Legalist view, the government must limit the influence of its people to be successful. Also, notice that this implies that it is the responsibility of a group to govern, while in the Confucian texts it indicated the responsibility rested with a single ruler. The Book of Lord Shang additionally describes how the government should administer discipline in order to maintain its dominance. It asserts, "In applying punishments, light offenses should be punished heavily; if light offenses do not appear, heavy offenses will not come."[5] Here Legalists indicate that if a small transgression is disciplined swiftly and harshly, people will not develop any interest in committing a larger infraction. Over time, in theory, the government will eradicate crime completely. This idea begins to reveal Legalists' opinion of the human psyche. Whereas Confucianists believed people were naturally good, Legalists believed humans were naturally evil, and must be subjected to rules and punishments to maintain discipline. The text additionally says that "kindness and humaneness are the mother of transgressions.[6] Thus, it is not possible to govern through empathy because people are naturally bad. Treating them empathetically only encourages them to commit offenses.

2 Ibid.

3 William Theodore De Bary, Introduction to "The Book of Shang," *The Chinese Tradition in Antiquity* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999), 193.

4 "The Book of Lord Shang," in *The Chinese Tradition in Antiquity*, ed. William Theodore De Bary (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999), 198.

5 Ibid., 197.

6 Ibid., 195.

The schools of Confucianism and Legalism shaped political philosophy in China during the time of antiquity. Despite their drastically different recommendations of what an ideal government should be, these two philosophies allow us to better understand how influential Chinese thinkers believed government should be structured. Perfect government does not exist, so individuals develop different philosophies as to what structure is most ideal. Whether you believe a virtuous and humane ruler is the correct option, or that the state should dominate over the people, your opinion has likely been influenced by an existing school of thought.

Portrait of a Place:

The Apostle Islands

[Kayla Goelz]

The Apostle Islands National Lakeshore is located along the beaches of Lake Superior in the Bayfield Peninsula region of northern Wisconsin. The islands were previously recognized only as a source of raw materials; however, the region currently exhibits millions of years of geological transformations, as well as hundreds of thriving plant and animal species. Additionally, the Apostle Islands are a source of Ojibwe culture that remains central to the region's history. The "Wild Archipelago" forms a chain that links the past to the present, as both the geography and the history of the land are a result of years of natural and cultural trends that have shaped the regional story.[1]

Known as some of the most pristine islands in all of the Great Lakes, the Apostle Islands are a group of 22 islands covering over 720 square miles of Lake Superior.[2] Millions of years ago, the advance and retreat of the Pleistocene era glaciers carved the islands out of sandstone.[3] This exposed the "beautiful white sand beaches, dramatic cliffs, sculpted shorelines, and water-worn caves."[4] Of the islands, Madeline Island is the largest, although each of the islands has a relatively similar geography: mostly low and flat, ranging in size from a few acres to over 13,000 acres.[5] This prehistoric work of nature has created an intricate network of cliffs, sea caves, and beach dunes that displays the glacial impact on the islands. Each island boasts a "rich forest mosaic," including areas of original growth that once covered the entire Great Lakes region.[6] The forests consist of

1 National Park Service, *Apostle Islands*, Washington, D.C.: U.S. Department of the Interior, 2006.

2 Gerry Volgenau, Islands: *Great Lakes Stories* (Ann Arbor: Ann Arbor Media Grou, 2005), 217.

3 Harold C. Jordahl and Annie L. Booth, *Environmental Politics and the Creation of a Dream Establishing the Apostle Islands National Lakeshore* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 2011), 11.

4 Ibid.

5 E. W. Beals and Grant Cottam, "The Forest Vegetation of the Apostle Islands, Wisconsin," *Ecology* 41, no. 4 (October 1960): 743–751. JSTOR.

6 James W. Feldman, *Storied Wilderness: Rewilding the Apostle Islands* (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2011), 4.

various hardwoods as well as white pine and spruce-fir.[7] Alongside this forest vegetation, the wildlife of the Apostle Islands includes black bears and whitetail deer, as well as various species of birds, including loons, bald eagles, and herring gulls.[8] Surrounding the islands is Lake Superior: the most dangerous of the Great Lakes.[9] The islands have been the site of many historical shipwrecks; however, the islands also feature the largest collection of lighthouses within the United States, providing guidance for ships navigating the lake. Existing in Lake Superior, the Apostle Islands consist of unique sandstone formations, while also fostering a pristine ecosystem for thriving wildlife.

As the Apostle Islands have an extensive geographical history, there are also economic histories tied to the region. American Indian inhabitants met with European settlers in the seventeenth century, who valued the Apostle Islands as a location for French fur trade.[10] By 1790, the islands had become the main trading center of the Lake Superior region. Yet, as fur became scarce, the islands entered an industrial age in the 1870s, becoming a source of lumber, fish, and stone.[11] The lumber industry was initially very successful in the Apostle Islands due to the variety of available tree species, specifically white pines. However, these prime timber species were depleted by the 1920s, and logging came to a halt with the establishment of the island's national park in the 1970s.[12] Similarly, the islands were a source of commercial fishing, mainly lake trout and whitefish, the primary commercial species of Lake Superior.[13] Unlike logging, fishing became part of the "fabric of community and family life" on the islands.[14] Fishing provided jobs for island residents, while also offering a source of food and recreation. Lastly, the Apostle Islands provided sandstone building material to growing cities like Milwaukee and Chicago

Photo via Apostle Island National Lakeshore, National Park Service. www.nps.gov/apis/index.html.

7 Jordahl and Booth, *Environmental Politics*, 12.
8 Ibid.
9 Volgenau, *Islands*, 218.
10 Jordahl and Booth, *Environmental Politics*, 14.
11 Ibid., 17.
12 National Park Service, *Apostle Islands*.
13 Jordahl and Booth, *Environmental Politics*, 18.
14 Ibid.

throughout the late-nineteenth century, especially after the Great Chicago Fire of 1871 created a need for more reliable—and less flammable—building materials.[15] This sandstone was extracted from quarries and almost exclusively exported to larger Great Lakes cities. Much like the fur and lumber industries, stone was also seen as an inexhaustible resource, until the quarrying ceased in the twentieth century. Historically, the Apostle Islands have provided economic benefits to people within the Great Lakes region through the depletion of their fur, lumber, fish, and stone.

The Apostle Islands also have a history rich with American Indian culture, including the stories of the Ojibwe Indians. The Ojibwe people came to live on Madeline Island around 1490, and it is estimated that up to 20,000 Ojibwe people lived on the island. They originally came to the islands after being pushed out by the western Sioux Indians and the southern Fox Indians. While the Apostle Islands served the Ojibwe well, severe winters led to a shortage of food. As a result, the Ojibwe medicine men advocated for cannibalism, specifically selecting female children as their victims. Thus, many tribe members became angry with the medicine men, and by 1610, all Ojibwe members had moved off of Madeline Island. However, they did not move away due to their anger towards the medicine men—there was a fear among tribe members that the children's spirits roamed among the islands at night. This caused such a fright throughout the Ojibwe people that "they refused to spend the night on Madeline Island for another two hundred years, unless they were protected by French or British guns."[16] While the Ojibwe fearfully moved off of Madeline Island, they still view the0 Apostle Islands as "a sacred site for its role in their migration to Wisconsin," further representing the importance of the islands to Ojibwe culture.[17] The Apostle Islands have been home to the Ojibwe people since they migrated to the islands across the Great Lakes, and they continue to live in this region as it is essential to their ancestral migration.

Today, the Apostle Islands are known as a source of rich cultural history, recreation, spiritual rejuvenation. The islands are no longer seen as a place for resource extraction; rather, they are valued exclusively as a place of wilderness. Likewise, the geography, history, and culture of the Apostle Islands are dependent on Lake Superior. The islands and their surrounding lake have been a means of transport, place of commerce, and above all, a source of life. As said by the National Park Service: "Cloaked in a mantle of regrown forests, the Apostle Islands resonate with

15 National Park Service, *Apostle Islands*.

16 Volgenau, *Islands*, 223.

17 Christina Robertson and Jennifer Westerman, *Working on Earth: Class and Environmental Justice* (Reno: University of Nevada Press, 2015), 34; Volgenau, *Islands*, 223.

human stories reaching back to time immemorial."[18] The dense forests and sandstone cliffs of the islands hold clear signs of geographic history; however, beyond that, the Apostle Islands hold centuries of Great Lakes culture that is central to life in the region today.

18 National Park Service, *Apostle Islands*.

[contributors]

The Authors

Belinda Beaver ’22

“1963 or Today, Masters of Destruction Permeate Our Lives: A Critique of Bob Dylan’s ‘Masters of War’”

Belinda is a sophomore double majoring in communication and English with a writing emphasis and minoring in print and digital publishing. Belinda is the production assistant for *Inter-Text*, the vice president of administration for Student Programming Board, the vice president of administration for Delta Delta Delta, and the vice president for social programming for the Panhellenic Association. Her paper was written for COMM 255: Communication Criticism, taught by Dr. Elizabeth Benacka.

Kent Beckman ’20

“The Destruction of Slavery in the American Civil War”

Kent is a senior with a double major in history and finance. Kent was inducted into Phi Beta Kappa and is a senior RA. He is also the president of Intervarsity. He has served on the SAAC for the history department as treasurer and was on the Curricular Policies Committee. His paper was writtien for HIST 226: American Civil War, taught by Dr. Rudi Batzell.

Nina Dominique Codell ’20

“*Machinal* and *Society of the Spectacle*: Treadwell’s Reply to Society’s Spectacularizing of Human Tragedy”

Nina is a senior graduating this May with a double major in English literature and secondary education and a minor in theater. She was inducted into Phi Beta Kappa her senior year, has the Hixon scholarship for theater performance, and has had the privilege of peer teaching three courses in the English and theater departments. Her paper was written for ENG 450: Theory of Literature, taught by Dr. Robert Archambeau.

Emily Dietrich ’20

“‘Oh, Stuff and Fluff!’: Amplifying the Cute Aesthetic of Winnie the Pooh”

Emily is a senior year English literature major and cinema studies minor. She is a member of the national honor society Phi Beta Kappa and is a member of the English honor society Sigma Tau Delta. She is also involved in *Tusitala*, Lake Forest College’s literary arts publication. Her paper was written for Professor Archambeau’s senior seminar course ENGL 450: Theory of Literature.

Grace Drake ’21
“Eat, Drink, and Play Music”

Grace is a junior with a major in English literature and a minor in music. She is a violinist in the Lake Forest College Orchestra, and she is involved in the Sigma Tau Delta honors society. Additionally, she currently volunteers with Lake Forest Equestrian Connection, assisting disabled adults with music therapy. She has combined her passions for literature and music in her paper, which was written for MUSC 360: Music History I (From Chant to Bach), a music course taught by Dr. Don Meyer.

Krista Grund-Wickramasekera ’20
“You Do You, Boo: The Unsexy Truth about Sexual and Reproductive Justice”

Krista is a senior majoring in economics and politics with a minor in legal studies. She is an inductee of Phi Sigma Alpha and Omicron Delta Epsilon. Additionally, she has conducted research at Lake Forest College for Dr. Siobhan Moroney, has worked as a resident assistant for three years, has been a Chicago Ambassador and a student representative for the legal studies advisory committee, and has participated as a speaker at TedX Lake Forest College. She devoted a great deal of her time to Student Government, serving as senator for the Class of 2020, chairwoman of the Campus and Affairs Committee, and student representative for the College’s food service transition and College Council. She is also a member of the College’s Senior 25. Her paper was written for POLS 351: Justice and the Law, taught by Dr. Siobhan Moroney.

Anna Hevrdejs ’20
“Hussite Women: Fighting More Than the Crusaders”

Anna is a senior majoring in history and minoring in medieval and renaissance studies. She is an inducted member of Phi Beta Kappa and an active member of the Clio Society, *Inter-Text*, and the English department’s Dante reading group. She currently interns in the archives of the Chicago History Museum through the College’s Humanities 2020 partnership with the Andrew W. Mellon Foundation. Her paper was written for HIST 205: Medieval History, taught by Dr. Noah Blan.

Sofia Lyazkowska ’20
“Expanding Our Understandings of Knowledge(s): Plurality Beyond Coloniality”

Sofia is a senior with a double major in secondary education and

history and a minor in sociology and anthropology. She is also working toward a Master of Arts in Teaching degree through Lake Forest College. She is a member of Alpha Kappa Delta and the International Sociology Honor Society, and she has served as a peer teacher within the education department. Her paper was written for SOAN 343: Education in Developing Countries, an education and sociology course taught by the remarkable Dr. Desmond Odugu.

Alicia Maynard ’20

“Hatshepsut: The Powerful Female Pharaoh”

Alicia N. A. Maynard is a senior with a major in history, a minor in medieval and renaissance studies, and another minor in sociology and anthropology. She is a registered member of Phi Beta Kappa, Kappa Alpha Theta, and the College’s history club, Clio Society. She is also an editor for the Black Rap magazine and works in the Donnelley and Lee library as an archives assistant. In addition, she is a captain of the cheer squad. Her paper was written for SOAN 319: Archaeology of Race, Ethnicity, Class, and Gender, taught by Dr. Rebecca Graff.

Tam Nguyen ’20

“Making and Breaking a Heroine: Cultural Disparity in *Mulan*”

Tam is a senior with a major in biology and a minor in music. She is an inductee of Eukaryon and Beta Beta Beta, an RA on campus, the president of the College’s a cappella group The Inversions, and serves on the SAAC for the biology department. She is also an active member of the choral department. Tam has served as the director of outreach for Student Programming Board and the outreach manager for *Demos Political and Economic Journal*. Her paper was written for MUSC 267: Disney, Music, and Culture, taught by Dr. Scott Edgar.

Isaac Winter ’20

“‘Carve a Tunnel of Hope’: Exploring Dr. Martin Luther King Jr.’s Nonviolent Philosophy”

Isaac is a senior with a major in English literature and a minor in history. He is the co-president of Hillel and the current editorial head for *Tusitala*. Also, he has been involved in six shows with the Lake Forest College theater department as an actor, writer, and dramaturg. His paper was written for ENG 219: Malcolm and Martin, an English literature class taught by Dr. R.L. Watson.

The Editors

Michelle Angeles ’20

Michelle is a senior at Lake Forest College, graduating as a member of the Class of 2020. She is a double major in communication and French. She is also a member of Phi Sigma Iota, the honor society for foreign languages and literatures students and is also a representative for the Modern Language Student Academic Advisory Committee. For the past four years, she has worked at the Circulation Desk in the campus library, where she now serves as a student supervisor.

Gwennyth Baker ’22

Gwen is a communication major art history minor who is enjoying her first year as an *Inter-Text* editor. On campus, she also participates in the ambassadors program and works as a writing tutor. She is a current sophomore interested in client relations and PR, as well as the art sales industry.

Belinda Beaver ’22

Belinda is a sophomore double majoring in communication and English with a writing emphasis and minoring in print and digital publishing. Other than being the production assistant for *Inter-Text,* Belinda is also the vice president of administration for Student Programming Board, the vice president of administration for Delta Delta Delta, and the vice president for social programming for the Panhellenic Association.

Sarah Coffman ’21

Sarah is a junior studying history and African American studies. She is a recent inductee of Phi Beta Kappa and a Graduate School Exploration Fellow, which means she will complete research at a Big Ten university in the summer of 2020. Sarah is also currently managing *Inter-Text*, serving as a student advisory board member for the history and African American studies departments, and co-authoring two research articles with history professor Rudi Batzell on infanticide in Chicago from 1870-1920. She intends to pursue graduate studies in public history in hopes of preserving black heritage sites in Chicago.

Leah Farfan ’20

Leah Farfan is a senior at Lake Forest College who joined *Inter-Text* this year. She is a communication and sociology/anthropology

major interested in PR and marketing. She is inducted in Lambda Alpha Anthropology Honors Society.

Kayla Goelz '21

Kayla is secretary and editor of *Inter-Text* from Milwaukee, Wisconsin. She is currently a junior studying business with a specific interest in human resource management.

Alexis Heredia '22

Alexis Heredia is a sophomore from Wilmette, Illinois, majoring in digital media. After being a previously published author in the journal's second volume, she joined *Inter-Text* this year as an editor interested in the publishing process and what it takes to put it all together. She is currently working in the education and music departments.

Anna Hevrdejs '20

Anna is a senior from Lake Villa, Illinois, studying history and medieval and renaissance studies. She is a new member of *Inter-Text* this year and is an active member of the Clio Society, the English department's Dante reading group, and the College's concert choir. She is an inducted member of Phi Beta Kappa and currently interns in the archives of the Chicago History Museum through the College's Humanities 2020 Mellon Grant.

Emily Murrah '21

Emily is a Lake Forest College junior from Memphis, Tennessee, and is double-majoring in English literature and history. Outside of *Inter-Text*, Emily serves as a member of the Student Academic Advisory Council for the English department and has been editing a children's story in her free time.

Spencer Nassar '23

Aaron O'Neill '21

Aaron is a junior majoring in politics and economics and minoring in legal studies. He is a member of the men's hockey team, the Gummere Fellows program, and the Student Academic Advisory Committee for the economics department. Aaron plans to attend law school post-grad and pursue corporate/business law.

Emma Overton '22

Emma is a sophomore who is majoring in politics and environmental studies and minoring in legal studies. In addition to editing for *Inter-Text*, she is the editor-in-chief of the college's newspaper, *The Stentor*;

a Student Government senator for the Class of 2022, the president of the League for Environmental Awareness and Protection (LEAP), and a member of the Legal Studies Student Academic Advisory Committee. She is currently interning with State Representative Bob Morgan in Highwood, Illinois. Emma plans to attend law school and hopes to pursue a career as an environmental attorney while advocating for those living in underserved communities affected by pollution.

Rebecca Reitemeier ’20

Rebecca is a senior at Lake Forest College, graduating in 2020 with a major in English (writing concentration) and a minor in environmental studies. In addition to being a first-year editor for *Inter-Text*, she is a lead tutor at the Writing Center, a member of the League for Environmental Awareness and Protection (LEAP), a member of Sigma Tau Delta, and a member of the campus women’s choir.

Piero Sebastian Torres Marruffo ’23

Dr. Rudi Batzell

Inter-Text Faculty Advisor

Dr. Batzell is an Assistant Professor of History, teaching courses on the United States, global economic and social history, and the history of protest and policing. His research is on the history of inequality, state formation, and politics.

Acknowledgements

The third volume of *Inter-Text* would not have been possible without the incredible work of its student authors, editors, and Dr. Rudi Batzell, our faculty advisor. However, we would specifically like to thank Leslie Taylor in Visual Communications for helping us coordinate the printing of the Journal.

Additionally, the Journal would not be a reality without the exceptional effort of our editors. Because of the COVID-19 pandemic, we were unsure if we could finish the publication process and successfully print Volume 3. Yet, despite the challenges of online communication and remote work, the editors were motivated to continue with publication and produce this beautiful print journal. We are especially thankful that our editors were willing and able to complete whatever tasks necessary during such a hectic and frightening time.

Last, we are deeply grateful for the financial support of the Student Government Council and the following departments:

American Studies
Education
English
Ethics Center
History
Music
Politics
Psychology
Religion

We could not have done it without your support!